

# **Carmel in New York**

The Province of St. Elias, 1906 – 1926

Alfred Isacson, O.Carm.

Carmel in New York  
The Province of St Elias, 1906 – 1926  
Alfred Isacson, O.Carm.

Vestigium Press  
69-34 52<sup>nd</sup> Avenue  
Maspeth, New York 11378

## Table of Contents

Chapter I	New York Without Tears	Page 4
Chapter II	Southwell as Provincial	Page 15
Chapter III	Otisville and Middletown	Page 25
Chapter IV	Parish Life in Manhattan	Page 44
Chapter V	Odds and Ends of Daily Life	Page 58
Chapter VI	Through the Great War and into the 20's	Page 66
Chapter VII	The Irish Question	Page 80
Chapter VIII	St Simon Stock – The Commissariate	Page 101
Chapter IX	O'Farrell takes the Reins	Page 115
Chapter X	The Early Demise of O'Farrell	Page 130

## INTRODUCTION

This volume of the history of the New York Carmelite Province of Saint Elias covers the years 1906-26, beginning with the absence of Father Edward Southwell from the New York scene and ending with the accession of Father Dionysius L. Flanagan as superior of the Carmelites. During this time, parishes were established in Middletown and the Bronx and a house for training candidates to the order was opened.

The third and final volume is now in progress. It will cover the years from 1927 to 1947 during which the province was established with Father Flanagan as the first provincial. It will cover the provincialate of Father Kilian Lynch from his election in 1943 to his elevation as Prior General of the Order in 1947.

Many persons have contributed to the publication costs of this volume. Their names are appropriately noted and I wish to express my sincere gratitude to them for their assistance in bringing out this work. Without their aid, publication would probably have been further postponed.

Alfred Isacson, O. Carm.

Provincial House

Maspeth, NY

## CHAPTER I

### New York Without Tears

The Irish chapter of 1906 had seen the election of Stanislaus O'Reilly as provincial, the removal of Edward Southwell as prior and pastor of 28th Street and the installation of Louis McCabe as his successor. McCabe had been most recently at Terenure College and when he came to New York, he saw as his first responsibility the reduction of the large debt of the parish. Fairs and special collections were his means of doing this. The largest fair in the parish's history was held in November, 1906 and featured an official opening by Sir Thomas Lipton with whom McCabe had become acquainted.

Because of the presence of Sir Thomas Lipton, the 1906 fair was called the "Shamrock Fair," alluding to the name of the successive yachts he had constructed to vie for America's Cup. His latest venture at that point was Shamrock III. When he "opened" the fair, it was actually the closing night. He made much of the fact that shamrocks were the motif of the fair and spoke openly of the desire he had for winning America's Cup. Mayor Fitzgerald of Boston was present for that "opening" at the request of Lipton. Senator Thomas Grady was also present and spoke of the importance of remaining in school and receiving an education.

Accounts of the fair tell how McCabe had become acquainted with Lipton. They met while both were crossing the Atlantic to New York some years before. A woman passenger gave birth to her sixth child on the ship. While she and the children were a few days out of New York, word was received that her husband had died in Montana. McCabe started a subscription for her and got fellow passenger Lipton to head it. \$600 was taken up and in gratitude the woman named her child Thomas Lipton Cooper.

Lipton contributed \$1000 to the fair and purchased another \$1000 worth of chances. He used every chance he had at the fair to promote his attempt to win the Cup. Archbishop Farley and Bishop Cusack each contributed \$100. Mrs. Theodore Roosevelt, whose husband was born not too far below the East Side church, sent a picture of the White House to raffle off. Archbishop Palconio, the Apostolic Delegate, gave a painting of himself and Archbishop Ryan of Philadelphia gave a donation.

Besides the solicitation of these gifts from such notables, there was rather good publicity sent out to attract notice of this 1906 fair. The event was even noted in the Mercantile and Financial Times, a Wall Street business paper.<sup>1</sup>

While Southwell was the pastor, Joseph Louis McCabe was cited as being one of the thorns in his side so that it is understandable that once Southwell became provincial, McCabe would be removed. This took place in 1909 and explains the shortness of McCabe's term as pastor.<sup>2</sup>

The first problem confronting McCabe was the large debt and its payment. He resorted to fairs, special collections and gala fund raising events. July 22, 1906, he held a festival for the celebration of the patronal feast of the parish. Bishop Cusack presided and the Jesuit, O'Brien Pardow, preached. Though the chapter had concluded only a short time previously, McCabe was present for the July 22 celebration, a fast trip even for those days. All this was at the morning Mass. The evening had devotions, procession of the Blessed Sacrament with the parish societies and papal benediction. The collection taken up at this festival was the largest ever, \$1,300. The debt, at the time, was mentioned as being \$164,000.<sup>3</sup>

When a Euchre and Reception was held in September at the Murray Hill Lyceum, the debt of the schools alone was listed at \$165,000.<sup>4</sup> Though there was but one school building, the plural was frequently used because of the fact that besides the ordinary daytime Catholic grammar school, the building also housed the classes in religion for public school children as well as for those who were working.

McCabe was able to report to the people at the end of the year that \$12,000 had been taken off the debt in those first six months of his term.<sup>5</sup> At the end of the fair of 1907, he was able to report that the net was \$7,000 which presumably was applied to debt reduction.<sup>6</sup> That sum totaled \$10,000 in 1907.<sup>7</sup>

---

1. Parish Bulletin (Nov, 1906) 9-11 in Vestigium III, no 1, 22-32.

<sup>2</sup> Centenary Souvenir, Whitefriars Street, Dublin, ^?\_7; Analecta Ordinis Carmelitarum VI (1927-9) 17-4-6; Irish World (New York) Feb 12, 1927, 7 in Vestigium VI, no 1, 17-8.

<sup>3</sup> Parish Bulletin (Aug, 1906) 7 in Vestigium VI, no 1, 29.

<sup>4</sup> Sunday Union (New York) Sept 30, 1906, 1 in Vestigium VI, no 1, 29.

<sup>5</sup> Parish Bulletin (Dec, 1906) 7; (Jan, 1907) 9 in Vestigium VI, no 1, 30.

<sup>6</sup> Parish Bulletin (Nov, 1907) 6 in Vestigium VI, no 1, 31.

<sup>7</sup> Parish Bulletin (Jan, 1908) 10 in Vestigium VI, no 1, 31.

The fair of 1908 opened that October 15 and the debt, at that time, was listed as \$145,000. Pre-fair publicity mentioned the parish was one of the poorest in the city and stated there was an influx of a large number of non-Catholics into the area thus not improving to the conditions of the parish.<sup>8</sup> As a result of this fair and the other fund raising events of 1908, \$13,000 was taken from the debt that year.<sup>9</sup>

Accounts of the 1908 fair, which was opened by Monsignor Lavelle, mentioned the large number of dwellings in the parish that were lost to the expansion of Bellevue Hospital and the Pennsylvania Railroad tunnel under the East River. Senator Thomas Grady and other prominent persons of the time were present.<sup>10</sup> In an effort to promote attendance at the fair, the variety and value of the prizes was cited.<sup>11</sup>

Parish Reunions, fund raising shows guised under the cover of informal alumni gatherings, were held in April of each year at the Murray Hill Lyceum. They consisted of comedy acts, singing and dancing. All were crowded and a souvenir journal was an additional means of funds.<sup>12</sup>

Louis McCabe reorganized the Church and School Debt Paying Association in 1906. Its purpose was to reduce the debt of the parish which was, at that time, principally due to the parish school. Those who donated to the Association were entitled to the benefits of prayers and Masses offered for the members of the association. The names of contributors were published in the Parish Bulletin.<sup>13</sup>

The children seem to have had their own Mass in the Assembly Hall each Sunday at 9:00 A.M. and it would look as though there were Masses in the church each day at 6:00, 7:00, 8:00 and 9:00 A.M. except during the summer, the last daily Mass was omitted. Holy Week had the Tenebrae each evening, the three hours' services with admission by ticket only, the "Hallelujah Chorus" at Easter Sunday's Solemn High Mass and a collection on Easter take up by the fathers.<sup>14</sup>

---

<sup>8</sup> New York Freeman 's Journal (Oct 3, 1908) in Vestigium VI, no 1, 32.

<sup>9</sup> Parish Bulletin (Jan, 1909) 6 in Vestigium VI, no 1, 32.

<sup>10</sup> Catholic News (New York) Oct 10, Oct 17, 1908 in Vestigium III, no 1, 34-6.

<sup>11</sup> Parish Bulletin (Jan. 1909) 6 in Vestiaium III. no 1.

<sup>12</sup> "Carmelite Parish Reunions," Vestigium III, no 2, 15-6.

<sup>13</sup> Parish Bulletin (Aug, 1906) 9, (Oct, 1906) 9-10, (Mar, 1907) 10, (Jan, 1908) 11 in Vestigium III no 2, 23-4.

<sup>14</sup> Parish Bulletin (May, 1906), (Sept, 1906) 10, (Mar, 1910) 12 in Vestigium III, no 3, 18-9.

By March, 1907, there was no room for children at the 9:00 A.M. Mass on Sundays and parents were urged to send them to the special children's Mass in the Assembly Hall.<sup>15</sup>

Shortly afterwards, it was stated that 800 children attended the 8:00 A.M. Mass each day.<sup>16</sup> It is very possible that the Mass opened the school day and thus the students were required to be present. This was the custom in some places.

In 1908, Bishop Cusack was greeted by 500 children and adults when he came to the parish to confer the sacrament of confirmation. Most of the adults were converts, some as a result of a recently closed mission given by the Jesuits. The announcement also took notice of the Holy Week services mentioning that Felix McCaffrey had preached an eloquent sermon on the passion on Good Friday and the Boys' Choir would sing Easter Sunday's 11:00 o'clock High Mass. This music was later sung at the archdiocesan centenary.<sup>17</sup>

Michael Cardinal Logue, Archbishop of Armagh and Primate of All Ireland, was in the United States in 1908 for the celebration of the centennial of the establishment of the Archdiocese of New York. That May 10, a Sunday, Cardinal Logue presided over solemn vespers in the Carmelite Church. With admission by ticket only, the 1200 seats of the church were easily filled. Accounts state that 3,000 "clamored for admission in vain outside the church." The Carmelite community, local pastors, monsignori and Bishop Cusack were all there. In introducing the cardinal to the congregation, Louis McCabe cited the great honor that had come to the parish and the humility of the cardinal visiting so lowly and poor a parish. In exchange, the cardinal cited what a great honor it was to see the faith of the New York Catholics and the vigor of the church in America. Cardinal Logue gave his blessing to the congregation and celebrated benediction. Police formed a cordon around the block and maintained order with 200 men of the parish's Saint Joseph's Society. Many pressed to enter the priory where the cardinal was entertained after the church services. When he left at 11:00 P.M., the crowds "sent up a cheer that could be heard for blocks."<sup>18</sup>

Patrick Carr, a longtime supporter of Southwell's plans for separation of the American houses from Ireland, consulted a Father Himmel while he was at Kaiser Island in 1906. He advised Carr to join Southwell in the new foundation that Archbishop Parley had promised. Carr then told Southwell that the many councilors had brought confusion rather than wisdom. The previous letter from Southwell mentioned a foundation in Brooklyn but the most recent one cited the

---

<sup>15</sup> Parish Bulletin (Mar, 1907) 10 in Vestigium III, no 3, 22\*

<sup>16</sup> Parish Bulletin (May, 1907) 6 in Vestigium III, no 3, 22.,

<sup>17</sup> New York Freeman's Journal (Apr 18, 1908) in Vestigium III, no 3,

<sup>18</sup> Catholic News (New York) May 16, 1908 in Vestigium III, no 1, 32-4,



Farley offer. This confused Carr. He did recall to Southwell that the original plan was to separate from the Irish province, and be under the direct jurisdiction of the general in the manner of Merthyr Tydvil in Wales and have Southwell in charge and irremovable. In this way, only, could Southwell carry out Farley's goal of training young Americans as Carmelites.

There is not a mention of whether this separation would include the 28th Street parish or Tarrytown but presumably it would. Carr felt that his offer at the age of seventy-two to join Southwell might seem ridiculous but stated that his lack of personal ambitions would help the new work. Carr would not be upset if rejected by Southwell and felt that if the venture got off the ground, other Irish Carmelite houses, interested in the observance of the new constitutions, would join them.

New Baltimore was mentioned as the training ground for the American recruits and Carr suggested joining the American province pro forma so that this independent life from the Irish province could be carried on.

Finally, Carr suggested sending his letter on to the general.<sup>19</sup> This Southwell did.

In forwarding Carr's letter, Southwell attributed to Carr the pressure for a new house under the direct control of the general. Southwell mentioned that Carr wanted to join him in this venture but that he himself was waiting for the settlement of some problems in Australia so that the Irish "government" could not have the excuse of not having sufficient help to lend Southwell a hand.

Southwell told the general that he had been asked to settle this problem in Australia. From Southwell's treatment of the Australian problem in very vague terms, one gets the impression that he would create a commissariate there and a fortiori, also in the United States. He asked Mayer's advice concerning the offer of Farley and protested that he would not accept it without Mayer's approval. He suggested that Mayer discuss Australia with Donegan, the assistant general, but begged him to keep the American plans secret.<sup>20</sup>

The very next day, January 8, 1907, Southwell wrote Mayer again. Paul O'Dwyer he classed as chagrined at not being appointed to do the job in Australia that Southwell was chosen for. This was the post of pro-provincial. O'Dwyer did, however, warn Southwell that his old nemesis, O'Grady, would organize the opposition against him especially if he was not going to fight the Archbishop of Adelaide.

---

<sup>19</sup> Carr to Southwell, New York, Dec 28, 1906, CG, Hib (1906-21).

<sup>20</sup> Southwell to Mayer, Dublin, Jan 7, 1907, CG, Hib (1906-21).

Southwell went on to say he intended to ask the Irish province to accept a new American foundation. When he would ask for personnel, he would be told, as before, that there was no one. So Southwell mused he would then ask the general to take the foundation under his wing.

Southwell cemented his position by saying that New York's vicar general, Michael Lavelle, had told him before his departure that he doubted Parley would entrust Southwell with another parish as there was no guarantee of Southwell remaining in it. And he seemed to ask Mayer for such a position of irremovability.

Moving to the old technique of applying honey, he mentioned his surety that Mayer would want a house in New York or Brooklyn where the constitutions would be observed and "which would be the beginning of something healthy in America on the part of the Irish Fathers." Speculating somewhat, he thought that he could count on Carr for five or six years, Denis O'Connor had promised to join him, some would volunteer after a while and Ambrose Bruder would give him a priest or two for a while.

Then Southwell asks Mayer to advise him. If he took up the Australian mission and settled it quickly, as he felt a few thousand miles away that he could, then he might not be able to take care of the American business unless he returned to Ireland right after settling the Australian problem.

Southwell seemed fearful that if he went to Australia, it might be comparable to an exile and that it would mean the end of his American plans. So he asks Mayer to decide but more or less pleads between the lines, that Mayer tell him to go to New York and begin the new foundation.<sup>21</sup>

Just two days after his letter, Southwell wrote the general again. He had thought and talked to friends about the Australia venture. He had received two impressions from these consultations. One was that he was walking into a hornets' nest, the other that he was being kicked upstairs. He heard that some in Australia wanted to return to Ireland and he was afraid of O'Grady's influence. In the problems with the archbishop, Southwell felt that if he compromised, John Cogan would resign as prior of Adelaide and Southwell would have to take up that job with its attendant troubles and responsibilities. Southwell felt that, despite what the provincial, O'Reilly, had said, he would be going to Australia for the remainder of his term. He would be stuck there even though the work asked of him could be done in a short time by a visitation of the provincial himself.

Winding up his own irresolution, Southwell stated he became more confused the more he asked advice but would give an answer within the week. He asked Mayer to telegraph him if this letter

---

<sup>21</sup> Same to same, Dublin, Jan 8, 1907, CG, Hib (1906-21).

would change the advice Mayer would give by mail. Finally, he prayed to do God's will even though the definitory was against his plans for America.<sup>22</sup>

Southwell did his thinking and was able to write Mayer on January 24 that his decision had been to go to Australia if O'Grady was removed but Cogan had settled the problems with the archbishop and so Southwell told O'Reilly that since there was nothing in Australia requiring his talents, his going there would mean the forfeiture of a new foundation in New York or Brooklyn. O'Reilly, in response told Southwell his wish was "that I go there and obtain such a foundation and that he was prepared to give me all the men I should require naming one most desirable man." Southwell thought there was no need to have the house directly under the general but tried to secure his own future by telling Mayer that Farley in New York would probably ask to be free of the "changes of Dublin Chapters." So we see there the attempt to secure his future.

Still Southwell felt it necessary to review the separation idea. He told Mayer that New York and Tarry-town were financially valuable and that if he tried for separation, he would be viewed as a traitor. If he stayed in the province, he would get suitable men. Southwell revealed he would try to have his name placed among the trustees of the property in Tarrytown and New York so that he would have more clout. He would then be better able to rally men in the United States who disliked the laxity Southwell said existed in Ireland and would move with him for an independent American commissariate. He then tipped off Mayer that Donegan, the assistant general, was hand in glove with O'Reilly and exchange information.

So Southwell begged him to keep the American business from Donegan. He also promised to write Farley that very week.<sup>23</sup>

Whatever really happened with the plan to send Southwell to Australia, we do not know but that March 6, Hugh Devlin left Dublin for Australia to be the pro-pro-vincial.<sup>24</sup>

Early in 1907, Joseph Butler was on the team examining Dionysius Flanagan for the priesthood and Joachim Brennan and Dominic Hastings for the diaconate. This was on January 23 and later, on February 10, Butler participated in the exams of Hastings and Brennan again, this time for the priesthood.<sup>25</sup>

Louis McCabe was able that spring to write Mayer, the general, that when O'Reilly was there in visitation, he was very pleased with matters and the spirit of the house. McCabe mentioned he

---

<sup>22</sup> Same to same, Dublin, Jan 10, 19,07, CG, Hib (1906-21).

<sup>23</sup> Same to same, Dublin, Jan 24, 1907, CG, Hib (1906-21).

<sup>24</sup> Diary of Very Rev. Joseph Butler, O. Carm. , D.D., (1904-7) Mar 6, 1907, AIP.

<sup>25</sup> ibid, for dates cited.

had paid \$15,000 off on the 28th Street debt in the past ten months.<sup>26</sup> But all was not well, O'Reilly on his return had to write Driessen, the procurator general, that he investigated the Berthold Hart affair and that the prior in New York had already started punishment. Whatever Hart did, O'Reilly felt was not too bad and seemed to be telling Driessen not to worry.<sup>27</sup>

In 1907, Dominic Hastings was twenty-three years old when Stanislaus O'Reilly, the provincial, asked that the young man be given a dispensation from age for ordination. Hastings had been ill for some years and his Irish superiors wanted him ordained and sent to a fitting place for his health.<sup>28</sup>

When O'Reilly conducted a visitation of the Dublin House in 1907, it was revealed that the house was £3726 in debt.<sup>29</sup>

Edward Southwell, living in Dublin in 1907, was up to his old tricks. He wrote Mayer in Rome expressing his desire to know Mayer's location as he wanted to write "de statu rerum" but feared other officials at Rome opening the general's mail while he was away and thus learn what Southwell wrote. Southwell was careful to point out that he did not doubt the integrity of Mayer's officials but that he found it inconvenient making things known to anyone except Mayer. Southwell said his information was given him in secret and was confidential. He in turn would give this to Mayer with the same provisions attached so that Mayer could use it to obtain the same information in an official way and thereby act on it. In a postscript, he wondered if Mayer had received his letter on the Tarrytown scandal.<sup>30</sup> There is no record extant of any problems or troubles in Tarrytown at that date.

In September, 1907, Simon Farrington and Augustine Cosgrave, were deemed ready by O'Reilly to be sent to Rome. Both were subdeacons and in evaluating Farrington, O'Reilly mentioned that he had completed three years of philosophy in an extensive course with the Jesuits at Miltown Park. His professors held him in high opinion while Farrington concealed his talents under a cloak of the most genuine humility. Citing him as a good fellow, a perfect religious and as having read some theology, O'Reilly felt that with a three year theological course at a good

---

<sup>26</sup> McCabe to Mayer, New York, Apr 25, 1907, CG, Hib (1906-21).

<sup>27</sup> O'Reilly to Driessen, May 14, 1907, CG, Hib (1906-21).

<sup>28</sup> O'Reilly to Driessen, Dublin, May 29, 1907, CG, Hib (1906-21).

<sup>29</sup> Diary of Very Rev. Joseph Butler, O. Carm., D. D. (1904-7) May 29, 1907, AIP.

<sup>30</sup> Southwell to Mayer, Dublin, June 3, 1907, CG, Hib (1906-21).

school in Rome, Farrington would be for the province a professor, able and willing to teach the students.<sup>31</sup>

Within a short time of his arrival in Rome, Simon Farrington became ill and O'Reilly wanted him returned to Ireland as soon as he was well enough to travel. O'Reilly feared Farrington would want to remain in Rome until ordination and asked Mayer to dissuade him from this. He seems to have wanted him back in Ireland at any cost.<sup>32</sup>

In New York, McCabe continued to report spiritual and temporal success at the Carmelite parish. Sending 100 Masses to Mayer, McCabe poured forth a stream of pious drivel about the people increasing in their love of the Sacred Heart, Our Lady of Mount Carmel and the sacraments. Turning from an almost childish tone, he mentioned the debt had been cut \$15,000 in the past ten months. Turning again to piety, he was able to conclude "Your most obedient Child in Christ."<sup>33</sup> McCabe must have had poor knowledge of Mayer to think he would be pleased by such obvious fawning.

While Elias Magennis was O'Reilly's novice master and the novitiate located at Knocktopher, he strove to correct what he felt were defects in the training of the students. Of interest in this controversy, is Magennis' mention that even Christopher Slattery, a former professor of church history at Collegio San Alberto, was denied a vote on the acceptance of the novices for profession.<sup>34</sup>

At the general chapter of 1908, Edward Southwell was present as the Titular Provincial of Daciae, Richard Colfer as the socius of the Irish definitory and Elias Magennis as the Titular Provincial of Scotland. Magennis was elected the English speaking assistant general at this chapter, a post he would fulfill until his election as general in 1919.<sup>35</sup>

In 1908, Michael Grennan was at Ghent for the cure but O'Reilly had not paid his bills and fearful of being put out on the street, he wrote both Mayer and Magennis for help.<sup>36</sup>

---

<sup>31</sup> O'Reilly to Mayer, Dublin, Sept 23, 1907, CG, Hib (1906-21).

<sup>32</sup> Same to same, Hib (1906-21).

<sup>33</sup> McCabe to Mayer, New York, Feb 24, 1908, CG, H-ib (1906-21).

<sup>34</sup> Wheatley to Mayer, Moate, July 14, Aug 10, 1907, CG, Hib (1906-21); Magennis to O'Reilly and Mayer, Knocktopher, July 9, 1908, CG, Generali 2; O'Dwyer, A True Patriot (Dublin, 1975) 5-6; "Very Rev. Aloysius C. Slattery, O. Carm., " Vox Eliae (1953) 12.

<sup>35</sup> Acta Capituli Generalis, 1908 (Rome, 1908) 4, 8.

<sup>36</sup> Grennan to Mayer, Ghent, Nov 30, 1908; Grennan to McGuinness/sic7, Ghent, Nov 30, 1908, CG, Hib (1906-21).

Louis Nolan was removed in 1908 as prior of Terenure by O'Reilly for non-fulfillment of office and impeding of the subprior in fulfilling his office. Nolan drew up a petition, had it signed by seven others in the community and sent it to Pius Mayer.<sup>37</sup> Not even a reply is extant so the removal stood.

As 1908 drew to a close, Louis McCabe sent fifty Masses to the general with the good news that he had paid \$52,000 off the debt in the two and a half years he had been in New York.<sup>38</sup> Conveying what he thought was good news to the general, would do little to prevent McCabe's days in New York from being lengthened beyond the coming chapter.

1909 was a chapter year in the Irish province and the delegates gathered on May 10 in Dublin to open the august event that would reverse the mood established during the previous three years in New York and Tarrytown, Louis McCabe and Simon O'Byrne attended as the priors of New York and Tarrytown respectively. Simon Gavin attended as the socius of the New York convent and Edward Southwell, as the prior of the novitiate at Ardavon, also was present. Early in the chapter, Paul O'Dwyer objected to the presence of William Brennan among the delegates on the grounds that he had not finished his theological studies. There was much talk on the matter but by a vote of 14-12, it was established that Brennan had finished his studies and was entitled to be present.

Some of the debts were listed: Terenure £9455, Kildare £850 and New York £21,200. Curiously, Magannety is listed as "Procurator Conv. et Prioris Melbournensis."

On the first ballot, Edward Southwell was elected provincial, fourteen to twelve. The chapter decreed Richard Colfer did not have the privileged of an ex-provincial from his previous brief tenure as vicar provincial. A novitiate was also to open in Tarrytown and in Australia "quam primum fieri potest" provided permission be granted by the Holy See. Concerning the novitiate in Ireland, all that was stated was the general order "as we decided in previous chapters."

The chapter made Paul O'Dwyer the prior and pastor in New York with Dionysius Flanagan as his subprior. Denis O'Connor had the same post in Tarrytown. Louis Nolan was, surprisingly, appointed prior in Terenure.<sup>39</sup>

In the wake of the 1909 chapter, there arose a small problem at Whitefriars Street. Stanislaus Bartley had been elected the bursar of the house and there were such feelings about the election that Thomas Kelly and Michael O'Reilly wrote Mayer protesting its validity.<sup>40</sup>

---

<sup>37</sup> Nolan to Mayer, Moate, Dec 6, 1908, CG, Hib (1906-21).

<sup>38</sup> Nolan to Mayer, Moate, Dec 6, 1908, CG, Hib (1906-21).

<sup>39</sup> "Acta Capituli Provincialis," Dublin, May 10, 1909, CG, Hib,-Capit et Cong (1900-64); Analecta Ordinis Carmelitarum I (1909-10) 238.

It was in 1903 that Mother Butler had come to the United States and just four years later, she opened Marymount in Tarrytown. From the very beginning the Carmelites, down at the bottom of the hill Marymount commanded, were the chaplains and associated with the institution. The foundation date of the school is given as December 8, 1907, but it must have opened at the beginning of the school year in September and this probably was the dedication.<sup>41</sup>

That first Christmas Eve, the sisters, hoping to make an academy from the houses and land of the Reynard Estate, gathered in an improvised chapel where Simon O'Byrne celebrated their first Christmas Mass in Tarrytown.<sup>42</sup>

That first winter, O'Byrne and Southwell were able to make it up to the convent every day for Mass despite the fact that some days, the roads were too icy for horses or carriages.<sup>43</sup>

Besides caring for the Religious of the Sacred Heart of Mary, the Carmelites cared for the Sisters of Mercy who had transferred their Institution of Mercy to Tarrytown in 1894. They assisted them by being spiritual directors, chaplains and teachers over the years. After World War I, boys were replaced by girls at the sisters' child caring institution and in 1945, Cardinal Spellman asked the sisters to staff Mount Saint Michael Child-Caring Home on Staten Island and transfer the children there. At this time, the sisters opened Victory Academy using the facilities the children left.<sup>44</sup>

---

<sup>40</sup> Kelly and O'Reilly to Mayer, Dublin, Prid. Kalends Junii, 1909, CG, Hib (1906-21).

<sup>41</sup> Boylan to author, Tarrytown, Mar 22, 1978.

<sup>42</sup> Marymount, the Story of Fifty Years Tarrytown, 1957; Transfiguration Church, Tarrytown, New York (Hackensack, 1971) 9. This latter is almost verbatim from Parish of the Transfiguration 1897-1947, Golden Jubilee Tarrytown, 1947.

<sup>43</sup> Edward Coleman, "Notre Modele," Vox Eliae (1949) 24-5.

<sup>44</sup> Parish of the Transfiguration 1897-1947 Golden Jubilee, n.p.; Kieffer to author, Dobbs Ferry, Mar 20, 1978.

## CHAPTER II

### Southwell as Provincial

The 1909 chapter effected sweeping changes in the Irish province and these were not well received by all. Unfortunately, we have not records of the pre-capitular dealings in either New York or Ireland and without records of the politicking, it is very difficult to ascertain who brought about the changes and thus who was pleased with them. Obviously, Paul O'Dwyer, appointed to pastor and prior of New York, was not opposed to Southwell and probably was in some sort of coalition with him. O'Dwyer seems to have sped from Dublin to New York and assumed complete control as soon as possible.

Paul Patrick O'Dwyer had been born in Kilkenny in 1864 and thus was forty-five years old when he became the 28th Street pastor in 1909. He had spent some time in Australia and returned to Ireland in 1913. During his administration, he converted the parish hall on the site of the present priory, into a gymnasium. He also organized the Carmelite Athletic Association and the Alumni of the Carmelite School.<sup>45</sup>

O'Dwyer wrote Mayer, who seems to have been in the United States at the time, that he could do little or nothing until he had his "fixed community." Southwell had written three or four times but had said nothing about the community. He had even sent O'Dwyer two letters for Mayer but cancelled both of them by cable. William Brennan was to come to New York but was ill in Terenure and could not leave. Colfer was to go to Tarrytown but was consulting Rome about his position. Dunne, being sent to Moate, was very indignant. The man he was to replace, McDermott, was to go to Kildare. Felix McCaffrey was to go to Knocktopher and McCabe was coming to New York via the Invernia and Boston. He apparently was returning to New York to collect his belongings before returning to Ireland.

O'Dwyer felt that his men in New York were all right but because of the lack of manpower in the period of changeover, was doing duty in the hospital day and night.

Simon O'Byrne, removed from Tarrytown, had gone to Staten Island to stay with his brother. Mrs. Ashman, the hotel keeper and Carmelite friend, had conveyed to O'Dwyer the rumor that O'Byrne was going to secularize. O'Dwyer's comment to the general was "a good riddance." He also asked Mayer to preach at the high Mass on July 18 when the patronal feast of the parish would be celebrated. He pushed for a reply as he wanted to publish the name in the bulletin.

---

<sup>45</sup> "Members of the 28th Street Community," Vestigium VI, no 1, 34.



Telling him the light news that Dion Best and Anselm Werner had called in on their way back to Niagara Falls, he concluded with the news that "Our disappointed brethren are not so content." Among these he cited Power who had left for Australia and the young Devlin, Dominic, who had returned to Dublin.<sup>46</sup>

Shortly after the letter of the new 28th Street pastor to Mayer, one was sent him by Edward Southwell. He wanted to report the rather surprising news that all were doing well beyond Southwell's expectations. He mentioned that Richard Colfer was surprised at being sent to Tarrytown. Once he recovered from the flu at his brother's in Wexford, Southwell felt, he would be off to this new post. "J.J.D." - seemingly Joseph Dunne - moved out of Terenure in three days according to Southwell. Southwell mentioned how he had sent Felix McCaffrey and Carr to Knocktopher where Carr fought against being the prior but accepted when Southwell gave him an obedience to do so. The novices were being moved to Terenure and Southwell expected them and Megannety, the novice master, before July 16.

Then Southwell related to the general the more interesting of the current rumors. McCabe was living with his brother in England for a while. O'Byrne was about to skip, as he put it, and added that this was a great relief since he had left Tarrytown in a bad way. The details, Southwell stated, would be conveyed by Denis O'Connor. William Brennan was at his sister's in Kildare and when Southwell had tried to bring him to Dublin, he pleaded infirmity so he thought it prudent not to lay more censures on him. Apparently, Southwell had been forcing transfers through the use of his powers.

In regard to Whitefriars Street, Southwell was able to crow to the general that the place was getting into line. He allowed no liquor to anyone under sixty except once a day and then post prandium. There was none for any who had "broken down on this matter." Those above sixty, seemingly, had liquor before and after dinner and at 10:00 P.M. Southwell is confusing but this is what he states.

He related to the general how McCabe had asked to go to Tarrytown but Southwell turned him down on the grounds he was "a dude about town and beaches with lady friends." When Southwell told him to leave the United States, he felt McCabe's response was insolent. O'Reilly reacted in the same manner when Southwell corrected him for disobeying the drinking rules but the final response of O'Reilly was silence and total abstinence. Both, Southwell felt, were good.<sup>47</sup>

---

<sup>46</sup> O'Dwyer to Mayer, New York, June 24, 1909, CG, Hib (1906-21).

<sup>47</sup> Southwell to Mayer, Dublin, June 29, 1909, CG, Hib (1906-21).

One reaction of the chapter of 1909 can be seen in a letter of O'Byrne to Mayer, the general. Southwell had given O'Byrne permission to return to the United States after the chapter to "fix up my affairs." He also took a few weeks vacation which he had mentioned to Southwell. On his return to Tarrytown, he found a letter from Southwell ordering him to be out of New York within a week. O'Byrne protested that with his twenty-nine years of service, he would have been better treated if he was a servant.

O'Byrne felt Southwell was working out an old grudge against him. He related how Southwell had voted against his solemn profession twenty-five years previously and that in his eight and a half years at the New York parish, Southwell had tried to have him removed twice. Calling Southwell prejudiced, he said he was unfit to govern.

Taking the side of McCabe, O'Byrne mentioned how he had paid off \$65,000 in three years time and then as a reward was exiled to Australia. O'Byrne asked that he be allowed to join a diocese because of the changes in the rule and discipline since he joined the order and because of his inability to live in Dublin.

Pathetically, Mayer noted in his own hand at the end of the letter, "It is to be regretted that he did not obtain the dispensation. As for his service or devotion to the order, it is better that nothing is said."<sup>48</sup> Yet the man would persevere and die in 1930 with twenty-one more years of service to add to the twenty-nine he had when Mayer thought so little of him.

O'Byrne was not the scoundrel Southwell made him out to be. Southwell was not an estimator of men and depicted all worse than it was. Nothing could have been as bad as Southwell made it to be.<sup>49</sup>

In the aftermath of the chapter of 1909, there is an interesting sidelight. Pius Mayer had asked Charles Warren, cashier of the Lincoln National Bank in New York City, about putting his name or that of some other American as the owner of the order's property in Rome to prevent confiscation by the Italian government. Apparently, this referred to Collegio San Alberto.

Warren had asked Chauncey Depew, United States senator from New York, about the matter and Depew assured him and authorized him to say that the United States would protect the Carmelites' property in a confiscation attempt "as he put it - going so far, almost, as to the point of declaration of war."

Thomas L. James, president of the Lincoln National Bank, wrote all of this to Mayer and added that President Taft was "very tenderly inclined to the Catholic Church and knew he would do all

---

<sup>48</sup> O'Byrne to Mayer, West Brighton (N.Y.), July 7, 1909, CG, Hib (1906-21).

<sup>49</sup> Interview with Kilian Lynch, Tadcaster, Nov 15, 1976.

in his power to carry out any desire that you might have..." In proof of this, he went to cite Taft's settlement of the Priors' claims in the Philipphines, his journey to Rome and how he had closed this whole business to the satisfaction of the Holy Father and the United States government.

"Of course, in case you give the mortgage, as *I* understand it, you were to deposit the amount of it with this bank." Thus wrote James. So we see that there was also planned an exchange of money to establish American interest in Collegio San Alberto and bring about some protection against confiscation.<sup>50</sup>

The fall after his election as provincial, Edward Southwell intended to visit New York but was not able to make the trip. Less than a year after this planned visit, Southwell did come in June, 1910. While there, a special greeting and welcome was given him by the children of the Carmelite school he had built.<sup>51</sup>

Richard Colfer, appealed to the council of the order in Rome for his permanent vote in provincial chapters on the strength of the fact that he had been vicar provincial for a short period of time replacing Andrew Farrington. This was done in spite of the fact that the 1909 Irish chapter explicitly denied him this privilege. His appeal was denied though an informed observer, Elias Magennis, thought his papers were in fine condition. As Magennis put it, "Still he did not get his vote - no black eyes over it."<sup>52</sup>

That September 27, Southwell visited Terenure College, then the residence of the novices and other students of the province. He claimed to have found such serious abuses that he changed Peter Louis Nolan from prior there to the same position in Moate and John Cogan was moved from Moate to take the Terenure position. This was done with the consent of the definitory. It is curious that such serious matters should arise when Nolan was only appointed to Terenure at the chapter that spring.<sup>53</sup>

By the November after his election, Southwell felt he had matters in hand. He considered things as going slowly but good. He recited to the general a litany of bad guys with their current status. Louis McCabe was on his way to Australia as a punishment after being relieved as pastor in New York. He did not travel directly and took the leisure of returning to Ireland. O'Byrne he had not heard from but had sent him three warnings and Southwell felt he would have to be expelled.

---

<sup>50</sup> James to Mayer, New York, July 28, 1909, CG, Generali 1.

<sup>51</sup> Parish Bulletin (Oct, 1909) 12 in Vestigium VI, no 1, 35.

<sup>52</sup> Magennis to Mayer, Rome, Sept 4, 1909, CG, Generali 2.

<sup>53</sup> Relatio Semiannua Provinciae Hiberniae, 2do Semestre, 1909, CG, Hib, Historia, Statuta, Statistica, Rhod.

Southwell had given two warnings to William Brennan who was living at the time at his sister's. He was not drinking but had been involved in some kind of purchase in Knocktopher before the chapter. For some reason, this placed him under a cloud and Southwell thought he would send Brennan to any house that would keep him, so little did he think of the man. Andrew Maher had gone on such a rampage in New York that both O'Connor and O'Dwyer had asked for his removal. Southwell sent him to Mount Clement for two months and was expected back in Dublin the day after Southwell was writing. He, too, was given three warnings and Southwell was simply awaiting a penance from Mayer.

Finally, Southwell claimed the reason for changing Nolan from Terenure was his lack of attendance at community exercises. With Cogan there, Southwell felt he could call the place a "religious house."<sup>54</sup>

These actions of Southwell satisfied Mayer who prescribed a month's punishment for Maher. Southwell thought he would reduce this to two weeks if Maher was good and also sent him away on a retreat. O'Byrne, he was not so cocky about. He would check with O'Dwyer in New York to be sure O'Byrne had received the warnings. O'Byrne was living with his brother, a watchmaker on Staten Island. Mayer had told Southwell that Rome was very strict in cases of expulsion and Southwell feared, rather coldly, the order would never be rid of O'Byrne.

It seems as though Mayer had brought to Southwell's attention the fact that the debt at Tarrytown was rather high. Southwell seems not to have been aware of the total. He cited it to Mayer as being amazing particularly in view of the increased income. O'Connor, sent to Tarrytown just the proceeding June, had already paid off \$4,000 of the debt.

Southwell considered finances to be his biggest problem. The lack of money prevented the establishing of novitiates in both the United States and Australia. Paced with the payment of interest on £11,000, Southwell hoped to obtain help when he would go to the United States. So strained were the finances that Carr, at Knocktopher, had to borrow money. As always, Southwell was able to enclose £12 for 160 Masses.

As 1909 drew to a close, Southwell felt the burden of his personnel problems and his shaky finances. John Wheatley, writing to Mayer concerning the novitiate, added a p.s. to his note, "I think Fr. Southwell requires a rubbing up from you."<sup>55</sup>

When he arrived in New York to take over his appointment as pastor, Paul O'Dwyer discovered there were several wills of which McCabe was the executor and thus would be in for a share of the estates. Southwell looked to the general for assistance in this difficulty. He asked Mayer to

---

<sup>54</sup> Southwell to Mayer, Dublin, Nov 6, 1909, CG, Hib (1906-21).

<sup>55</sup> Wheatley to Mayer, Terenure, Dec 28, 1909, CG, General! 2.

place McCabe under obedience to assign his place in these wills to O'Dwyer and to betake himself to Australia which was his new assignment. We do not know if Mayer ever followed out Southwell's wishes but McCabe did begin to give up the money he received as executor of wills but reluctantly, claiming that this surrender was against civil and canon law.

Surprisingly, Southwell did not want to press McCabe too much in this matter of the wills. He felt he had done much for the finances of the parish.<sup>56</sup>

After the chapter that elected him, Southwell had some scruples. He wrote Mayer, "Some of the parties working for us practiced deception to obtain votes for some friends in some of the offices." Almost as a question, he told Mayer that he presumed all such irregularities were cleared by his absolution at the chapter.<sup>57</sup>

Paul Patrick O'Dwyer, writing to Mayer at the beginning of 1910 from 28th Street, was worried about the health of the general. He sent him fifty Masses and we wonder if there is any connection between these first two of his thoughts. He mentioned to Mayer that since his departure from New York - apparently Mayer had been there visiting briefly but unofficially - O'Dwyer had been busy with the fair. This went on despite poor health which had improved by the time of the letter writing. He had cleared a lot of the \$8,000 debt McCabe had left. McCabe had brought this about by putting all he could into the bank before the chapter for a good show. He even overestimated the proceeds of the fair by putting \$10,000 into the bulletin instead of the actual proceeds of \$8,500.

O'Dwyer complained to the general he was working with only four men and that this was too hard. He had been promised men by Southwell but none had arrived.

He added that Englewood Carmelites were over often and he was glad to see them. He also mentioned that Father Ambrose Bruder was still at large.

Getting down to small talk, O'Dwyer mentioned Simon O'Byrne was out west looking for a job. He relayed the information that Southwell had sent him a letter for O'Byrne which O'Dwyer had forwarded on to him but the letter had been returned. He added a parting shot by saying the debts had been great in Tarrytown.

In view of future events, it is interesting that O'Dwyer mentioned special greetings to Magennis in Rome.<sup>58</sup>

---

<sup>56</sup> O'Dwyer to Mayer, New York, n.d.; Southwell to Mayer, n.p., n.d., Hib (1906-21).

<sup>57</sup> Southwell to Mayer, n.p., n.d., CG, Hib (1906-21).

<sup>58</sup> O'Dwyer to Mayer, New York, Jan 24, 1910, CG, Hib (1906-21).

Megannety, at Terenure, knew Cogan was writing to the general and desired to be remembered to him.<sup>59</sup> Simon Gavin had been changed to Terenure where he was in Southwell's opinion doing "A-I" and teaching at the college.<sup>60</sup>

Early in March of 1910, Southwell was afflicted with a leg problem. He was in the hospital and when he wrote the general, he thought it good to relate that half of the sore was covered with new skin but he had to remain in bed part of the day.<sup>61</sup>

At the beginning of March, 1910, Southwell had heard rumors O'Byrne desired to return to the fold, as he put it. The rumors were easily taken care of, at least in Southwell's mind, for as he said of O'Byrne, "He is still in America - and I don't think it too hard to say he has acted the part of a scoundrel in his administration of Tarrytown. Should he communicate with me I shall refer him to you." And thus passed to Mayer another potential problem.<sup>62</sup>

In March, 1910, Berthold Keating had been professed almost one year. He had been a poor boy whom Francis Power had taken in hand and educated. Though he was somewhat inclined towards the Discalced Carmelites, he had entered the Ancient Observance. At this point he wanted to transfer to the Carthusians who were willing to accept him. Elias Magennis had been his advisor and Stanislaus Megannety his confessor. Southwell turned down his petition. After this refusal, Keating let it out that if he went to the Carthusians and did not make it with them, he would return to the Carmelites. Southwell told him this course would not be permissible. If he left, then there was no second chance with the Carmelites.

What Southwell had turned him down for was a trial with the Carthusians during which Keating's vows in the Carmelites would remain. For a second try, Keating intended to obtain a dispensation of his vows before entering the Carthusians.

After a second refusal, Megannety saw Southwell and interceded for Keating. So on the following day, March 9, Southwell wrote the general for advice. At the time of the petition of Megannety, Southwell told him to have Keating file his petition again and it would be reconsidered. Writing the general, Southwell was careful to bring out that Keating had appealed his refusal to Rome. Leaving the whole matter up to Mayer, he told the general he thought

---

<sup>59</sup> Cogan to Mayer, Terenure, Feb 7, 1910,CG, Hib (1906-21).

<sup>60</sup> Southwell to Mayer, Dublin, Mar 2, 1910, CG, Hib (1906-21).

<sup>61</sup> Same to same, Dublin, Mar 2, 1910, CG, Hib (1906-21).

<sup>62</sup> Same to same, Dublin, Mar 2, 1910, CG, Hib (1906-21).

Keating was taking the Carmelites for a ride. He did mention though that both Magennis and Megannety knew Keating better than he.<sup>63</sup>

Writing the general the very next day, Southwell said Keating felt the dispensation would surely come. Southwell was careful to tell the general he had pointed out to Keating that in the event his petition was granted, he could not leave until the feast of the Ascension as his prior was going to a chapter.<sup>64</sup> Unfortunately, there was

no chapter in 1910.

There is no record of how the appeal to Rome turned out but, in any case, Southwell granted Keating the required permission for one month.<sup>65</sup> As he himself put it, "Fr. Berthold Keating professed of our order obtained permission of the Holy See to enter the Carthusians, and left the house of studies with the Provincial's permission."<sup>66</sup>

Southwell tried to clear up what he thought were problems in New York and Tarrytown. O'Byrne, he told the general, was finally coming home via the Baltic leaving New York on March 19. Southwell stated he would make an example of him and also send him to the Trappist for three or four weeks.

Paul O'Dwyer obtained power of attorney from O'Byrne for the Elmsford property which was in O'Byrne's name. Denis O'Connor had reported to Southwell there was a rumor that O'Byrne had bought several houses in Tarrytown. Southwell assured the general he would get O'Byrne to make an affidavit on the Tarrytown money. His reason for this action was that the Tarrytown income was \$7,000 and O'Byrne left the place \$4,000 more in debt than when he took over. As Southwell put it, "He cooked accounts." He even went so far as to say that no one had robbed the order and the public like O'Byrne.

Here, I think, we can call into question the method of Southwell. He is proceeding in each instance on hearsay. He seems to be trying to arouse the general to indignation so that whatever Southwell does concerning O'Byrne will receive the blessing of Rome. There is and was no proof any of Southwell's charges were true. Had there been any evidence, it certainly would have been produced at least before the general if not before the New York chancery office.

---

<sup>63</sup> Same to same, Dublin, Mar 9, 1910, CG, Hib (1906-21).

<sup>64</sup> Same to same, Dublin, Mar 10, 1910, CG, Hib (1906-21).

<sup>65</sup> Same to same, Dublin, Mar 24, 1910, CG, Hib (1906-21).

<sup>66</sup> Relatio Semiannua Provinciae Hibemiae, Ino Semestre, 1910, CG, Hib, Historia, Statuta, Statistica, Rhodesia.

After this bad news, Southwell was able to tell Mayer that £10 was enclosed for eighty Masses and also asked him to begin 200 more with the promise the money would follow when Southwell did receive it from Peter Ward. As a proof of the inconstancy of Southwell, he adds to his letter several bits of news and then tells the general the money for the 200 Masses is enclosed.

The news he thought of such importance was that Bartley said the province was living within the budget and there was even a surplus of £1000 and this would be larger in the next financial period. He also asked Mayer his opinion on recalling Dowling and Grennan. Where each of them was is not determinable.<sup>67</sup>

In the middle of 1910, Simon Farrington saw fit to write Mayer, the general, concerning his status. After his ordination in 1909, Farrington said he was sent to Terenure College to study for his faculty exams but Southwell made him take a class so as a result, Farrington said to Southwell he might have to go to the United States without faculties. He had been sent to New York that May just past. Farrington said he was not prepared in moral theology but that Southwell had presented him to the bishop [sic] of New York for faculties. Farrington stated to the general that he knew no moral theology and was thus in great perplexity and resented his superiors telling bishops he was ready for hearing confessions when he felt himself that he was not. Finishing this letter of protest to the general, Simon said he had done two years at Miltown Park with the Jesuits and one year in Rome.

In a p.s., Farrington was able to state he was delicate in health and not able for the heavy work in 28th Street. As a parting shot to his general, he stated that the modus agendi of Southwell was "very injurious and absurd."<sup>68</sup>

Paul O'Dwyer wrote to Mayer as 1910 was drawing to a close. He told him how the parish had entertained Cardinal Vanutelli, how it was in O'Dwyer's opinion a splendid reception and how the cardinal was delighted. He was so bold as to declare it "a brilliant affair." He was able to send the general 120 Masses. He told him he may be able to help out a bit as he had a very successful fair. O'Dwyer said he was able to beat even the best record of McCabe and "I am not sorry for that." He was able to tell the general he paid off \$30,000 on the debt since coming to the parish.

After this good news, O'Dwyer told the general Southwell had been out in the United States for over six months and had been a source of trouble rather than a help during this time. O'Dwyer felt Southwell wanted him out of the 28th Street parish for his own reasons. O'Dwyer accused him of interfering with the business of the parish and of criticizing him to the community when he was not present. As a serious matter, O'Dwyer accused Southwell of interfering in a business

---

<sup>67</sup> Southwell to Mayer, Dublin, Mar 24, 1910, CG, Hib (1906-21).

<sup>68</sup> Farrington to Mayer, New York, June 16, 1910, CG, Hib (1906-21).



matter that cost the parish almost \$700. This he called a matter for the archbishop as parish funds were involved.

Getting to another area of jurisdiction, O'Dwyer told the general that almost 500 Masses had been neglected in Southwell's time. For these, Southwell left an order that they be said. Some, according to O'Dwyer, reached back nineteen years.

O'Dwyer told the general he was informing him of these things and thought he or somebody other than Southwell should make the next visitation so this matter could be settled and justice done.

O'Dwyer told the general he was inclined to reject Southwell's visitation but that if such were forced upon him, he would proceed differently. He said this remarking that he could not approach Southwell as provincial.

O'Dwyer was, however, able to wish the general happiness in the coming year.<sup>69</sup>

---

<sup>69</sup> O'Dwyer, to Mayer, New York, Dec 21, 1910, CG, Hib (1906-21).

## CHAPTER III

### Otisville and Middletown

In the fall of 1910, Pius Mayer had returned to Rome and was in good health. While he was absent, Edward Southwell kept the assistant general, Elias Magennis, informed of events within the Irish province. One of these was a "gift" from Archbishop Farley in the form of a new parish for the Carmelites. This was Otisville, among farms in the western area of Orange County. Southwell had to admit to the general it was not much of a gift but it was given because Farley felt the Carmelites would be able to do much good among the farmers. The loss to the Church among them was great probably because there were twenty-three non-Catholic churches within the Otisville area.

Connected with the Otisville parish was the sanitarium, owned and operated by New York City, for tubercular patients. There was an average of 200 Catholics there and the archbishop felt the city would give \$600 a year to the Carmelites for saying Mass. At that time, the patients had to travel to the Otisville church in both winter and summer. The priest lived in Wurtsboro, fourteen miles away, and had other mission stations in Bloomingburg, Bullville, and Pine Bush.

At this point, Southwell's letter becomes somewhat confused. He talks of the fact that Dionysius Flanagan was taking two Masses for this Wurtsboro parish each Sunday. With all the missions two priests were needed and one additional in the summer. Then he mentioned that Flanagan knew the finances of the place and it yielded \$3,000 a year but would bring much more under the Carmelites. In fact, he expected it to double and thought the place required almost no expense. Southwell saw the pastor, an elderly former French Assumptionist, as a problem. It seems that Southwell, while talking about the Otisville parish, had his eye on the whole complex with Wurtsboro as headquarters. He even mentioned his three men: Flanagan, Farrington and another to come from Ireland before the summer.

While discussing these grandiose plans with the general, Southwell threw in the fact that a parish was open in Mount Vernon. Apparently, he had an eye on that too.

Dionysius Flanagan was enthused about this venture. Southwell felt it might make a good site for a prep school or a novitiate. He had given up on Tarrytown as a novitiate site since it was too public and too near New York. As Southwell said, the men there in O'Byrne's time were always in the city or at the beaches. Along vocation lines, Southwell reported that he had a few boys studying with the Jesuits in New York. Speaking of education reminded Southwell that he had

to come up with some money for Terenure. Then he thought of the 1910 parish fair in 28th Street and McCaffrey preaching missions that coming Lent, a good source of income.

Southwell was so covetous and confused concerning the "gift" from Farley that he thought he would soon be signing a contract for the whole complex with Wurtsboro as the center. He felt one stipulation would be the relinquishing of any of the missions as they developed and were ready to become parishes. Southwell assured the general he would be cautious and seek his advice if necessary.

Southwell wrote all of this from Tarrytown where he was taking O'Connor's place so he could go off on a vacation. Previously, Southwell had done visitations there and in New York. He was able to report O'Connor had reduced the Tarrytown debt by \$11,000 and all of the office was recited except for the little hours and this because of the convent chaplaincies.

New York was not so easy nor pleasantly assessed. There was no office in choir, late hours were kept, only the prior's signature was required for checks and there was no separate account for the fathers. The prior, Paul O'Dwyer, had resisted all changes but Southwell would insist on them after the annual parish fair, then in progress, was completed.

O'Dwyer had asked to return O'Grady from Australia to be the treasurer at 28th Street and though the fathers, in Southwell's opinion, found O'Dwyer strict enough, he might have to make some concessions to keep things going smoothly and reduce the debt.<sup>70</sup>

Southwell had a view about the separate account for the Fathers. It was this. If anything happened - what was feared, we can only speculate - there would be great inconvenience to the Carmelites because their funds were not separate from those of the parish. The prior, in effect, acts as treasurer since he was also pastor. Southwell made statutes to correct this but he was inclined not to enforce these strictly until after the close of the fair. O'Dwyer, he characterized as not being disposed to obedience.<sup>71</sup>

What Southwell wrote Mayer about the Otisville-Wurtsboro situation was not well-received in Rome. Mayer had apparently written him with some objections to the signing of a contract and these seem to have been couched in the language of Roman curia. So Southwell wrote on December 10 to say he had seen a copy of the agreement and it was nothing more than what was required by Romanes Pontifices and the decrees of the councils of Baltimore. He assured Mayer there would be no question of taking away portions of the parish and any conditions were simply

---

<sup>70</sup> Southwell to Mayer, Tarrytown, Oct 25, 1910, CG, Hib (1906-21). Concerning the acquisition of Otisville, cf. V. McDonald, "New York Province is Diamond Jubilarian," Sword 24(June, 1964) 19; J. Ryan, "A Brief Outline of the History of the Province of St. Elias," Vox Eliae (1957)13.

<sup>71</sup> Relatio Semiannua Provinciae Hiberniae, 2do Semestre, 1910, CG, Hib, Historia, Statuta, Statistica, Rhodesia.

for fulfillment of Church law. That Southwell would so write seems to indicate he was under the impression the Carmelites were going to receive Wurtsboro which included Otisville. Otisville was apparently what the New York officials had in mind and the Carmelites in New York so understood the offer. Southwell was able to assure Mayer that the Franciscans and Augustinians had signed that type of agreement when receiving new parishes. Nothing bad had resulted.

Southwell's postponement of full enforcement of the visitation decrees on the New York prior, Paul O'Dwyer, was not well received. So he assured Mayer that he did lay down the regulations and hoped the prior would observe them. Southwell pointed out the principle matters were the prior alone signing the checks and the separation of the fathers' money from that of the parish. This unity of accounts Southwell called one of the worst features existing in the house since the only debts mentioned in the annual report to the chancery were those of the parish while \$40,000 to \$50,000 was due the Carmelites from unpaid salaries. Despite the largeness of the sum and the obvious gravity to the order, Southwell pleaded with Mayer not to take action as he meant to remedy the situation himself.

Money for the novitiate was another problem confronting Southwell. The definitory made a new and higher levy on the priories. Though some priors had to be compelled by obedience to send their assessments, the sum collected was expected to support sixteen to eighteen novices.

Southwell thought the main vocation problem was that of the postulants. He heard from all sides the cry that boys had to be taken in after grammar school and given a few years of "classics" with the Carmelites - presumably at Terenure. Because a dearth of priests were seen in the future, Southwell said the Carmelites, like other orders, were trying to gather as many postulants as possible. Very few of them were able to pay for their education and Southwell did not have the money readily available for this. He had only five or six postulants but hoped to add a few more soon. The goal was to have twenty to keep the novitiate at the present number. The work he was doing at the time, supplying in Tarrytown for O'Connor, would go to providing for these postulants. Southwell felt he would be adding on to the large debt of Terenure if he were to take in as many boys as the province required.

John Cogan was the prior of Terenure. According to Southwell, he would resign if he were not given the means to keep the place going and not descend further into debt. Should that happen, Cogan felt he would become a scapegoat like Colfer. So Southwell told the general that another means of supporting Terenure had to be sought besides contributions from the houses.

One means of seminary support was the giving of missions. Southwell pointed out to Mayer that in Ireland this produced only £4 or £5 per week per man. In the United States, he pointed out, it was different. In proof of this he told of how he had obtained a Sunday's collection at St. Bernard's, White Plains, as well as five weeks of missions during Lent. After Easter, he would look for further work. Southwell knew he must do things like these or give up the idea of

supporting the novitiate which he called the "only hope." He was making a case for himself being in the United States and on the road. For a superior such is sometimes a safe harbor in the midst of storms.

Having given all these reasons and citing the importance of his work, Southwell asked the favor of having Elias Magennis come to the United States for the months of March and April. This was for help with the missions. He knew Magennis would come as he valued the novitiate and there was no other way to keep it going. As a parting shot, he mentioned things would not be such if Terenure had not been found by his administration in the pitiful state it was.

Southwell's plans must have been to return soon to Ireland as he asked the general to reply to him there.<sup>72</sup>

Mayer was able to respond favorably to Southwell's request for Elias Magennis as a preacher of the parish missions. Southwell thanked him for this favor and assured the general the money earned from these missions would go to the education of students. He cited such a procedure as proof that he, Southwell, meant business in the education and training of the young students of the province.<sup>73</sup>

In 1908, Father Basset, pastor seemingly of Wurtsboro, outlined the problems facing him concerning the Otisville area. They are of interest because these difficulties obviously prompted some action by Archbishop Farley. Basset did not know how to secure the post of chaplain at the New York City Sanitarium for the local priest. He mentioned he was in charge of three churches and Bloomingburgh [sic]. He was also trying to build another church. At Otisville, he was offering Mass two times a month, that is, every other Sunday. If he was to take care of the sanitarium, then Otisville would have Mass only once a month and the people, he felt, would not be happy. He confessed, "I do not see how one priest can take care of so many churches."<sup>74</sup> Into this situation came the Carmelites.

Father Richard Brennan was appointed pastor of Saint Mary's Church in Port Jervis in 1862. His parish covered seventy square miles from Callicoon to Howells, New York. He selected Otisville as a site for a church and through Brennan's efforts a chapel was constructed and opened there in 1866. The parish was at times under the care of St. Joseph's, Middletown. When the Carmelites

---

<sup>72</sup> Southwell to Mayer, Tarrytown, Dec 6, 1910, CG, Hib (1906-21).

<sup>73</sup> Same to same, Dublin, Dec 24, 1910, CG, Generali 2.

<sup>74</sup> Basset to [?] n.p., Feb 24, 1908, DA, 1-14.

enter the picture, the parish was under the care of Wurtsboro but the land and buildings were still in the name of Saint Joseph's, Middletown.<sup>75</sup>

With the sanitarium for tubercular patients in the town, there was a need for resident clergy. The parish, the hospital and the two missions of Bloomingburg and Bullville were joined together to make a package demanding enough to occupy a number of Carmelites. Farley did indeed offer the Carmelites Otisville in 1910, in fact the offer may have been previous to this date. The intention was, when the Carmelites took over the Otisville parish, to build a residence. Archbishop Farley gave \$500 towards this project. It was never built and Flanagan boarded in a cottage near the church.<sup>76</sup> Using information obviously sent from the United States, the Analeeta Ordinis Carmelitarum, published in Rome, described the parish as being twenty-five by ten miles and containing three churches. "In a few months an ample and well-appointed convent will be built. In the future, it will be a second novitiate for the Irish province."<sup>77</sup> Soon after he arrived at the Otisville parish in 1910 as the first Carmelite pastor, Dionysius Flanagan built an open air dance pavilion behind the church and the facility was well-used during the warm weather. He also purchased a parcel of land in 1911 from a man named Leslie Wilbur.<sup>78</sup> Here Lyceum Hall to house parochial activities was built, Father Flanagan digging the foundation himself with the aid of a large scoop and a team of horses. He also planned a rectory on this site.<sup>79</sup>

In 1912, the church was legally transferred from St. Joseph's, Middletown to the parish under the title of the Church of the Holy Name of Jesus under which it had been incorporated in 1893.<sup>80</sup>

One problem did remain. In November, 1912, Richard Colfer was appointed pastor of the newly established parish of Our Lady of Mount Carmel in Middletown with Otisville, Bloomingburg and Bullville as missions. He found that the land purchased in Otisville for the site of Lyceum Hall remained in the names of Dionysius Flanagan and Felix McCaffrey. In telling the chancery office that they were going to transfer the property to the newly established church in

---

<sup>75</sup> Hail Holy Name! Otisville, New York, 1866-1966, 4-6; Brennan Diary, ANYP..

<sup>76</sup> Catholic News (New York) June 10, 1911 in Vestigium II, no 1, 6. Cf. Ryan, op. cit., for the 1910 statement; Flanagan.to- Daly, Williamstown, Feb 22, 1957, ANYP.

<sup>77</sup> Analecta Ordinis Carmelitarum // (1911-3) 254.

<sup>78</sup> Wilbur to Flanagan, July 11, 1911, Lib 525, p 599. This would indicate that Hail Holy Name, op. cit., 6 is wrong in giving the name of the seller as Charles Moore. Flanagan and McCaffrey transferred the land to Holy Name Church in 1913. Cf. Lib 539, p 349.

<sup>79</sup> Dionysius Flanagan so stated on a number of occasions,- Plans, ANYP.

<sup>80</sup> Church of St. Joseph to The Church of the Holy Name of Jesus, Apr 27, 1912, Lib 533, p 148. Incorporation was done on Oct 24, 1893 and registered Nov 9, 1893, CONY.

Middletown, Colfer mentioned the cost of the hall was \$4,350 and \$2,750 had yet to be paid on a mortgage for this.<sup>81</sup> The transfer of the property in Otisville was accomplished that July.<sup>82</sup>

After his visitation and before he left for Dublin in July, 1911, Southwell wrote the chancery office and Bishop Farley to inform them of his leaving the country and reminded them to secure from Rome the "licentia apostolica" for the Otisville house. Southwell prodded the chancery a bit by saying he presumed they would secure the salary for the chaplaincy at the sanitarium "at the earliest possible convenience." He expected to return to the States the next year. Southwell mentioned how happy he was with the progress at Otisville and said he had sent Dionysius Flanagan an efficient assistant in Felix McCaffrey.

The letter was pretty much superfluous as Farley penciled across its top, "Write that permission has been received from Rome."<sup>83</sup>

The agreement governing the status of the Otisville parish is rather complicated. G. Ferrante, apparently a priest on Farley's cathedral staff, sent a letter on August 5, 1911, to Southwell including the agreement.

A rescript of the Sacred Congregation of Religious gave the beneplacitum for the Carmelite foundation and confirmed the deal made by Southwell and Farley in an agreement of December 9, 1910. Besides receiving the care of the parish, the two missions and the sanitarium, St. Joseph's in Wurtsboro was excluded. The purpose of giving the area to the Carmelites was stated as better ministry for the people. Ferrante wrote out the actual agreement in his florid hand and Farley signed it on July 27th.<sup>84</sup>

At the time the Carmelites took over the parish of Otisville and the missions of Bloomingburg and Bullville, there were over 300 patients in the sanitarium for tuberculars.<sup>85</sup>

The Church of Saint Paul's, Bullville, had been erected around 1865. The area had been assigned to various churches in Orange County but in either 1901 or 1902, it was given to Saint Joseph's, Wurtsboro, whose responsibility it remained until the Carmelites assumed its care in 1911 as part of the Otisville parish. As early as June 3, 1911, there is Carmelite activity as on that Sunday, Felix McCaffrey baptized a child in St. Paul's Church. Simon Farrington began saying Mass

---

<sup>81</sup> Colfer to Monsignor (?), Middletown, Jan 20, 1913, CONY.

<sup>82</sup> Flanagan and McCaffrey to The Church of the Holy Name, July 24, 1912, Lib 539, p 349.

<sup>83</sup> Southwell to Farley, New York, July 7, 1911, DA, 1-14.

<sup>84</sup> Ferrante to Southwell, Aug 5, 1911; Agreement, Farley and Southwell, July 27, 1911, ANYP.

<sup>85</sup> Catholic News (New York) June 10, 1911 in Vestigium II, no 1, 6.

there in 1912.<sup>86</sup> With some years out for hospital work in Bellevue, he cared for his mission until 1940.<sup>87</sup>

Around the time the Carmelites took over the Otisville church, they began to offer Mass in the Bloomingburg area. One older resident would place the inception in 1912 but is not sure of the date.<sup>88</sup> An old photo remains from those days, depicting Bishop Cusack with Fathers Devlin and Colfer. Despite the obscurity of those early days, it seems the church was begun in 1912 and dedicated in 1913.<sup>89</sup>

Actually the date of dedication can find some substantiation in the fact that Colfer transferred the property to the parish in the same year. Actually, he and Simon Farrington had received the property earlier that same year from a person named Donovan.<sup>90</sup> So there is some reason in the property transaction to say the church was not begun until the property was possessed in 1913.

Simon Farrington seems to have cared regularly for the church as well as St. Paul's, Bullville. Previous to the building of the church, Mass had been celebrated during the summers since 1911 at Cairns' Lakeside Hotel. Transportation of the priest each Sunday to Bloomingburg from Middletown was accomplished by taking the milk train to Highview and then being transported to the church by one of the parishioners.<sup>91</sup>

The church of Our Lady of Mount Carmel, Elmsford, was operated as a mission of Transfiguration, Tarrytown. The time the Carmelites served the church can be gathered from the registers. The first baptism there was in February, 1905 by Andrew Maher and the last was on May 25, 1913 by Dionysius Flanagan. Six days later is the first baptism by the new diocesan pastor, Arthur J. Kenny.<sup>92</sup> Marriages seem to have been performed in Transfiguration because

---

<sup>86</sup> Baptismal Register (1911-9), Our Lady of Mt. Carmel, Middletown, N. Y.

<sup>87</sup> Souvenir Journal Commemorating 100 Years of the Roman Catholic Church of St. Paul, Bullville, N.Y., 12-6.

<sup>88</sup> Franklin to Bauer, Bloomingburg, Dec 7, 1962, St. Albert's Archives.

<sup>89</sup> Picture, St. Albert's Archives, was enclosed in Franklin to Bauer, Bloomingburg, Dec 6, 1962.

<sup>90</sup> Donovan to Colfer and Farrington, Feb 22, 1913, Lib 172, p 324; Golfer to Church of the Assumption, Oct 27, 1913, Lib 175, p 154. Cf. Furlong to Church of the Assumption, Aug 23, 1954, Lib 503, p 408 for the other parcel possessed by this mission church.

<sup>91</sup> Parish Council Newsletter, Our Lady of Mt. Carmel, July 7-8, 1979.

<sup>92</sup> Baptismal Register (Feb, 1905 - Aug, 1937) Our Lady of Mt. Carmel, passim.



that register has only six listed for the Carmelite period of the parish and they are from July 30, 1911 to October 27, 1912.<sup>93</sup>

Before the construction of the Elmsford church, the Carmelites had purchased land there, apparently as a site for the church. They also purchased land in both 1908 and 26 1910, the former parcel for \$500 and the latter for \$100.<sup>94</sup>

Cardinal Farley was insisting on appointing one of his priests to Elmsford and opposed the Carmelites sending one or two there. What brought this about, we do not know but possibly growth of the area demanded a permanent staff and Farley did not want the Carmelites to have two adjacent parishes. Southwell gave up the idea of sending anyone to Elmsford in view of the cardinal's position and was not going to protest the cardinal's appointment of one of his own men when he saw fit. Southwell said he had pressed for part of Middletown as a parish since he could have a house there of four or five men. Southwell was willing to part with Bloomingburg and Bullville but wanted Otisville. Three priests were sufficient for such an arrangement and Southwell had them available.

Farley liked Southwell's idea and sent him to Middletown to do some scouting. He reported that the town had 20,000 among whom were 4,000 to 5,000 Catholics. The Erie railroad divided the town into a hilly section, where the wealthy and Saint Joseph's Church were, and into a business and industrial section. Southwell asked for this latter part and boasted to Mayer that some of the consultants assured him he would get it. This explains the territory of Mount Carmel parish. It came, in Southwell's own admission, from his choice of this "business and industrial" section.<sup>95</sup>

With this almost certain, Southwell in the latter part of his letter is planning on keeping Otisville and Bloomingburg. He told the general that he could have solved this difficulty involved in residing in Otisville the previous year but he had followed advice. Now he seemed to be saying, waiting has brought a windfall.<sup>96</sup>

The transfer of the Carmelites from Otisville to Middletown as their principal residence must have been carried out over a period of time. The Carmelites had their first baptism in Otisville

---

<sup>93</sup> Marriage Register (July 30, 1911 - Nov 30, 1961) Our Lady of Mt. Carmel, passim.

<sup>94</sup> Jacobs to Our Lady of Mt. Carmel, May 8, 1908, Lib 2031, p 159; Reimers to Our Lady of Mt. Carmel, Sept 28, 1910, Lib 1927, p 225, CONY.

<sup>95</sup> Southwell to Mayer, New York, June 25, 1912, CG, Hib (1906-21).

<sup>96</sup> Baptismal Register (1911-9) Our Lady of Mt. Carmel. Late fall as a date for the Carmelites in Middletown seems not feasible in view of this Baptismal Register and the purchase of the Shorter house only on Nov 16, 1912. Cf. Lib 537, p 237.

on May 28, 1911. Certainly, they were there before then. The Carmelites were active in Middletown definitely by December 22, 1912 and possibly as early as December 8 of that year.<sup>97</sup>

It was in 1912 that the Carmelites purchased the home of Dr. Samuel Shorter at 26 Monhagen Avenue for their priory and church in Middletown. The property was purchased by William Foley on November 14, 1912 who later turned it over to the parish.<sup>98</sup> This home was purchased from the grandfather of the Olympic marathon victor, Frank Shorter. This became the parish and the mission center of the area since Otisville was not as central or as accessible as originally believed.

The house had been constructed about fifty years earlier by Henry Little who also operated a grist mill on the premises. The first order of business was to convert a barn on the property into a temporary church. This work was contracted to Frank McKane, a member of the parish. Some or most of the work must have been completed by Christmas, 1912, for on that morning the first Mass in the parish was offered at about 5:00 A.M. Elias Magennis, an assistant general of the order at the time and visiting in the Middletown area, preached at the 10:00 o'clock Mass.

Richard Colfer came from Tarrytown to be the first pastor and had as his assistants Paul O'Dwyer and Simon Farrington who apparently continued to serve Bloomingburg and Bullville from the new parish. It would seem that at the same time or thereabouts, the rented residence in Otisville was abandoned and the care of all the missions came to Our Lady of Mount Carmel as the new Middletown parish was called.<sup>99</sup>

The area of the city of Middletown that was cut off from the existing parish of Saint Joseph's to make the new Carmelite parish was not well populated. Factories, warehouses and lower income dwellings predominated in the new parish.

As with all parishes of those days, societies were begun almost at once at Mount Carmel. Besides aiming at the unity of the parishoners and their welfare, these societies had the raising of funds as a major task. Weekly card parties with some so large that the State Armory was required and other fund raising events took a long time to put money together. On May 15, 1919, John Gavin, a parishoner, bought a parcel on West Main Street for the church. It had been the site of a

---

<sup>97</sup> Jacobs to Our Lady of Mt. Carmel, May 8, 1908, Lib 2031, p 159; Reimers to Our Lady of Mt. Carmel, Sept 28, 1910, Lib 1927, p 225, CONY.

<sup>98</sup> Foley to Our Lady of Mt. Carmel, Mar 21, 1913, Lib 540, p 179. After the incorporation of the parish, this conveyance took place. Foley was either the lawyer or held the property until the corporation could be created to receive the land. The original was Shorter to W. Foley, Nov 16, 1912, Lib 537, p 237. This deed included rights to water on the property of one David Houston.

<sup>99</sup> Irish Catholic Directory (Dublin, James Duffy and Co.) cf. years cited.

livery stable run by Simon Nelson. It was after this establishment burned down that Gavin acquired it and turned it over to the parish a week later.<sup>100</sup>

One of the difficulties with the acquisition of land for the church was the lack of funds. The parish had been incorporated only on March 8, 1913 and later that month, a meeting in the chancery office brought forth the decision that a mortgage for \$6,000 should be taken by the parish just to liquidate its debts. Just three years later, the same procedure took place but this time for \$3,500 and in the name of "Ladies' Catholic Benevolent Association."<sup>101</sup>

Colfer was replaced as pastor by Louis McCabe in 1919. Saint Albert's had been opened as a preparatory seminary in 1917 and the school and parish staff are mixed up in directories. Some did work in both places and surely the faculty did Sunday Masses in the various missions.

While Dominic Hastings was the pastor in 1924, construction of a church began on the West Main Street site. It was a basement church whose plans were drawn up by Ewing and Allen, a New York firm. The building contract was awarded to William Giles of Middletown. Work so proceeded that the cornerstone was laid by auxiliary Bishop of New York John Dunne on December 20, 1925. This ceremony was carried out like a dedication. A procession of clergy and societies marched to the music of the Middletown Italian Band from the temporary Monhagen Avenue church to the new one on West Main. Vincent Smyth, a parish assistant, spoke at the ceremony. That Christmas Eve was the occasion of the first Mass in the new structure. Louis Gerhard, who had become pastor during the construction of the church, was the celebrant with Vincent Smyth and Vincent Coffey as deacon and subdeacon. Smyth would succeed Gerhard as pastor during 1925 and serve for the next two years,<sup>102</sup>

When it was decided the Carmelites should make their center at Middletown rather than Otisville, Farley had a contract drawn up. This new parish of Our Lady of Mount Carmel was established for the spiritual good of the faithful under a number of conditions. A benepiacitum had to be obtained, the rector was to be nominated by the superior and appointed by the ordinary and it was to be his purpose to foster the spiritual good of the faithful. The pastor and his assistants were to be subject to the ordinary where the care of souls and the administration of the sacraments was involved. All their rights and privileges in their internal affairs as religious remained and regulations of various papal documents, synodal decrees and plenary councils were

---

<sup>100</sup> Gavin to Our Lady of Mt. Carmel, May 22, 1919, Lib 588, p 404. A later conveyance of a right of way is Crans to Our Lady of Mt. Carmel, July 8, 1925, Lib 655, p 299.

<sup>101</sup> Incorporation, Our Lady of Mt. Carmel, Mar 8, 1913; minutes of meetings, Mar 25, 1913 and Feb 23, 1916, Our Lady of Mt. Carmel, CONY.

<sup>102</sup> Source for material on Our Lady of Mt. Carmel not separately cited is: Our Lady of Mount Carmel, Middletown, New York (Hackensack, 1976)3-

in effect. Goods of the church belonged to the diocese, rules of the synod had to be observed concerning the building of a school and finally, the Carmelites could not themselves leave the parish without giving the ordinary six months notice.

Farley accepted the agreement in November, 1913. Two months later, the Congregation for Religious approved and the next month, February, 1914, Hayes forwarded the completed agreement to the Carmelites.<sup>103</sup>

In a letter dated January 11, 1912, Southwell wrote Llovera, addressing him as "V. Gen." (vicar general). This he would not become until that June. Possibly there is a mistake of date on the letter.

Southwell was writing to clear up any questions about the new house in Middletown and the Otisville parish. He called Otisville the center of the three-town parish and said two fathers had been living in Otisville for a year in virtue of "Beneplacito Apost." This arrangement was found to be very inconvenient and so Cardinal Farley gave the Carmelites a site in Middletown as well as the injunction to begin a parish there. Because of the fact that the Middletown territory was contiguous to that of Otisville, no additional apostolic approval was needed. Southwell said he had consulted with Magennis and hoped all was proper. If not, he seemed prepared to make the necessary remedies.

After some discussion of the amount to be paid for students in Rome, Southwell mentioned he was going to the United States for missions during Lent since this was a good source of income for the support of the students in the Irish province.<sup>104</sup>

An Otisville report, done by Dionysius Flanagan, covered the twelve months from May 1, 1911 to May 1, 1912. Four places were included: Otisville, Bloomingburg, Bullville and the Otisville Sanitarium. Together with entertainments and the sale of a bicycle, their receipts totaled \$5,375.88 and among the expenses were a horse and wagon and \$759.23 for an automobile. Building lots cost \$461.40 and Flanagan did pay \$500 as part of the fathers' salary.

The Otisville report ended with a cash balance of \$11.29 and savings of \$222.85 in two banks.<sup>105</sup>

Southwell had to leave for the United States and the Lenten missions soon after he wrote a letter to Llovera. Its business we do not know but apparently Southwell going to the United States for this mission work was not what Llovera wanted. Southwell excused himself from not following the vicar general's wishes by saying he had made certain commitments and the order would

---

<sup>103</sup> Contract, Farley and the Carmelites, New York, Nov 6, 1913, ANYP.

<sup>104</sup> Southwell to Llovera, Dublin, Jan 11, 1912, CG, Hib (1906-21).

<sup>105</sup> Balance for the Year, May 1, 1911 - May 1, 1912, CG, Am Sti Eliae, BTMNY.

suffer grave financial troubles if he cancelled. He would return to Ireland for the chapter right after Easter - he still presumed there would be one - if Llovera gave him permission to remain in America.

Otisville was still a problem for those in Rome. Southwell admitted that sometimes one of the fathers from Middletown stayed there and almost every day the sick at the sanitarium were visited.<sup>106</sup> It would seem that from the nature of tuberculosis, a priest would have had to be on duty all the time. This, of course, would necessitate someone staying in Otisville as transportation, distance and the roads did not favor residence in Middletown at the new parish.

In November, 1914, the City of New York set aside a piece of land at the Otisville Sanitarium for the construction of a Catholic chapel.<sup>107</sup> Richard Colfer must have informed Farley of this as he wrote Colfer to tell him that the employees and patients would probably be happy to raise funds for the chapel's construction. He told him this was the method followed at Hudson River State Hospital in Poughkeepsie. He predicted that the faithful would supplement these funds and seemed to give Colfer permission to raise funds from individuals in the archdiocese. Colfer was able a few years later to receive official appointment as the chaplain at the sanitarium. It carried a salary of \$250 a year.<sup>108</sup>

The care of the boys in the New York City Settlement at New Hampton weighed on Cardinal Farley's mind so he wrote Richard Colfer at the Middletown parish to investigate caring for the boys. Farley felt since Colfer had dealings with other institutions in the area he would be well enough known to do this.<sup>109</sup> Within two months time, the Carmelites did have the care of this institution called variously in correspondence, Hampton Reformatory.<sup>110</sup>

In 1914-15, Richard Colfer used to travel once a week out to Unionville, to teach catechism to the area's children at Horton Clark's farm. On July 16, 1915, the young children took the train to Middletown where they received their First Communion and had breakfast in the rectory afterwards. For years, travel by train to Middletown or Sussex was the only way people could attend church. It would not be until 1948 that Mass would be regularly celebrated in Unionville.<sup>111</sup>

---

<sup>106</sup> Southwell to Llovera, New York, Feb 4, 1913, CG, Hib (1906-21)

<sup>107</sup> Rousseau to Colfer, New York, Nov 23, 1914, ANYP.

<sup>108</sup> Farley to Colfer, New York, Dec 4, 1914, ANYP.

<sup>109</sup> Shipley to Colfer, New York, Feb 7, 1917, ANYP.

<sup>110</sup> Farley to Colfer, New York, Dec 2, 1915, ANYP.

<sup>111</sup> Carroll to Colfer, New York, Feb 1, 1916, ANYP.

In the area of South Centerville, Paul O'Dwyer had celebrated Mass at the home of Joseph Kurpick on December 21, 1912 and seemingly, this practice was continued until the church of the Holy Cross was built.<sup>112</sup> Possibly, O'Dwyer was active in the area earlier as he was doing the baptism of residents.

Holy Cross Church in South Centerville, one-time called Centerville, was begun in the spring of 1916 on a piece of land cut from the O'Brien farm at the intersection of Eatontown, Millsburg and Castle Hill Roads. The first Mass was celebrated in the church by Richard Colfer in the fall of 1917. Sheds were built in the churchyard to protect the parishoners' horses and coaches from rain and snow during bad weather. As in the case of other Carmelite churches, the plans called for a basement church with another structure to built above. The excavating and building was done by volunteers from the parish. When an increase in the population required a larger church, it was built near Minisink Valley School and this original site reverted to the O'Brien family.<sup>113</sup>

On November 16, 1918, Berthold Edward Keating died at the young age of thirty from what has been described as Spanish Flu. He was stationed in the Middletown parish and was caring for the sanitarium at Otisville at the time of his death. Keating was born in England of Irish parents and after his ordination in March, 1915, he worked in Dublin's Whitefriars Street becoming involved in the 1916 rebellion. That same summer he came to Middletown where he worked in the missions and taught Latin and French at St. Albert's.<sup>114</sup>

At the beginning of 1920, Archbishop Hayes must have had some complaint about the service given the Catholic inmates at New Hampton Farms. Louis McCabe was able to respond that he had received an extra priest and could have Mass and sermon every Sunday at New Hampton, confession a few times during the month and instruction during the week. He mentioned to Hayes that he also had Masses at Greenville, Otisville, the sanitarium, Bloomingburg [sic], Bullville and two at Middletown. A taxi was used for transportation as the parish car was used for the missions Hayes was satisfied with McCabe's schedule and thought there was no room for future complaint.<sup>115</sup>

Felix A. McCaffrey, pastor of the Middletown parish was faced with a large number of visiting priests coming to assist him at times during the summer and wrote to the chancery office asking

---

<sup>112</sup> Parish Council Newsletter, Our Lady of Mt. Carmel, May 5-6, 1979.

<sup>113</sup> Parish Council Newsletter, Our Lady of Mt. Carmel, Oct 5-6, 1979.

<sup>114</sup> Cogan to Lorenzoni, Dublin, /19157/ CG, Hib (1900-5); The New York Times (Nov 18, 1918) 15; Catholic News (New York) Nov 30, 1918 and Gaelic American (New York) Nov 23, 1918, 4 both give his date of ordination as March, 1915 while Analecta Ordinis Carmelitarum 4 (1917-22) 361 gives March 21, 1913.

<sup>115</sup> McCabe to Hayes, Middletown, Jan 21, 1920, ANYP.

for a clarification of a previous letter that granted faculties to those assisting him.<sup>116</sup> The reply came back giving him the power to give faculties to any of "your Order" sent to assist you.<sup>117</sup> This was not enough for McCaffrey as he had Passionists from West Hoboken and Jesuits also assisting him. So he wrote asking for a clarification and a more generous grant of permission.<sup>118</sup> This came to him in the form of a grant of faculties for any religious assisting at the Mt. Carmel parish for the period of a year.<sup>119</sup> In reply to this grant that obviously solved a recurring Saturday night problem, McCaffrey wrote the archbishop sending him a check and thanking him for his many acts of kindness to the Carmelites in Middletown not the least of which was this grant.<sup>120</sup>

There were plans afoot for two cemeteries in Middle-town. One was to be at St. Albert's and was for the Carmelites, the other was to be built by Our Lady of Mount Carmel parish and was for the laity. The same architect was working on both and O'Farrell made it clear to him that the parish cemetery was the concern of Louis Gerhard, the pastor, and that all permits, accounts, etc. should be kept separate.<sup>121</sup> Permission was given in 1923 for the parish cemetery.<sup>122</sup> Almost three years later, the parish cemetery was still not begun and the same was true of the Carmelite cemetery. Hoth, the architect, wrote Louis Gerhard that he would do a topographic survey for the parish cemetery for \$150 and a general plan for \$1,050. He would do a complete set of plans for the Carmelite cemetery for \$250. In both cases, his supervision of \$30 a day.<sup>123</sup> Gerhard wrote back sending a map of the parish cemetery site and told him to do the \$150 topographic survey.<sup>124</sup>

During August, 1924, the Ku Klux Klan was active in the Middletown mission area. While the Carmelites were running a dance for young people at Memorial Hall in Bloomingburg, the affair

---

<sup>116</sup> Mooney to McCaffrey, New York, Apr 23, 1920, DA, 0-19a; McCabe to Hayes, Middletown, June 2, 1921, DA, 0-19a.

<sup>117</sup> Dineen to McCabe, New York, June 8, 1921, DA, 0-19a.

<sup>118</sup> McCaffrey to Dineen, Middletown, June 10, 1921, DA, 0-19a.

<sup>119</sup> Dineen to McCaffrey, New York, June 13, 1921, DA, 0-19a.

<sup>120</sup> McCabe to Hayes, Middletown, June 20, 1921, DA, 0-19a.

<sup>121</sup> O'Farrell to Hoth, Bronx, ET923\_7, ANYP.

<sup>122</sup> Carroll to Hastings, New York, Oct 5, 1923, ANYP.

<sup>123</sup> Hoth to Gerhard, Leonia, Feb 9, 1926, ANYP.

<sup>124</sup> Gerhard to Hoth, Middletown, Mar 29, 1926, ANYP.

was interrupted by the burning of a cross behind the hall. There was no damage and intimidation seems to have been the purpose.<sup>125</sup>

Ewing and Allen, the New York architectural firm chosen to do the plans of the Carmelite church in Middletown were dismissed and others hired. At the end of 1924, they sent the parish a bill whose balance was \$494.83 unpaid. \$1,000 had been already paid in installments of \$500.<sup>126</sup> Another bill came to Simon Farrington the next month and he wrote Ewing and Allen that he did not change the architects but his superior had before he, Simon, had come to Middletown. Simon told the architect that he was sending the bill to Gerard O'Farrell so he could make amends if he had been discourteous and could consider their claim to the \$751.24 still due. Then he penned a second paragraph:

"I received your letter a few days ago and owing to the fact that I was very busy I did not reply at once. Your letter really amused me from [sic] the tone of your letter it is pretty evident that your temper is not the best just now. Before talking about a want of courtesy a man with a little intellectual balance generally makes sure that the party to whom he writes about a want of courtesy has been really guilty in this matter or not."<sup>127</sup>

O'Farrell was upset when he wrote to Farrington. He told him that there was more trouble over a basement church in Middletown than over three buildings in the Bronx at St. Simon Stock. He told him he was listening too much to the parishioners and not doing what he, the pastor, wanted. O'Farrell gave him one more chance to build a church. If he did not complete it, he would tell Rome, the archbishop and the consultants the reasons why. O'Farrell ordered Farrington to have a meeting of the Fathers, the trustees and architect on Tuesday, February 12, at the Priory at 11:00 A.M. Let the meeting decide, said O'Farrell, who was to get the work. He promised that he and Dominic Hastings would be there.<sup>128</sup>

There is no record of the outcome of the meeting but Ewing and Allen sent O'Farrell a letter on February 27 asking about the bill Farrington had forwarded to him.<sup>129</sup> O'Farrell told the architects how he had sent the bill on to the former pastor, Dominic Hastings, whom he also told to have an interview with Ewing and Allen with the view of settling the bill. Hastings, O'Farrell

---

<sup>125</sup> The Record (Middletown) Mar 3, 1975, 5.

<sup>126</sup> Bill, Ewing and Allen, New York, Dec 10, 1924, ANYP.

<sup>127</sup> Farrington to Ewing and Allen, Middletown, Jan 6, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>128</sup> O'Farrell to Farrington, Bronx, Feb 5, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>129</sup> Ewing and Allen to O'Farrell, New York, Feb 27, 1925, ANYP.



related, felt that he had paid them for what they had done, dismissed them and hired another architect. Hastings and himself, O'Farrell related, both felt that some of the bill were duplicated items and really had been paid for.<sup>130</sup>

When writing to Elias Magennis, O'Farrell said he expected the construction of the Middletown church to begin the first week of March and cost \$133,000. He told Magennis he had a lot of trouble in Middletown due "to the poor business methods and the long tongue of the pastor, Fr. Farrington." He went on to blame Simon for cliques among the parishioners. He also told how he himself had to tell the people that any more dictation and opposition would mean the end of construction and the forwarding of reasons for this to Magennis in Rome. This, he felt had kept the situation in hand but it had taken a lot of his time.<sup>131</sup>

Magennis related how he was never delighted with Middletown except for the college. He saw nothing but country work there and did not see any future for Middletown. He told O'Farrell he should leave all the pros and cons of the church to those on the scene. Magennis seemed to make the point that the place was not worth the worry.<sup>132</sup>

That June, the commissary, O'Farrell, and his consultors decided to replace Simon Farrington as the Middletown pastor with Louis Gerhard.<sup>133</sup> At the end of that year, Ewing and Allen sent their bill again. Citing the fact they were dispensed without notification and they had not been asked to do anything since July, they felt they were now finished with the job and would like payment of the 68 \$740.01 still due.<sup>134</sup> There is no reply extant.

Father Joseph Egan was the pastor of Saint Teresa's Church in North Tarrytown in the 1890's. He was instrumental in the establishment of the parish in Pocantico Hills and was well acquainted with the needs of the Church in the Tarrytown-Elmsford area. His brother left him some money but it was with the stipulation that the income of the money be used to educate the man's children. The amount was at least \$15,000 and perhaps another \$10,000 was involved. Besides the children's education, the money was to be used for the good of the Church through construction. At the time we are dealing with, we have no idea of the children's ages and whether the money was still tied up in their education, Egan seemed intent in spending the \$15,000 sum

---

<sup>130</sup> O'Farrell to Ewing and Allen, Bronx, Feb 28, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>131</sup> O'Farrell to Magennis, /Bronx ?7, Feb 11, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>132</sup> Magennis to O'Farrell, Rome, May 1, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>133</sup> O'Farrell to Hayes, Bronx, June 25, 1925; Carroll to O'Farrell, New York, June 29, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>134</sup> Ewing and Allen, Statement, Dec 31, 1925; same to Farrington, Dec 31, 1925, ANYP.

in establishing a seminary for the archdiocese. The other \$10,000 he wanted to use for a church in the Tarrytown-Elmsford area.<sup>135</sup>

1894 finds Egan on an extended tour of Europe. He was at this point forty-one years ordained and seemingly a confidant of Archbishop Corrigan. That December, writing from Rome, he thought that since the Carmelites could not get the construction restrictions removed from their desired site in Tarrytown, they should take the Cleveland place despite its expensive price. His description, "It is magnificent."<sup>136</sup> A few weeks later, he thought that when he returned from his trip, he would care for the Sisters of Mercy in Tarrytown and their orphanage which he called the "Poor House." He would also "function" in the new parish of the Carmelites which would, he felt, also have a church in Elmsford.<sup>137</sup>

Since in 1895, there was still no pastor appointed for the Carmelite parish, Egan thought that the site should be used for the proposed seminary. This presumes that the site was located on what was then called Jackson Ave. He proposed this not as a vendetta against the pastor because there was none.<sup>138</sup>

The next month, Egan has another idea. Father Sheahan of Pocantico Hills, with his church already built, would trade parishes with the Carmelites in the case they could not find a Tarrytown location. Sheahan then would build a church in South Tarrytown and the area of Transfiguration would then go to Father Lennon in St. Teresa's<sup>139</sup>

Egan wrote Corrigan two months later to say that if the intentions of the Carmelites for the Cleveland place were known, the price would rise. They would end up with no site. Egan also mentioned he heard the Carmelites were anxious to get in touch with him concerning the \$10,000 he had for church construction. If they did, he would not answer. Egan wanted to reclaim the area given the Carmelites and restrict them to a less desirable section.<sup>140</sup>

After this letter, Corrigan seems to have told Egan either that his advice was not desired or was out of order because Egan wrote him that all his communications about the Carmelites were merely expressions of his interest, nothing more.<sup>141</sup>

---

<sup>135</sup> Egan Papers, DA, G-8.

<sup>136</sup> Egan to Corrigan, Rome, Dec 22, 1894, DA, G-8.

<sup>137</sup> Same to same, Rome, 'Jan 2, 1895, DA, G-8.

<sup>138</sup> Same to same, Rome, Jan 29, 1895, DA, G-8

<sup>139</sup> Same to same, Rome, Feb 23, 1895, DA, G-8.

<sup>140</sup> Same to same, Rome, Apr 14, 1895, DA, G-8.

<sup>141</sup> Same to same, Rome, May 8, 1895, DA, G-8.

When Corrigan blessed the church at Pocantico Hills, Egan saw fit to make his final dig of the whole affair. He wished Corrigan would be as similarly pleased with the new Tarrytown parish of the Carmelites.<sup>142</sup>

In a letter of the then Monsignor Hayes to Denis O'Connor at Tarrytown early in 1910, there is a hint of a future problem. Hayes tells O'Connor that records state the division between Transfiguration parish and St. Teresa's as being "Main Street from the Hudson River."<sup>143</sup> Within a few months of this edict there is a complaint from Immaculate Conception of Irvington. Father Early complained O'Connor was taking a census in his parish. In response, O'Connor claimed that when he arrived there, Edward Southwell then provincial, told him that the boundaries of the parish were Sunnyside Lane on the south and Main Street on the north and attested that he had remained within those limits.<sup>144</sup>

This minor tempest continued with O'Connor writing Hayes a few days later to say when he first came to the parish, Early had encroached on him on two occasions and claimed that the Transfiguration boundary was further north than it really was. It was then that he asked Southwell and received the above dimensions of the parish. O'Connor significantly stated that the Carmelites were given South Tarrytown and mentioned there were only eighty-one families in the parish but the employees of the wealthy Protestant and Jewish families vacationing there during the summer were a help.<sup>145</sup> Monsignors Flood and Lavelle were assigned to settle the dispute.<sup>146</sup> When Lavelle came to see him, O'Connor had the misfortune to be away and Dionysius Flanagan was at home. Flanagan negotiated with Lavelle and they arrived at Sunnyside Lane as the southern boundary of the parish. O'Connor had to write that this was acceptable.<sup>147</sup>

When this acceptance of O'Connor was received, Lavelle wrote him back that he was not the last word and was only supposed to visit, observe and report back to Farley and his council. Lavelle said there was an absence of documents and each side had a statement from what would be considered a "founding father." Lavelle did say he was going to recommend the Carmelites as the pastors of South Tarrytown. He thought the point mute because there soon would be a parish

---

<sup>142</sup> Same to same, Budapest, Sept 17, 1895, DA, G-8.

<sup>143</sup> Hayes to O'Connor, New York, Feb 10, 1910, ANYP.

<sup>144</sup> O'Connor to Hayes, Tarry town, [May, 1910], copy; Hayes to O'Connor, New York, May 9, 1910, ANYP.

<sup>145</sup> O'Connor to Hayes, Tarrytown, May 19, 1910, 3 varying copies, ANYP.

<sup>146</sup> Hayes to O'Connor, New York, June 1, 1910, ANYP.

<sup>147</sup> O'Connor to Lavelle, Tarrytown, June 6, 1910, 4 varying copies, ANYP.

between the two of them.<sup>148</sup> A little over a month later, O'Connor acknowledged the receipt of the decision of the diocesan council. He called it satisfactory. Presumably, it was what he wanted, that the Carmelites would be the pastors of South Tarrytown or, as it is called today, Tarrytown.<sup>149</sup>

Shortly after this encounter over the parish boundaries, Denis O'Connor had another encounter, this time with Eugene McKenna, the pastor of St. Teresa's, North Tarry-town. McKenna said O'Connor had done the wedding of Mary Carberry, whom McKenna claimed as one of his parishioners. O'Connor was able to respond that the lady worked for a Mrs. Lord and resided with her. This Lord was a pew holder in Transfiguration and not one in St. Teresa's, as McKenna claimed. Sensing defeat and trying to salvage some honor, McKenna stated O'Connor had violated his parochial rights two other times in the past two years. O'Connor bravely asked him to state a single case.<sup>150</sup>

---

<sup>148</sup> Lavelle to O'Connor, New York, June 8, 1910, ANYP.

<sup>149</sup> O'Connor to Hayes, Tarrytown, July 20, 1910, ANYP.

<sup>150</sup> Hayes to O'Connor, New York, Nov 28, 1910; O'Connor to Hayes, Tarrytown, Nov 29, 1910, ANYP.

## CHAPTER IV

### Parish Life in Manhattan

In 1910, Richard Colfer and Paul O'Dwyer attended the Eucharistic Congress in Montreal. While there, O'Dwyer was able to see Cardinal Vanutelli, the papal representative. He promised O'Dwyer that since he was the Cardinal Protector of the Carmelites, he would visit the Carmelite parish when he came to New York. This he did that October, during the time of the annual fair.

Vanutelli was accompanied to the parish by Cardinal Gibbons, Archbishop Farley, Bishop Gabriels and a group of monsignors including Mooney, Lovelle and Edwards. The parishioners and school children took part in a church ceremony that ended with the cardinal giving papal benediction. Afterwards, he took lunch with the fathers in the priory.<sup>151</sup>

That same year, Cardinal Logue of Ireland visited the parish. The cardinal, in Southwell's opinion, showed marked interest in the Carmelites.<sup>152</sup>

Statistics, giving an idea of work done in the parish, are available for these years:<sup>153</sup>

	1906	1907	1908	1910	1911
Baptisms (Parish)	345	375	340	586	657
Marriages	71	86	64	64	53
Converts	16	39	32	30	40
Communions				50,000	70,000
Confirmations					
Boys			384		200
Girls			392		210

<sup>151</sup> Parish Bulletin (Oct, 1910)10, (Nov, 1910)5, (Jan, 1911) 6 all in Vestigium III, no 1, 39-40; "Souvenir Bulletin of the Carmelite Fair," 5, Carmel III, 47 int 17, Carmelite Library, Institutum Carmelitanum, Roma, Italia.

<sup>152</sup> Southwell to Mayer, Tarrytown, Oct 25, 1910, CG, Hib(1906-21).

<sup>153</sup> Parish Bulletin (Jan, 1907)11, (Jan, 1908)9, (Jan,1909)11, (Feb, 1911)12-3, (Feb, 1912)12-3 all in Vestigium III, no 2, 25-6.

Adults	29		
School	776	825	840
Sunday School		877	

From 1903 on to 1910, foundlings' baptisms are in the Bellevue Hospital registers. In 1909, Denis O'Connor is mentioned as the chaplain of the Foundling Hospital which was located in those days at Washington Square.<sup>154</sup>

In early 1910, a gymnasium was opened in the parish. This is the same building that in the past had been used for meetings, the children's Sunday Mass and parish gatherings of all kinds. It stood on the site of the present day priory. With the gym, there was organized in the parish the Carmelite Athletic Association. The building contained pool tables, a handball court, a baseball diamond (obviously miniature), punching bags, rowing apparatus and plans for indoor games such as checkers and chess. Boys over fourteen could join the association whose purpose was to keep young men off the streets at night.

Shortly after the start of the CAA, the name seems to have been changed to Saint Joseph's Society. The group added basketball and religious activities. The members were expected to receive Communion together one Sunday each month. Smoking and improper language, naturally, were forbidden to the members of the organization.<sup>155</sup>

In this period of the parish's life, the patronal feast of Our Lady of Mount Carmel was celebrated with a novena of more than a week. There was a Solemn High Mass the morning of the feast and the evening featured vespers, sermon and benediction. In 1909, Pius Mayer offered the Mass and Bishop Cusack promised to preside at the services held on Sunday, July 18. Archbishop Farley presided in 1910 while Bishop Cusack and a flock of monsignors were present to hear Edward Southwell preach. The fact that he was provincial at the time probably helped to bring about the presence of the episcopacy and their coterie of monsignors. In 1911, Dominic Devlin preached at the Mass and Elias Magennis did the evening's sermon.<sup>156</sup>

Paul O'Dwyer had been appointed the prior and pastor of the 28th Street parish at the chapter of 1909. The fair of that year was in the last part of October. In the Parish Bulletin, an article expressing the thanks of the Fathers for support of the fair stated it would be easy to forget the

---

<sup>154</sup> Bellevue Hospital Baptismal Register (Dec, 1903 - Feb, 1910) , (Jan 6, 1902 - Feb 5, 1910). For O'Connor, cf. p 53 in latter.

<sup>155</sup> Parish Bulletin (Feb, 1910)10, (Feb, 1911)8-9, (Oct, 1911)9, (Nov, 1911)7 in Vestigium III, no 2, 40-4; Catholic News (New York) Feb 12, 1910 in *ibid.*, 39.

<sup>156</sup> Parish Bulletin (July, 1909)10, (Aug, 1911)10; Catholic News (New York) July 23, 1910, p 17 all in Vestigium III, no 3, 11-2.

work of the Carmelites in the parish and Bellevue Hospital except that the work in both places was so apparent and outstanding. Monsignor Lavelle opened the fair that year.

When the fair of 1910 was approaching, the Parish Bulletin sounded a note of alarm. For not only was there the parish debt of over \$100,000 but there was the parish assessment of \$2,000 towards the debt of Saint Patrick's Cathedral. This had to be liquidated before the cathedral could be consecrated. Farley must have expected almost immediate payment and he was, according to the article, aiming for an October consecration.

Cardinal Logue opened the fair and it was called the most successful in the history of the parish. The inaugural featured a procession with the band of the Mission of the Immaculate Conception then located on Lafayette Street, Manhattan. Archbishop Farley was present and Paul O'Dwyer introduced the cardinal who gave a little speech and was quoted as saying "never in the history of the parish did a Cardinal open a fair." Bishop Cusack was also present.

Cardinal Logue spoke of the fairs of Ireland and mentioned that before they concluded, the women usually managed to separate the men from everything they possessed. He said this phase of the fair was, he could see, much the same in the United States. Then he gave a set of Beleeck china for a prize.<sup>157</sup>

A souvenir bulletin was produced for the 1910 fair. It opened on October 10 and closed two weeks later on October 24. This bulletin seems to have been put out after the close of the fair and besides a memento of this event was an additional fund raiser through ads solicited from local businesses.

At this time, Ambrose Wade was directing the music and those in the parish were O'Dwyer, Slattery, Laffey, McCaffrey and Brennan. It is interesting to note "Master John Hickey," later a Carmelite, donated a box of cigars to the School Boys' Table of the fair.

The souvenir journal mentioned a Carmelite Church and School Debt-Paying Association. Collectors of this group went the rounds of the parish from block to block gathering from each parishioner as little as twenty-five cents and as much as \$1.50 according to the published lists.<sup>158</sup>

The fair of 1911 presented a bizarre problem to the pastor, Paul O'Dwyer. As had been done for all the previous fairs, books of chances giving ten at ten cents each were sent through the mail and these also offered admission to the fair. There were ten main prizes but the top prize was a 1912 Flanders automobile. The drawing was to have taken place on the last night of the fair,

---

<sup>157</sup> Parish Bulletin (Sept, 1910)11, (Nov, 1910)5 in Vestigium III, no 1, 37-8; Carholie News (New York) Oct 15, 1910 In *ibid.*, 38.

<sup>158</sup> "Souvenir Bulletin of the Carmelite Fair," 5,7,8,11,19-26, Carmel III, 47 int. 14, Carmelite Library, Institutum Carmelitanum, Roma, Italia.

Monday, October 30. Just as the first ticket was to be drawn from the large drum filled with chances, O'Dwyer was called to the door of the school hall and was given a letter by a man. After reading the letter, he returned to the hall to announce that the drawing was illegal and had to be stopped. The action had been initiated by Anthony Comstock, head of the Society for the Suppression of Vice. O'Dwyer seems to have had some intimation of what would happen and probably was so warned by Cardinal Farley or his office. It looks as though O'Dwyer's plan was to cease the raffle if a protest was made. This came in the letter delivered to him that apparently threatened him with consequences should he not be prudent enough to cancel the drawing.

Offers to return the money spent in chances was made but accounts state that no one made such a claim. The fair suffered from this action as the profit was given as \$6,230 down almost \$3,000 from that of the previous year.<sup>159</sup>

At the 1911 reunion of the Carmelite 28th Street parish, held in the Murray Hill Lyceum, the program printed by Joseph McQuade, Sr., listed Paul O'Dwyer as chairman and had James Campbell as the Floor Manager. One of his assistants was Philip Rettig and in 1914, when Edward Southwell had returned as pastor, Rettig had risen to the position of Floor Manager and the entertainment featured was an operetta, "The Merry Milkmaids" by Charles Gabriel.<sup>160</sup>

The twenty-fifth anniversary of the parish of Our Lady of the Scapular was celebrated both in fund raising and in liturgy. It was also the occasion of an extra-parochial fund raising venture. Cardinal Farley permitted this because of the Carmelites' work among the poor in Bellevue and the city's Irish giving the church the aura of a national parish. The actual debt of the parish is not mentioned in connection with the jubilee but a positive note is assumed by stating how much had been paid. This was \$225,000 of \$300,000 expended for permanent structures. It seems that twenty-five years after the parish had been founded, the priory on 29th Street and the church were considered temporary structures. The school, of course was classed as permanent.

The silver jubilee was celebrated on Sunday, December 13, 1914 at the 11:00 A.M. Mass with the apostolic delegate, Archbishop Bonzano presiding. Bishop Colton of Buffalo, a former pastor of Saint Stephen's, was the celebrant. Bishop Cusack, New York's auxiliary, preached. The evening had the delegate presiding at evening vespers and benediction.<sup>161</sup>

---

<sup>159</sup> New York Sun (Nov 1, 1911)1, New York Press (Nov 1, 1911)2, Parish Bulletin (Oct, 1911)8, (Nov, 1911)8 all in Vestigium III, no 1, 40-3; ^Chance Ticket, ANYP.

<sup>160</sup> Programs, 1911 and 1914 Reunions, ANYP.

<sup>161</sup> Program, Silver Jubilee, Church of Our Lady of the Scapular; Elias Holland, "The First Carmelite Foundation in New York," Sword 2(1938) 313 is incorrect in stating the date of the jubilee as Oct 25, 1914.



Southwell, as he began 1911, wrote an ominous letter to the general, Pius Mayer. He mentioned Paul O'Dwyer as one of his greatest difficulties and until he had visited him in America, Southwell would not say how far he had neglected regulations. He was, however, anxious to avoid trouble with him if he could.<sup>162</sup>

Edward Southwell came to the United States on February 24, 1911. Elias Magennis met him at the ship and brought him to Tarrytown. Magennis had a cold but was expected to recover soon. Southwell had brought Hugh Devlin along with him "so as there might be no hitch from any quarter..." Southwell's aim in the United States was to replenish the Provincial Fund which at that time was empty. Presumably, he would do this through missions and supply work.

Southwell noted a change for the better in the attitude of the Tarrytown prior, Denis O'Connor, and attributed this to the influence of Magennis. He also hoped to report good things to the general after he completed the visitations. This is unusual for Southwell but he did have some bad news. "There are several of our people who will require permission from the Holy See for the Executorship of Wills and I mean to give Pr. Magennis a list and have him put the applications in."

The chapter of 1912 was on his mind and suggested to the general that it be planned for July. Southwell was going with Magennis to see Cardinal Farley and they would try to have the duties in Otisville modified. He also was going to ask the Cardinal to help the Carmelites obtain a central location for a rectory in this vast territory. Southwell seems to have had a site in mind.<sup>163</sup>

At the end of that July, 1911, Southwell was back in Dublin and assessing the results of his American trip. He had to leave Magennis behind because he was working with the American province and their finances. Southwell had spent eleven weeks in giving missions and Hugh Devlin was his companion. The largest mission was four weeks in Philadelphia requiring four priests. He also had worked Holy Week and Easter. After expenses, Southwell returned to Ireland with £600. This amount barely covered the current debts.

The main business of the letter was finances. Citing that Paul O'Dwyer was not quite offensive and had obeyed to some extent the decrees of the last visitation, Southwell launched forth into what could be called the crisis of 1911.

Southwell said there were some irregularities in the 28th Street parish that would have to be settled. He said of O'Dwyer, "He has kept the separate accounts for the Fathers and the parish but he has not separated the funds nor has he paid anything to the Provincial Fund since last year." Southwell then cited the net income for the fathers for the past two years as \$8,000. After

---

<sup>162</sup> Southwell to Mayer, Dublin, Jan 24, 1911, CG, Hib(1906-21) .

<sup>163</sup> Same to same, Tarrytown, Feb 24, 1911, CG, Hib(1906-21).

making allowances for what had been sent to Tarrytown for debt liquidation, Southwell wrote in the visitation book that \$65,000 or £13,000 was owed to the Carmelites from the parish. This amount, he calculated, would clear the Terenure debt. O'Dwyer, he felt, was bluffing since he felt safe as long as he maintained friendship with Magennis.

Southwell obviously was trying to strip whatever he could from the American houses to liquidate the long standing debts of the province. This money was to come mainly from New York but as long as O'Dwyer refused to pay, the debts would remain. Magennis was involved because one of the features of his life was to encourage the recruiting and education of students for the order. This would not be done as long as the three houses in the United States were part of the Irish Province. Magennis felt from the time of his ordination in 1894 that the Irish Province was not doing well for its students. He felt observance was not good and more work could be done. He may have told O'Dwyer to resist or encouraged him in his resistance. Supporting this hypothesis are subsequent acts of Magennis making the American houses separate from the Irish Province,

Added to the money problem in New York was the fact that when pastor, Southwell had made allowances in his chancery reports for the money due the Carmelites. O'Dwyer had ceased this and there was real danger that with no record of what was owed, the Carmelites would never be able to collect the amount due the order. Southwell expected a lot of trouble from O'Dwyer when he would have him do what O'Dwyer did not want. O'Dwyer, was in Southwell's opinion, not popular with the priests in America and had lost friends among the laity due to his rude ways. Concerning other matters in New York, he reported, "As for meditation & D. Office, they have been practically abolished for some months." To have visitation in Ireland and then a definitory meeting to see what steps he would take with O'Dwyer was the strategy of Southwell.<sup>164</sup>

As spring faded into summer, the problem with O'Dwyer still seethed in Southwell. O'Dwyer apparently had been in Ireland that summer because Southwell mentions he was at Mount Mellera for a retreat and was expected back at Knocktopher but had not yet returned there. Southwell seemed to be looking to sit down with O'Dwyer and lay the law down to him.<sup>165</sup>

While Southwell was waiting for O'Dwyer to return to Knocktopher, O'Dwyer finished his holidays and returned to New York. From there he wrote Mayer that August 18 a rather friendly and newsy letter. He mentioned that Magennis had left, cited how hard he had worked and how many friends he had made. He mentioned that Dion Best was pleased with all Magennis had done for them and suggested, "I am afraid that they want to steal him." He mentioned how fierce the heat was and the forty pounds Christopher Slattery had gained.<sup>166</sup>

---

<sup>164</sup> Same to same, Dublin, July 30, 1911, CG, Hib(1906-21); Visitation Book, 28th Street (1894-1912) 12, ANYP.

<sup>165</sup> Southwell to Mayer, Dublin, Aug 16, 1911, CG, Hib(1906-21).

<sup>166</sup> O'Dwyer to Mayer, New York, Aug 18, 1911, CG, Generali 2.

That fall, Southwell was still brewing over the money. "I find my ears getting hot so that I feel I am an awful bad man for compelling the Prior of New York to help our Novitiate - When these things happen I conclude I am doing some good somewhere on earth."<sup>167</sup>

Southwell finally held a definitory meeting on November 13, 1911. It resulted in a four point decree on the New York situation. The income of the Carmelites in a parish was to be kept separate and in a different account from parochial funds. In a house like New York, where money was owed the Carmelites and account of this was not made in the reports sent in to the archdiocese, the money had to be paid gradually to the order. This was to be done each year by taking a certain sum from parish funds besides the regular salaries of the fathers. This amount owed the order for past salaries should be included in the parochial debt.

Southwell's estimate of the debt to the Carmelites as \$65,000 was accepted and it was decreed that the normal \$4,000 in salaries be paid each year and an additional \$4,000 be paid until the \$65,000 was totally paid. Stating decrees of past chapters, a definitory meeting and the order's constitutions, New York was to pay £1,000 to Terenure before the end of 1911. This was part of the 2,500 tax levied on New York for Terenure by the definitory in November, 1909.

The document is rather well written and couched in a direct and clear style.<sup>168</sup>

O'Dwyer responded to the decree by writing to the secretary of the definitory, Thomas Dillon. He told Dillon he had received the report of the meeting as well as an order from Southwell in virtue of holy obedience to send £1000 sterling before the end of the year. This was the final decree of the meeting cited above. Then O'Dwyer mentioned he had received an order under penalty of suspension ipso facto if he did not send \$1,742.16 within twenty-four hours. He then told Dillon he was happy because he had now occasion to let people know how the other side felt. He mentioned he had never refused to pay taxes even though there was a debt of \$87,000 in his parish. O'Dwyer went on to mention that he sent as many Masses as he could. Then he answered each of the decrees in turn.

O'Dwyer stated the accounts were never separated until his time. He claimed he kept separate accounts and it was on the basis of his own accounts that Southwell arrived at his figures. O'Dwyer cited the 1910 savings as \$4,288.99 and for some reason felt \$4,000 of this was what Southwell was talking about as being due. So he asked Dillon what about the \$288.99?

It is better here to quote O'Dwyer, as much can be read between his lines:

---

<sup>167</sup> Southwell to Mayer, Dublin, Oct 26, 1911, CG, Hib (1906-21).

<sup>168</sup> Definitory minutes, Nov 13, 1911, sent in Southwell to Mayer, Dublin, Dec 15, 1911, AO, II Hib 4.

"In report of Visitation held here last June (1911) it is stated or rather written in the Provincial's handwriting that about \$19,000 was due to this convent by the Tarrytown convent. Now what do I find in a statement made by Fr. Southwell to Provincial Chapter May 7, 1906 that "Due to Fathers by Tarrytown convent \$21,000" and that was five years ago. Tarrytown has neither paid interest or principal since that time. What has become of the \$2,000? In the same report is found in Fr. Southwell's handwriting for Prov. Chap. May 7, 1906 that the amount due by the parish to the Fathers was about \$23,000.

"Taking this \$23,000 was correct, then by suggested way of calculation namely \$4,000 yearly, the sum for five years (1906-1911) would be \$20,000 making a total of \$43,000 due to the Fathers but Fr. Southwell stated at last visitation that the amount due to the Fathers was \$65,000 + \$19,000 due by Tarrytown making full total of \$84,000."

Then O'Dwyer went on to say that he had two laymen, the cardinal archbishop, the vicar general and himself as trustees. With an obligation to send in a financial report each year, signed by himself and the two laymen, O'Dwyer stated that he would not falsify such a report nor ask laymen to sign a false report.

O'Dwyer thought that if he placed before the cardinal the amount owed the Carmelites, \$65,000, he would have to produce his books. He mused what the cardinal would think when he saw \$23,000 was owed the fathers in 1906 and this in Southwell's own hand.

Concerning the levy placed on him for Terenure, O'Dwyer said his copy of the definitive meeting of November, 1909 listed the levy of New York as £300 yearly. Finally, he asked Dillon to have the definitors read this statement of his.<sup>169</sup> O'Dwyer also sent Dillon a witnessed copy of Southwell's statement dated May 7, 1906, listing the amount owed as \$23,000 for New York and \$21,000 for Tarrytown. William Brennan was the witness, "This is an exact copy."<sup>170</sup>

The day after he wrote to Dillon, O'Dwyer sent a letter to Southwell telling him what he wrote to Dillon and protested it would be impossible for him to raise the \$5,000 or £1000 within one month. Because this obligation was laid upon him in virtue of obedience, O'Dwyer said he was appealing to the general.<sup>171</sup>

---

<sup>169</sup> O'Dwyer to Dillon, New York, Dec 5, 1911, copy, AO, II Hib 4.

<sup>170</sup> Statement, P. O'Dwyer and W. Brennan, AO, II Hib 4.

<sup>171</sup> O'Dwyer to Southwell, New York, Dec 6, 1911, copy, AO, II Hib 4.

Appeal, O'Dwyer did. He sent on to Rome a packet containing these copies: his letter to Dillon, Southwell's 1906 visitation estimates, his December 6 letter to Southwell, the definitory minutes of November, 1909 and November 13, 1911.<sup>172</sup>

Southwell was not long springing into action. As soon as he received O'Dwyer's letter announcing his appeal, he wrote Mayer sending a copy of the definitory decree of November 13, 1911. He bemoaned to the general the terrible injustice being done to the order at 28th Street by not receiving salaries each year. Southwell admitted he participated in this by not paying the salaries in full but protested that he had added the unpaid amount to the debt each year in his report to the chancery office. In this way, there would be a record in case of disturbance and he had intended to withdraw the money from regular funds when they became available.

Southwell admitted he should have put the fathers earnings into a separate account and stated this was his intention and the definitory's. He said that in the May, 1911 visitation, he had told O'Dwyer how to take \$4,000 from the parish funds each year and thus begin to pay the Carmelites the salaries owed them. This he refused to do because, Southwell judged, he wanted to make a big impression with the chancery office by paying off a large amount of the parish debt each year.

Southwell denied O'Dwyer could not obtain the \$5,000 within a month. He said it was in the Lincoln Bank and could be gotten in a day by draft and sent to Ireland. Southwell also said O'Dwyer had been bragging he made \$12,000 at his fair. This Southwell hinted could be drawn on as well. He concluded by making the matter an authority crisis between O'Dwyer and the definitory. He called on Mayer to back up their command.<sup>173</sup>

Having made a successful trip to the United States for missions in 1911, Southwell planned to do the same in 1912. He was planning to leave in January.<sup>174</sup> Dion Best of the American province had too many missions for his own men and appealed to Southwell who told the general he would do his best but could not help as much as Best thought. He had sent Best his schedule and together they would figure out a solution to this problem.

Complications were also presented by the fact Southwell booked with two New York pastors for the five weeks of Lent thinking that Magennis was going to be with him as he had done missions in the previous year. So he requested this of the general.<sup>175</sup> Southwell must have heard rumors

---

<sup>172</sup> All in AO, II Hib 4.

<sup>173</sup> Southwell to Mayer, New York, Dec 15, 1911, AO, II Hib 4.

<sup>174</sup> Same to same, Dublin, Nov 23, 1911, GGr, Hib (1906-21) .

<sup>175</sup> Same to same, Dublin, Dec 3, 1911, CG, Hib(1906-21).

that Magennis would not be coming for he wrote Mayer not quite two weeks later begging for Magennis. "He has been so to speak our bow-oar," was the way he described him. He conceded he was away from Rome a long time but cited the work he did for the funds of the province and also for the "American Province," meaning the work he did with Dion Best.<sup>176</sup>

Anastasius Ronci, procurator general, died at San Alberto's on June 22, 1911.<sup>177</sup> That fall, Southwell sent Brocard Taylor and Charles Ronayne to Rome for theological studies. Ronayne had just received his MA in philosophy with honors. Louis Gerhardt had received his BA and Southwell was sending him to Miltown Park for theology.<sup>178</sup>

Southwell had a candidate for the novitiate, what he called "a really holy man." His name was Garvey and was in the Rochester, N.Y. diocese. Here, all trace of the man ends.<sup>179</sup>

Southwell wrote Mayer from Dublin early in January to complain of a recent letter concerning the finances of the 28th Street parish. The fact that Elias Magennis had to remain in Rome until after Lent left him in a tough spot trying to cover all the missions already contracted for. He stated "but your letter concerning the finances of the New York Convent and the resolutions of the Definitory knocked me out completely - was much shocked to hear for the first time that the order has no claim even in justice to the money sunk in the New York parish because of the Baltimore Decrees." Southwell said he was not inclined to argue Canon Law but "some very learned Jesuits who have been professors in Divinity for years in America don't agree with your interpretation of the law as applied in our case." Mayer backed up O'Dwyer in the money controversy and this threw Southwell completely.

Getting to the actual culprit in the case, Southwell said that Paul O'Dwyer was complaining of the \$4,000 a year payment for the old debt due the Fathers by the parish and was stating his inability to pay the \$5,000 year tax for Terenure to liquidate the debt on that house. Southwell and the definitory were both willing to reduce the amount of both, if asked, but instead they received from O'Dwyer "a long rigmarole" about errors in estimates and other matters about Southwell's priorship in New York. All this Southwell considered irrelevant. Then he stated the problem:

"As far as he [O'Dwyer] is concerned we have been left in ignorance whether he obeyed a simple item of our strict injunctions - and taking the

---

<sup>176</sup> Same to same, Dublin, Dec 14, 1911, CG, Hib(1906-21).

<sup>177</sup> Analecta Ordinis Carmelitarum 11(1911-3) 223.

<sup>178</sup> Southwell to Mayer, Dublin, Oct 26, 1911, QG, Hib(1906-21).

<sup>179</sup> Southwell to Mayer, Dublin, Nov 3, 1911, CG, Hib(1906-21).

laws as interpreted by your paternity we will have to look somewhere for the responsibility of the net-earnings of our Community in New York not only for last year but also for 1910. As I gave Fr. O'D strict orders in Visitation Decrees written Book regarding this matter June 1910 and June 1911"

He promised not to trouble Mayer any more on this issue but stated in the next sentence he desired to speak to him about it. He also wondered what to do with the house at Ardavan, he had to get a substitute for Magennis on the missions and there was a court case pending in Ireland. He wanted to see Mayer in Rome on February 1, before he went to the United States as he wanted his instructions clear. As Southwell put it, "I fear my authority there at present is much weakened."<sup>180</sup>

Probably because of the dispute in 28th Street, a number of financial reports had to be sent to Rome. These give us a picture of conditions and something of the life of the Carmelites in the three American houses at that time.

The 28th Street report covers June 1, 1911 to October 1, 1912, a period of almost a year and a half. The debt to the Emigrant Bank was listed as \$72,000. Then there is a general statement, a "Fathers Private Account," house accounts and "Church and School Receipts and expenditures." Part of the controversy was over the fact that there was but one bank account. If this is true, it would explain why these different sections of the report do not work out properly when joined together. The breakdown seems to have been made within the one account for the purpose of forming three reports.

The income of the church and school was given as \$58,303.59 and the expenses as \$47,936.94. The net of the fair was \$14,266.60 and \$15,000 had been paid on the mortgage. \$1,742.17 was given as novitiate and province expenses so there seems to have been a contribution made.

The comments of either a visitor or someone in Rome written in Italian on the report are of interest. "Living expenses are extravagant" is one such and in support of such a conclusion, the following are listed:

"5-6 Frs cost \$14,502 in 16 mos. \$906.37 per month

Cigars & Tobacco = \$425'without cigarettes

Whiskey Wine = 728

700

\$1853 in 16 months

---

<sup>180</sup> Same to same, Jan 20, 1912, CG, Hib(1906-21).

116 in 1 month."<sup>181</sup>

The financial report of Tarrytown covers a much longer period, from June 1, 1909 to November 1, 1912. During these forty-one months, the \$7,843.76 debt on the convent was liquidated and the \$39,000 on the church was reduced to \$31,500 with \$6,355 having been paid in interest, the rate varying between 5% and 6%.

Elmsford was included in the Tarrytown report and only the debt on the mission church was listed. It was:

1909	-	\$7,057.65
1910	-	6,996.25
1911	-	7,776.25
1912	-	6,500.00

The rise in 1911 was explained by Dennis O'Connor as being due to the purchase of two lots.<sup>182</sup>

Dionysius Flanagan, in his first year at Otisville, was able to have a financial report totaling well over \$7,000. He ended that year of 1912 with a little over \$700 in banks. He paid over \$2,000 on the hall he had built, paid the rent for his residence and to balance things out listed 68\$ as "error". Entertainments were held in Otisville and also in the two missions of Bloomingburg and Bullville.<sup>183</sup>

In the midst of 1913, the financial report of the American convents showed a net debt in 28th Street of \$76,025.14. Tarrytown's was \$29,000 and Middletown where the Otisville parish was now attached along with the other missions, had a total debt of \$17,000. The report shows almost no assets and seems to have been drawn up to impress the reader with the amount of debts yet to be paid. Possibly this works in with the actions of Southwell in the 28th Street parish finances.<sup>184</sup>

Around the time of the O'Dwyer crisis in New York, Southwell was also involved in another pressing matter. There seems to have been an affair between one of the Carmelites and a girl.

---

<sup>181</sup> Financial Statement for Period, June 1, 1911 - Oct 1, 1912, CG Am Sti Eliae, BTMNY.

<sup>182</sup> Financial Report, Tarrytown, June 1, 1909 - Noy 1, 1912, CG, Am Sti Eliae, BTMNY.

<sup>183</sup> Otisville, Financial Report, 1912, ANYP.

<sup>184</sup> "Financial Statement of the American Convents of the Irish Province," July 1, 1913, ANYP.



The parents seem to have placed the girl in an institution run by nuns with the instruction that she not be let out of their charge "with anyone except certain persons mentioned by parents." She seems to have been let out in the care of this Carmelite and a breach of contract suit against the nuns followed. The Carmelite was sent to the United States while a lawyer was trying to have the whole matter quashed. Southwell hoped he would be successful for if it came to court, "there will be a most sustained scandal." It would also be, he felt, a matter of how much money the Carmelites could come up with.<sup>185</sup>

Writing from Tarrytown in April, 1912, Southwell expressed sorrow to the general that the Sacred Congregation of Religious had instituted an inquiry into the state of the order. He hoped the Irish province was not the cause of such and stated the province was living the constitutions. He thought this could be demonstrated by what was done for the novices and students. Regular observance was in every house except New York and Southwell took the occasion to lash out at O'Dwyer to whom, through the intervention of Mayer, he had lost the battle of the 28th Street funds.

Rose Keenan left money in a will and when asked by Southwell about it, McCabe thought that since it was not in the weekly cash book, he must have used the money to reduce some of the debt at the Lincoln Bank. Southwell wanted the money but could not get it from O'Dwyer, McCabe's successor. \$3,000 in Masses was also involved in legacies and Southwell saw O'Dwyer standing in the way of distribution of these funds. He did not want to use obedience but determined to settle the matter before he left for Ireland in May. Southwell also brought up a \$500 donation given eight years before for the education of a young man for the priesthood. This, the Carmelites never saw and now he wanted it from O'Dwyer.

Southwell resurrected these cases to embarrass Mayer since he had backed up O'Dwyer in the financial imbroglio. Surely, Mayer must have consulted Magennis in this. Both probably had the independence of the American houses in mind. In any case, Southwell is still out to get O'Dwyer.<sup>186</sup>

Elias Magennis had a large role in the foundation of the New York Carmelites. While he was assistant general (1908-19), Magennis had many occasions to visit and remain in the United States. One example of the latter was during the first World War when difficulty of travel kept him in the United States for most of the hostilities. Preaching missions in parish churches, doing visitations of various American convents and the Irish freedom movement are other matters that kept Magennis in the United States for long periods of time.

---

<sup>185</sup> Southwell to Mayer, Jan 20, 1912, CG, Hib(1906-21).

<sup>186</sup> Same to same, Tarrytown, Apr 5, 1912, CG, Hib(1906-21).

Because he was in the New York area, while this province was in its formative stages, Magennis was able to exert a large influence on it. His insistence on observance and his push for vocations characterized the New York Carmelites in their early days. They have, like it or not, the character of Elias Magennis. Mel Daly, one of the first native vocations of the province, recalled how he and his companions in Rome were part of Magennis' urge to build up the future province. Mel and his fellow students there had to obtain degrees in Rome and when they returned to the United States, worked five days a week, went to school at Fordham University on Saturday and did a priest's work on Sunday. This, he attributed to the drive of Magennis.<sup>187</sup>

It is interesting that one of the founders of the New York province is the recipient of a story of how Elias Magennis obtained his vocation. Lawrence Flanagan, while he was a student at Terenure College, heard Magennis tell his dream of a line of white robed priests marching in procession. When the Carmelites garbed in their white cloaks came to his home town of Tandragee to preach a mission, he recognized them as the subjects in his dream. He understood this as a sign he should join that order. The fact that Galli was one of the men in the line beckoning him to come join them seems to have assumed a much larger significance when Elias Magennis was elected general in 1919.<sup>188</sup>

---

<sup>187</sup> O'Dwyer, *A True Patriot*, op. cit., *passim*; Daly to author, Trumbull, June, 1976.

<sup>188</sup> Mss. ANYP; Flanagan to Alice (?),

## CHAPTER V

### Odds and Ends of Daily Life

Pius Mayer was re-elected general at the chapter of 1908. On June 26, 1912, he resigned for reasons of health and took up official residence at St. Cecilia's, Englewood, N.J. Joseph Llovera, who had been elected procurator general on June 27, 1911 after the death of Ronci, was made vicar general. On April 20, 1913, John Lorenzoni assumed this position and fulfilled it until the chapter held in the fall of 1919.<sup>189</sup>

Louis McCabe went to Australia in 1909 under a three year obedience which had expired in April, 1912, as chapters had usually been held in Ireland during Easter Week. McCabe left Australia April 16 and was headed for Ireland via the United States. Southwell was furious. He claimed he had extended the obedience or at least cancelled the time element in it. Southwell said McCabe was not there three years even counting from the time of the chapter. He took McCabe's trip as defiance and asked for Mayer's help. He even said he would have to remain in the United States until this matter was settled.

It seems as though Southwell was looking for an excuse to tarry in America and that the travel plans of McCabe, which were done with the permission of Kindellan, the vicar provincial in Australia, were in no way a serious kind of violation of obedience.<sup>190</sup>

William Brennan sent two letters to Mayer on March 1, 1912. In one, he just wished the general well and expressed the hope of seeing him in New York. In the other, he explained to the general that when Leybourne had died on August 17, 1911, he should have been selected to fill Leybourne's position as definitor since he had the next closest number of votes at the chapter. Brennan enclosed letters of Southwell which contradicted his opinion and stated he was appealing because he had been deprived of a just right. Brennan also added he had the canonical age of thirty at the time.<sup>191</sup>

The two letters of Southwell Brennan enclosed stated Southwell's version of events. When he had called the definitory together in November, 1911, Southwell said he summoned Magannety - another runner-up to Leybourne - because Brennan was too far away at the time. He never

---

<sup>189</sup> Analecta Ordinis Carmelitarum 11(1911-3)417-8, 477-8, 609-10.

<sup>190</sup> Southwell to Mayer, [New York], June 25, 1912, CG, Hib (1906-21).

<sup>191</sup> Brennan to Mayer, New York, Mar 1, 1912, CG, Hib(1906-21).

intended to interfere with anyone's rights. The following February's letter of Southwell claimed that Brennan was not of the canonical age and suggested that Brennan write the general.<sup>192</sup>

The whole matter resulted from the chapter of 1909 when in the one ballot for all definitors, Staples had fourteen votes and four others, including Brennan, had thirteen votes.<sup>193</sup> Thus Brennan, the junior in seniority, did not receive any of the four definitory posts but, in accordance with the rules of those days, was the first in line should one of the definitory spots become vacant before the next chapter. This happened when Leybourne died. As with many problems brought to Mayer's attention, nothing was done.

Peter Nolan, at Moate, wrote to Joseph Butler in Dublin to have him try to gain admission to the hospital for a friend of Nolan. Nolan reported he had a letter from Patrick Donegan who told him the man involved in the court case Southwell feared would come about had been shunted off to New York. He also had heard Maher was "shot to Adelaide" and wondered if Southwell had left either for Rome or New York as both trips were forthcoming at the time.<sup>194</sup>

Dominic Hastings wrote to the general in 1912 to ask for permission to transfer to a diocese. He felt he should have written to Elias Magennis but knew he was not at Rome and so wrote the general directly. Stating he had been ordained five years and had spent three in Australia, he found himself for many and serious reasons not called to the Carmelites. He had spoken to Southwell who was in the United States at the time of his writing. Hastings hoped for a favorable reply.<sup>195</sup> None is extant.

In June, 1912, with the chapter scheduled to begin that July 29, Southwell wrote Mayer it did not appear the chapter could be held on that date. He proposed to Mayer that it be transferred to the following year. As reasons, Southwell cited difficulties in Rome - the only one we know of is the inquiry of the Sacred Congregation of Religious -and serious business he had in New York. Southwell actually suggested that the chapter be held in July, 1913, when everything would be ready.<sup>196</sup>

Mayer resigned the day after Southwell wrote his letter and Rome initiated a process of gathering opinions concerning people suitable for office.

---

<sup>192</sup> Southwell to Brennan, Dublin, Dec 15, 1911, Feb 17, 1912 copies in Brennan's hand, CG, Hib (1906-21).

<sup>193</sup> Acta Capituli Provincialis, 1909, CG, Hib, Capit et Cong (1900-64).

<sup>194</sup> Nolan to Butler, Moate, Jan 24, 1912, AIP, found loose in Butler's diary.

<sup>195</sup> Hastings to Mayer, Dublin, [1912] CG, Hib(1906-21).

<sup>196</sup> Southwell to Mayer, New York, June 25, 1912, CG, Hib(1906-21).

While these were being collected, Llovera on July 18, 1912, appointed Southwell provincial for an additional year and presumably extended the terms of all other officials for the same time.<sup>197</sup>

Christopher Slattery wrote Llovera beginning with the question, "Remember me, Luigi Slattery, when I was in Rome?" After wishing him well, Slattery praised the work of Magennis in the 28th Street parish and for the troubles in Ireland but what Slattery referred to were within the order and possibly those of Ireland facing the problem of the Home Rule Bill.

Slattery suggested the general cancel the Irish chapter and make appointments himself. He saw a chapter as doing no good and saw few capable of office. Magennis, he saw as the man to be provincial because he alone, Slattery felt, could lead the province in those difficult days.<sup>198</sup> We have no way of estimating the problems inferred as no records relating to them are extant.

The postponement of the chapter gave a problem to Patrick Carr. He had fulfilled his three years as prior in Knocktopher, was seventy-eight years old and wanted to be relieved. Southwell refused to accept his resignation and Bartley, taking Southwell's place while he was away, would also not accept.<sup>199</sup>

By December, 1912, Southwell was back in Ireland and wrote Llovera. He told him the missions had gone well producing much spiritual good and income for the province.

Otisville, he told Llovera was very inconvenient and did not have a suitable dwelling for the men. So he obtained from Farley permission to have a dwelling in Middletown. It was a difficulty finding a site but it had been accomplished. He cited the parish as being in the midst of that city of 20,000. Southwell had assigned Colfer to Otisville and Middletown replacing a younger man whom Southwell thought imprudent.

Southwell thought that because of his Lenten missions, June, 1913, would be a good time for Llovera's visitation of Ireland. The chapter could be celebrated after that. He did want a chapter because he felt that without a chapter in some form, there would be much murmuring. Magennis had advised him not to get involved in this question and so he told Llovera that whatever he decided would please him. He did, of course, send nineteen Masses to Llovera.<sup>200</sup>

Just over a week later, Southwell wrote Llovera again to say that he would place in his hands himself and the office of provincial provided there would be nominations by the superiors,

---

<sup>197</sup> CG, Hib, Capit et Cong, 1900-64.

<sup>198</sup> Slattery to Llovera, New York, Zfug, 1911J7/ CG, Hib(1906-21).

<sup>199</sup> Bartley to Carr, Dublin, Aug 17, 1912; Carr to Llovera, Knocktopher, Aug 18, 1912, CG, Hib(1906-21).

<sup>200</sup> Southwell to Llovera, Dublin, Dec 5, 1912, CG, Hib(1906-21).

especially those in the United States. Once nominations were made, Southwell would prefer to see Llovera make appointments without a chapter. As long as this procedure was followed, Southwell offered to be provincial again even though at times, the obligations of the office disturbed him. He also used the occasion to offer sending medical testimony for a petition of Peter Nolan for some dispensation or commutation should the testimony be needed.<sup>201</sup>

With the possibility of a chapter looming in 1913, Dionysius Flanagan and Denis O'Connor, both in Tarrytown, wrote to Llovera. They both made the same general complaint; the wrong men are elected to office. Parties exist; men act and vote out of loyalty to the party rather than loyalty to the order. Flanagan called the effects "lamentable." Both wanted the general to abolish elections and make appointments himself. As Flanagan put it, "appoint the respectable men from all parties to office without any election." The list each submitted is the same with one exception, each put the other down for the prior of Tarrytown. Magennis was their choice for provincial, Southwell the 28th Street prior and Colfer the Middletown prior. Both felt observance would exist with these men in office. O'Connor begged the general to consider this suggestion carefully "as we have arrived at a very critical time in the order here in America."<sup>202</sup>

Paul O'Dwyer was not on Elias Magennis' team. He now felt that Magennis had been talking about his administration of the parish and wrote the general to give his side. Magennis had made a visitation of the 28th Street house and O'Dwyer argued it was not canonical in that Magennis had not read his authorization, did not follow the ritual and never closed the visitation. During this visit, Magennis spoke publicly against O'Dwyer concerning finances and observance. O'Dwyer felt that this was not very considerate of him as he was the senior priest residing in the house. When he challenged Magennis in public for proof of his charges, no answer was given.

O'Dwyer, on the contrary, contended that he arrived at 28th Street and found no discipline present and was responsible for instilling it. He mentioned the difficulty of work in the hospital and the paucity of laborers. The house discipline he ranked as the best in the province excepting the novitiate. He added, "Apud Tarrytownensis milla disciplina floret."

Stating Magennis had caused discord, O'Dwyer felt that prudence, justice and charity were due the men of his community. The manner of Magennis had not pleased Cardinal Farley. The cardinal had told O'Dwyer that Magennis was vehement and not prudent. O'Dwyer complained Magennis had special friends among the Carmelites. These could do no wrong and because they were alienated from O'Dwyer, he said of himself "proinde niger sum." He concluded somewhat

---

<sup>201</sup> Same to same, Dublin, Dec 14, 1912, CG, Hib(1906-21).

<sup>202</sup> Flanagan to Llovera, Tarrytown, Jan 4, 1913; O'Connor to Llovera, Tarrytown, Jan 4, 1913, both in CG, Hib (1906-21).

emotionally, "How much more do I have to write? Have I not done right already? God is my judge."<sup>203</sup>

Elias Magennis had arrived in the United States in March, 1911, to preach missions during the winter, spring and summer. Southwell had obtained permission from the general for this in 1910. Magennis spent three weeks at Holy Cross, Manhattan, one week in Poughkeepsie, four in Philadelphia along with three other Carmelites and one week in Tarrytown along with another Carmelite. At Mount Carmel, Middletown, he spent two weeks giving a mission and stayed there for Holy Week and Easter. Magennis also worked with the American province concerning their finances and was able to leave the United States on August 17.

The next year, he was present for the chapter of the American province and visited New York. In 1914, he preached at Dion Best's funeral and gave Lenten missions. One of these churches, Saint Anthony of Padua in Brooklyn wanted Magennis to return the next year. The missions were so numerous in 1914 that he did not finish them until November 23. This left him only one month until the next season would begin. He seems to have spent 1915 in the United States and for almost all of the time until his election as general in 1919 he was in the United States. There was however, one or two trips to Europe during this period.<sup>204</sup>

Some idea of the work involved in these missions can be seen from the journal left behind by Berchmans Devlin, brother of Hugh and a veteran of five mission seasons in the United States. Magennis was his companion on some of these jobs.

In 1914, Devlin spent seven weeks giving three missions in April and May. In the four weeks spent at Saint Anthony of Padua, Brooklyn, Devlin himself heard 2172 confessions. There were six missions in 1915 going from February to the end of May. That year he made the notation in his journal that every mission had baptisms connected with it. Some others had to receive instruction from the locals and be baptized later on. Devlin gave some single sermons in June and then seems to have ended the season.

Ten weeks were spent in 1916 with two of the missions being in Philadelphia. The total confession count at Saint Anthony's, Brooklyn, that year was 6,000.

Devlin went out again in 1917 and this season extended from the end of February until the end of May. In June, he preached a number of single sermons in 28th Street.

---

<sup>203</sup> O'Dwyer to Llovera, New York, Jan 20, 1913, CG, General 2.

<sup>204</sup> Southwell to Mayer, New York, July 30, 1911, CG, Hib (1906-21); Magennis to Lorenzoni, Brooklyn, Summer, £&§J, CG, Generali 2; O'Dwyer, A True Patriot, op. cit., 7-10; Vestigium VI, no 1, 42; Paul Feeley, "A Second Elias," Vox Eliae (1950)34-9.

It was not to be until 1930 that Devlin would come again to the United States to preach. He was then present from May through August to give retreats and novenas. That year he preached a five day retreat at Saint Albert's in July and a nine day one at Niagara Falls in August.<sup>205</sup>

The curia in Rome, having received the opinions of the gremiales and other members of the province, made appointments for a three year term in 1913 without a chapter. John of the Cross Cogan was made provincial, Southwell the prior of New York, O'Connor Tarrytown and Colfer Middletown. Louis McCabe was made the prior of Whitefriars Street.<sup>206</sup>

As a result then of these appointments, Edward Southwell was again the prior of 28th Street. Indeed, the post of pastor was separate from that of prior but in the concept of authority existing at that time, the office of prior was supreme. Christopher Slattery seems to have been made pastor in 1913.<sup>207</sup> It did not take Southwell long to arrive at his old post. He was present there for the school graduation in the latter part of June.<sup>208</sup>

The fall after his appointment, John of the Cross Cogan came to New York to schedule missions and retreats.<sup>209</sup> Cogan was in New York again in 1915, arriving on April 28. This was cited as his annual visit and made to appear as the canonical inspection enjoined on him as provincial.<sup>210</sup>

Cogan wrote to the general, John Lorenzoni, in March, 1914, looking for Elias Magennis to do missions in the United States during the Lent of 1915. He also requested four of his theologians be ordained at the end of their third year of theology so other fathers could be released for this mission work. Cogan cited in favor of his requests that the missions were the principal support for the novitiate.<sup>211</sup>

Towards the end of that year, Cogan wrote again. He had been turned down by Lorenzoni on the third year ordination but was given Magennis and then asked that he be allowed to leave on February 1. As a compromise on the turned down ordination request, Cogan asked the four be

---

<sup>205</sup> Diary of D. B. Devlin, AIP. No pagination or chronological order

<sup>206</sup> Analecta Ordinis Qarmelitarum 11(1911-3)604. The box CG, Hib, Capit et Cong (1900-64) has the chapter of 1909 and then that of 1916. No material of these 1913 appointments is there.

<sup>207</sup> Irish World (New York) June 21, 1913, 8 in Vestigium VI, no 1, 43-4,

<sup>208</sup> Catholic News (New York) July 5, 1913, 3 in Vestigium VI, no 1, 44.

<sup>209</sup> Irish World (New York) Oct 18, 1913, 8.

<sup>210</sup> Parish Bulletin (May, 1915) 5 in Vestigium VI, no 1, 45.

<sup>211</sup> Cogan to Lorenzoni, Terenure, Mar 9, 1914, CG, Hib(1906-21).



ordained in February and returned to Ireland so others could go out on the Lenten missions in America.<sup>212</sup>

In 1914, Dominic Hastings was still desirous of leaving the Carmelites and requested in 1914 he be given a year's living outside the order to seek a bishop who would accept him into his diocese. He wanted this because he felt unsuited to Carmelite life and desired to assist his parents who were in a "less comfortable financial position."<sup>213</sup>

December, 1914, was set as the 25th anniversary of the 28th Street parish. Preparations for the affair started early in the fall. Mentioned in them was the debt of the parish and the need for a convent for the Sisters of Mercy who had begun to teach in the parish school at its opening in 1904. To spur donations, gifts to this anniversary fund from Cardinal Farley and the Carmelite Fathers of \$500 each were mentioned.<sup>214</sup> Because a fair would have been difficult to run – possibly there were legal problems too – a sterling silver medal was struck and presented to everyone who contributed to the jubilee fund.<sup>215</sup>

The actual celebration took place on Sunday, December 13, with Archbishop John Bonzano, apostolic delegate to the United States presiding at the 11:00 A.M. Mass. Bishop Colton of Buffalo was the celebrant while local pastors formed the remainder of the ministry. Major religious superiors and the Carmelites from other houses as well as Stephen McDonald from Englewood were there. The sermon was preached by Bishop Cusack of New York and a choir of men and boys sang the Mass. There were vespers in the evening celebrated by the delegate and after a sermon by John O'Rourke, S.J., the delegate carried the Blessed Sacrament in procession through the church. There was a reception featuring speeches by local political leaders and a concert by members of the Carmelite Choral Society that Monday evening.<sup>216</sup> William Livingston, the pastor of neighboring St. Gabriel's wrote a poem about the Carmelites for this occasion.<sup>217</sup>

---

<sup>212</sup> Same to same, Terenure, Dec 30, 1914, CG, Hib(1906-21).

<sup>213</sup> Hastings to Lorenzoni, Mt. Melleray, Jan 12, 1914, CG, Hib(1906-21)

<sup>214</sup> Parish Bulletin (Sept, 1914)5, (Oct, 1914)6 in Vestigium VI, no 1, 48-50.

<sup>215</sup> Parish Bulletin (Dec, 1914)6 in Vestigium VI, no 1, 50-1. One medal is in ANYP.

<sup>216</sup> Catholic News- (New York) Dec 12, 1914, Dec 19, 1914 in Vestigium VI no 1, 51-4.

<sup>217</sup> Souvenir Program, Carmelite Bazaar, 1914, ANYP.

Elias Magennis was in the United States in the spring of 1915 and advantage was taken of his presence to have him deliver the commencement address of the Carmelite school on June 3.<sup>218</sup>

June 6, 1915, was the celebration of the golden jubilee of ordination of Edward Southwell. He was truly a link with the past, having been one of the founding fathers and except for his term as provincial, had spent those years since 1889 in New York or Tarrytown, which he had established as a mission of the city parish. A ceremony in which a crown of roses was placed on the jubilarian's head preceded the jubilee Mass. Christopher Slattery and Hugh Devlin as deacon and subdeacon were joined by John Cogan, assistant priest, as the ministry of the Mass. Berchmans Devlin was the master of ceremonies, Bishop Cusack presided and the clergy present were many. Elias Magennis, then assistant general, preached the sermon, a flowery and oratorical appreciation typical of the period.<sup>219</sup>

---

<sup>218</sup> Catholic News (New York) Apr 24, 1915, 18 in Vestigium VI, no 1, 45,

<sup>219</sup> Catholic News (New York) June 12, 1915 in Vestigium I, no 3, 6-10; Vestigium II, no 1, 15-6.

## CHAPTER VI

### Through the Great War and Into the Twenties

In September, 1915, there were rumors abroad that Elias Magennis had resigned as assistant general. Conceivably, his absence from Rome was a concern to Lorenzoni and he was anxious to have someone more present as his assistant. Possibly, Lorenzoni expressed this view. John Cogan was happy to receive the "assurances" of the general and at the time, there was nothing else to give assurances over except that Magennis had not resigned.<sup>220</sup>

About a month later, Cogan wrote to say he had asked Magennis if he had resigned as assistant general and Magennis told him yes. Taking the open office as a fact, Cogan proceeded to nominate Francis Ronayne as the next occupant. Stating that doctors had recommended a drier climate for the betterment of his hearing, that he had administrative ability, was zealous for religious observance and had aroused admiration when he took both the arts and science degrees at the university, Cogan pressed forward his name. Answering the possible objection of his youth, Cogan stated that though Ronayne was only thirty-two, he had wanted to be a doctor before he entered. This was apparently to be taken as a sign of maturity. Going on to say that the Irish province had great needs, Cogan felt Ronayne in the curia would represent these.<sup>221</sup>

Another month later, Cogan wrote Lorenzoni to express his sorrow over the misunderstanding that had arisen over the position of assistant general. Apparently Lorenzoni had told Cogan again that Magennis had not resigned. So Cogan suggested that Ronayne go to Australia where there was a need for him. He also wanted the general to tell Magennis not to return to Rome because of the danger of the journey due to submarine warfare. Magennis had only two months free between missions that were so productive of vitally needed funds and Cogan felt this was not time enough.

Magennis, meanwhile, could not see himself as being free in the United States to return to Rome for some time yet. He did not consider the time he had off between missions as enough to make this journey in. The general must have told him to return to Rome as he was planning to begin the trip around November 23 when the missions of the fall season would end. He had asked the provincial for a replacement in the mission work but this would take some time as the war caused mail to take a month.

---

<sup>220</sup> Cogan to Lorenzoni, Dublin, Sept 4, 1915, CG, Hib(1906-21).

<sup>221</sup> Same to same, Terenure, Oct 6, 1915, CG, Generali 2.

Magennis did submit his resignation. It had gone to the Congregation for Religious indicating the general refused it and Magennis made this appeal. They would not make a decision until Magennis returned to Rome but he felt what was the point of returning to Rome if they were going to accept his resignation.<sup>222</sup>

Probably because of the many men traveling to and from the Australian and American missions, the Irish province obtained an indult in 1915 for its members to offer Mass at sea.<sup>223</sup>

During this period, Magennis made some observations gleaned from his visitations in Australia and the United States. He thought a school for postulants and novices should be started at once at Tarrytown and as soon as possible in Australia. In the parishes, priors had a grave obligation to put the parochial salaries into the house accounts. Pastors, he felt, should assume no parochial debt without "consilio Prioris et Consiliariorum." Treasurers in America and Australia were to send quarterly reports to the provincial treasurer.<sup>224</sup>

With a novitiate ordered to be established by the Irish chapter of 1909, a search for funds was finally begun and one response was that of Cardinal Farley. He gave \$500 and also endorsed the idea of a novitiate, predicting it would attract subjects.<sup>225</sup>

William Brennan, Peter Nolan felt, was speaking against him even before lay people. This had gone so far that some of the fathers refused to work in Bellevue if Nolan worked there. Though he sympathized with Southwell, Nolan was no fan of his. Nolan appealed to the general and also asked that the judge in his case be Metcalf and not Magennis or Slattery.<sup>226</sup> Nothing seems to have come of this but Nolan did return to Ireland after the chapter of 1916.

The parish reunion of 1914 was held at the Murray Hill Lyceum.<sup>227</sup> The affair was considered a success and the 1915 venture had to be held at the Central Opera House which was also the site of a euchre entertainment that year. It was for the benefit of the parish school and though no figures are extant, the affair was considered a great success.<sup>228</sup>

---

<sup>222</sup> Magennis to Lorenzoni, New York, /Nov, 1911J7, CG, Generali 2.

<sup>223</sup> Analecta Ordinis Carmelitarum 111(1914-6) 321.

<sup>224</sup> Puncta, n.d., CG, Generali 2.

<sup>225</sup> Farley to "Southwell, New York, Apr 21, 1914, ANYP.

<sup>226</sup> Nolan to Lorenzoni, [New York], IV Kal. Sept, [1915] CG, Hib(1906-21).

<sup>227</sup> Parish Bulletin (Feb, 1914)5, (Mar, 1914)5 in Vestigium III, no 2, 16-7.

<sup>228</sup> Catholic News (New York) Sept 4, 1915, 16, Sept 18, 1915; Parish Bulletin (Sept, 1915)7, (Nov, 1915)5 in Vestigium III, no 2, 17-8.

The parish financial reports published in the Parish Bulletin for 1914 and 1915 were as follows:

	1914	1915
Gross Income	\$34,117.00	\$31,747.00
School Expenses	9,954.00	9,820.00
Church Expenses	17,502.00	18,086.00
Interest on Debt	3,240.00	3,240.00

It should be noted income was declining and no funds were put to the actual reduction of the debt. This would remain for many years more.<sup>229</sup>

1916 was chapter year in the Irish province. The last was held in 1909 and early that year John Cogan, the provincial, was intent in postponing the chapter. He brought to the general's attention that seven delegates were in the United States and three in Australia. Besides the travel difficulties, there was the expense involved.<sup>230</sup> The general seems to have requested a document composed by the definitory. With distance still on his mind, Cogan told him the presence of two definitors in America would make this difficult to obtain. He did take the occasion to request that Elias Magennis preside at the chapter which he asked to be opened on August 1st.<sup>231</sup>

Magennis did preside at the chapter which began in Dublin on July 30. Cogan was re-elected. The debt of Terenure was listed as £7982. Contributions to the novitiate were as follows: Tarrytown £400, New York £1800 and Middletown £820. The main business of the chapter was making provisions for aspirants in the United States. Magennis questioned both Cogan and Southwell on this point and they replied a shortage of money and men had prevented any action on their part. The chapter decided neither difficulty was possible of a solution at that time but did mention in its minutes, discussion of a novitiate or preparatory school at Tarrytown but no decision was arrived at. One of the decrees of the chapter was that a decree of the 1909 chapter concerning a school or novitiate at Tarrytown should be carried out. A vicar provincial for the United States and one for Australia was called for. Denis O'Connor was elected as definitory but resigned to assume the priorship of New York. Southwell was made prior of Tarrytown and Colfer remained in that position in Middletown.

---

<sup>229</sup> Parish Bulletin (Feb, 1914)6, (Feb, 1915)13 in Vestigium III, no 2, 19-20.

<sup>230</sup> Cogan to Lorenzoni, Terenure, Feb 22, 1916, CG, Hib(1906-21).

<sup>231</sup> Same to same, Terenure, Mar 22, 1916, CG, Hib(1906-21).

A "Missionary Band to America" was a subject raised by Magennis but he left it to the Irish superiors how it might best be done.<sup>232</sup>

The chapter of 1916 had made Joseph McCabe the Whitefriars Street prior and in the next year he began the construction of new priory. This was recorded by a contemporary, Romaeus McCaffrey, who published it in his Carmelite history ten years later, a book that would be the only English version of Carmelite history for many years<sup>233</sup>

Edward Southwell spoke to Cardinal Farley about his intentions for the Carmelites but the occasion was not too fitting for such business and the cardinal promised to write. Southwell, leaving nothing to chance, himself wrote to Farley reminding him of his promise. He also told him a declaration of what he had in store for the Carmelites was important in allaying discontent among the fathers and preventing misapprehension with the superiors in Dublin.

Before the Italian parish of Sacred Hearts was opened in 1914 on East 33rd Street a few blocks north of the Carmelite parish, the fathers had the opportunity to express their opinion to Monsignor Lavelle. They were not desirous of curtailing anything helpful to Italians but were themselves bound to maintain their own congregation, supporting a school of 800 pupils and other parish activities. Congregations, he told Farley, are affected by churches in the immediate area.

Southwell considered the Carmelite fathers discouraged and annoyed by reading in the newspapers there was to be another Italian parish, this time on the southern border of the parish, on East 24th Street. This he considered an ignoring of struggles to keep the parish alive. Southwell felt that if Farley was aware of the circumstances, he would not have allowed this second Italian parish "to be located practically within our parish which barely contains nine blocks."

On the top of his letter, there are two notations, "See F Lav ask him to notify FS -" meaning presumably a notation for Farley's secretary to see Father Lavelle and then notify Southwell of the decision Farley had made. That decision seems to be the other notation on the letter, "write him that no other parish will be given till a novitiate is set up."<sup>234</sup>

In the actual reply, Cardinal Farley promised the Carmelites and Southwell a new parish in the northern part of the city when the opportunity would arise but the offer is conditioned on the opening of a novitiate in the United States. Farley's letter ignores the entire point of Southwell's

---

<sup>232</sup> Acta Capituli Provincialis, Dublin, July 30, 1916, CG, Hib, Capit et Cong(1900-64); Analecta Ordinis Carmelitarum III(1914-6)472.

<sup>233</sup> R. McCaffrey, The White Friars (Dublin, 1926)443.

<sup>234</sup> Southwell to Farley, New York, June 9, 1916, DA, 1-23.

letter about the new Italian parish on East 24th Street.<sup>235</sup> This was built and opened under the title of St. Sebastian's.

Magennis arrived in Ireland from Rome early in 1917 and reported to Cogan that he and the general had discussed a residence for the Irish Carmelite students in Rome. Cogan felt that the whole province would agree to this as the meals in Rome and their times were disastrous for the Irish.<sup>236</sup>

On February 5, 1917, Edward Southwell wrote Bishop Hayes to apologize for missing his appointment with the Bishop that morning due to a snowstorm. Southwell mentioned he wanted to speak with the bishop about a collection in his parish of Saint Stephen's for the "Preparatory Novitiate" to be opened in Tarrytown. Southwell mentioned that in thirty years there had been no vocations despite the fact there were many applicants. They objected, he said, going "to Ireland for studies and turnip." Farley had encouraged the Carmelites by sending donations for the proposed institution, At the Irish chapter of 1916, a decision was made to build the novitiate in Tarrytown, attached to the church and priory. Southwell was deputed to carry this through. Besides Farley's gift, he had also received one from a woman he did not consider rich. Citing that the Carmelite parish had been broken off from Saint Stephen's, he brought out how this was the first such appeal in thirty years and that other pastors of the archdiocese would be affected by whatever action Hayes took.<sup>237</sup>

Declaring the Carmelites had no better friend than he, Bishop Hayes told of the many appeals he already had in his church. He said he would give a collection in the fall. To him it was not a matter of whether but when.<sup>238</sup>

For the twentieth anniversary of the Tarrytown parish, Edward Southwell planned a large celebration. He asked for generous donations on this occasion. The debt he mentioned as being \$23,000 and the payment each year was more than \$2,000. He was optimistic though since the land and the church had cost \$60,000 and at that time, many had been gloomy at the prospect of such a debt but, as he put it, God came through.<sup>239</sup>

Southwell's old nemesis, Michael O'Grady, appeared again. Paul O'Dwyer asked to accompany O'Grady who was being sent to Italy. Cogan, the provincial, recommended the general give this

---

<sup>235</sup> Farley to Southwell, New York, June 17, 1916, DA, 1-23.

<sup>236</sup> Cogan to Lorenzoni, Dublin, Jan 28, 1917, CG, Hib(1906-21).

<sup>237</sup> Southwell to Hayes, Tarrytown, Feb 5, 1917, DA, 0-4.

<sup>238</sup> Hayes to Southwell, New York, Feb 12, 1917, DA, 0-4.

<sup>239</sup> Southwell to parishoners, Tarrytown, July 12, 1917, ANYP.

permission.<sup>240</sup> Cogan had a soft spot for O'Grady. Cogan recalled he had been much trouble in the United States and would send him to Ghent for recuperation but the war ruled this out. So with the permission received, he sent him to Italy with O'Dwyer as a companion and recommended to the general that he be placed in Nocera or some similar house.<sup>241</sup> The honeymoon of Cogan and O'Grady was over by that fall. No prior would take him and Cogan had given him three canonical warnings and thought the best solution was to expell him from the order. With this in mind, Cogan told the general that he had enough evidence of contumacy and "scurrilitia" to satisfy any judge.<sup>242</sup> Like in many such cases, it seems nothing was done.

Simon Farrington wrote Antonio Franco a very simple letter that gives insight into his own character. The business of the letter was the ordering of breviaries and the forwarding of subscriptions to II Monte Carmelo. He included some thirty-one pictures, about half a post card in size, of American warships calling them "Uncle Sam's ships." He also took the occasion to complain of his work in Bellevue. He described it as awful and commented "...I think it will break me down if I am kept here." He said he had been on night duty every night for some six months.<sup>243</sup> At this time some of the Carmelites at the priory were involved in supplying material for the Irish freedom movement. To prevent Farrington from knowing of their arrival and shipment to Ireland, he was kept on night duty at the hospital.<sup>244</sup>

Elias Magennis was in New York for all of 1917, 1918 and up to August 19 of 1919. His work on the mission band as well as the difficulties of wartime travel kept him in the United States. Writing to Lorenzoni on June 1, 1917, he rejoiced in the news of the opening of San Celso in Rome as a residence for the Irish students. He felt sending students to the university in Dublin was too costly and the studies too prolonged. The sending of students though would have to wait until the conclusion of the Great War which was seen in the United States, Magennis reported, as coming soon.

Saint Albert's had opened in Middletown as a "prep seminary." It was located there rather than in Tarrytown because of the inconvenience and costliness of the Westchester site. For the opening that September, five or six students were expected. The plan was to send them to Ireland for the novitiate and then to Rome for philosophy and theology studies. Magennis claimed the

---

<sup>240</sup> Cogan to Lorenzoni, Dublin, Mar 8, 1917, CG, Hib(1906-21).

<sup>241</sup> Same to same, Dublin, Mar 27, 1917, CG, Hib(1906-21).

<sup>242</sup> Same to same, Dublin, Sept 18, 1917, CG, Hib(1906-21).

<sup>243</sup> Farrington to Franco, New York/ Dec 13, 1917, CG, Hib(1906-21).

<sup>244</sup> Conversation, Hilary C. Grahame, Dec 25, 1979.



establishment of a seminary system was due only to the fact that there was a lack of priests in the Irish province. No higher motivation had prompted.

At the time he wrote, Magennis was wrestling with his notion of resigning as assistant general. He complained of the long hours involved in giving missions. Confessions began at 5:00 A.M. and rarely ended before 11:00 P.M. and besides, he gave three or four sermons a day. His comment was "Religious life in America is very good." He also had the rumor of a new American house.<sup>245</sup>

Writing the following February, Magennis became more specific about the parish. Father Tornatore, an Italian Carmelite, had a lead on getting an Italian parish. It was in the Jesuits' hands but the authorities would give it to the Carmelites for one of the Italian provinces to staff. Magennis favored the venture but felt the decision should be made in the council of the order. Magennis had told Tornatore he would write the general.<sup>246</sup>

Within two months, Magennis had changed his position on the Italian parish and warned Lorenzoni to be careful of Tornatore. He was not visiting Magennis who knew his whereabouts. Magennis thought personnel problems made it wiser to wait on the Italian parish until after the war.<sup>247</sup>

The matter of the Italian parish is not mentioned again. By that July, Tornatore had not visited Magennis.<sup>248</sup> By the start of that September, Tornatore had not appeared and Magennis said he would look for him to give him the information contained in the general's letter. This undoubtedly was an order to return to Italy.<sup>249</sup> In the beginning of March, 1919, Magennis sent Tornatore notice that he had informed the vicar general of New York that Tornatore had been sent an obedience by his superior and had to follow it.<sup>250</sup>

Early 1918, Magennis wrote Lorenzoni that the lack of priests prevented him from continuing to give missions and that the war prevented his return to Rome. He expected to return right after the end of the war.

---

<sup>245</sup> Magennis to Lorenzoni, New York, June 1, 1917, CG, Generali 2.

<sup>246</sup> Same to same, New York, Feb 4, 1918, CG, Generali 2.

<sup>247</sup> Same to same, New York, Apr 3, 1918, CG, Generali 2.

<sup>248</sup> Same to same, New York, Sept 6, 1918, CG, General! 2.

<sup>249</sup> Same to same, New York, Mar 7, 1918, CG, General! 2.

<sup>250</sup> Same to same, New York, Mar 7, 1918, CG, General! 2.

The fathers in Ireland, Magennis related, were opposed to San Celso. The fathers in the United States were in favor of the residence and Magennis promised to work for Irish support which was needed for the success of the venture.<sup>251</sup>

With the World War in progress, John Cogan wrote Lorenzoni there was scarcity of food in Ireland and its cost was rising. The novitiate was a financial problem and he felt the American houses should do more as the war had brought few if any difficulties to that country. He had such a problem getting money that he ordered the New York prior, Denis O'Connor, under pain of suspension to forward the tax for a year and a half to the provincial fund. A considerable amount of money was involved and Cogan wanted the general's opinion on the matter. Magennis came into the picture as Cogan complained of his rushing to conclusions on the practical aspects of his order to O'Connor. He also took this occasion to deny Magennis' story the Irish were against the new Roman residence, San Celso.<sup>252</sup>

Monsignor Thomas Carroll was unsure of the limits of the property of the Tarrytown parish covered by the mortgage of the Missionary Society, the actual title of the Carmelites. Farley had executed a collateral bond of his own on this land with Mutual Life Insurance of New York. His attorneys wrote him a description which he forwarded on to Southwell for confirmation.<sup>253</sup>

Edward Southwell confirmed the description of the property involved as "quite accurate" and mentioned the original loan in 1898 was \$35,000 which had been reduced to \$23,000. He called the cardinal's execution of the collateral bond kind and said that the Carmelites, as a matter of justice and gratitude, were responsible to him and grateful for such a favor.<sup>254</sup>

In the spring of 1918, Magennis was still not pleased with the Irish fathers' support of San Celso. He told Lorenzoni he should demand they do everything possible to fulfill the general's wishes in this matter.<sup>255</sup>

On the other hand, he felt that the fathers in Ireland were not opposed to Saint Albert's in Middletown. He indicated it was a case more of neglect than anything else. He described the first year, September, 1917 to June, 1918, as one in which only one religious was in residence. He was the headmaster, master of students, prior and community. One father came from the

---

<sup>251</sup> Same to same, New York, Feb 4, 1918, CG, General! 2.

<sup>252</sup> Cogan to Lorenzoni, Dublin, Mar 25, 1918, CG, General! 2.

<sup>253</sup> Gillespie to Carroll, New York, Apr 4, 1918, DA, 1-29.

<sup>254</sup> Southwell to Carroll, Tarrytown, Apr 18, 1918, 1-29.

<sup>255</sup> Magennis to Lorenzoni, New York, Apr 3, 1918, CG, General! 2.

Middletown parish to teach one hour each day. His attendance, Magennis described: "He can go, he can't go, as he wishes." He thought a shapeup could wait until the end of the war.

Magennis was aware that those in America were following the decrees of the 1916 Irish chapter concerning money and noted how they were interested in San Celso.<sup>256</sup>

Manpower curtailed missions in the fall of 1918 much to Magennis' lament. The Middletown seminary had ten for the start of its second year but the shadow of a draft for those eighteen to forty-five caused Magennis to comment, "Il povero Collegio."<sup>257</sup>

Later that fall, Magennis reported to the general that John Cogan had sent no priests to Saint Albert's in Middletown. One priest had even left there without permission and the number of students was not what had been hoped for. They were seven in number but Magennis considered them good prospects. Because he felt that fathers in Ireland "are resolved to destroy it in embryo," he requested two or three Italian Carmelites to come over after the war to staff Saint Albert's. He knew this would not find favor in Ireland but he considered the need too great a thing even to consider their opposition. He did have one good bit of news. He had heard enough money had been gathered to rid Terenure of its debt.<sup>258</sup>

Early March, 1919, Elias Magennis rejoiced that San Celso had actually opened but was sad so few Carmelites were teaching at Saint Albert's, Middletown, that laymen had been hired.<sup>259</sup>

In 1919, Magennis was experiencing no difficulty from the United States government in obtaining permission to travel nor in receiving a "passport" from the Italian government. Concerning Father Tornatore, he recommended he be assigned to a house before he left the United States. Magennis had spoken to him and received assurances that he would obey everything in his power.

Though he thanked Lorenzoni for postponing the Irish chapter, Magennis would be in Ireland by September 2 or 3. A reason for the gratitude in postponement was the high costs of travel. Perhaps he meant leaving later in the summer as an early September arrival was off season and thus a saving.<sup>260</sup>

---

<sup>256</sup> Same to same, New York, July 6, 1918, CG, Generali 2.

<sup>257</sup> Same to same, New York, Sept 6, 1918, CG, Generali 2.

<sup>258</sup> Same to same, New York, Nov 7, ^1918}^, CG, Generali 2.

<sup>259</sup> Same to same, New York, Mar 7, 1919, CG, Generali 2.

<sup>260</sup> Same to same, New York, July 4, 1919, CG, Generali 2.

With the chapter of 1919 approaching, a number of the usual pre-chapter movements must have been active in Ireland. One of the factions apparently wanted the chapter postponed for their own purposes. Another group, writing in January of that year, wanted it held at the regular time: Easter week. A large number signed this petition but in vain, as the chapter was scheduled for September.<sup>261</sup>

One of the reasons for the postponement of the chapter was the fact that the provincial, John Cogan, was a long time in the United States. That April, he wrote to Lorenzoni to say his absence from Ireland was due to the fact he was waiting for a response from the archbishop about a parish for the Carmelites that was promised by his predecessor, Cardinal Farley or as Cogan seems to have preferred calling him, "Farrelly." This would turn out to be the parish of St. Simon Stock.

Cogan was very solicitous about Lorenzoni. He wanted the Irish chapter to be held on August 10 but would not dream of having Lorenzoni undertake the task of coming to Ireland in such times of trouble and so suggested that Magennis be appointed preses of the chapter.<sup>262</sup>

1919 found a tempest in the Whitefriars Street teapot. A scrap of paper in the Roman archives containing two questions sums up the entire episode: "Is P. Nolan so weak in vision that he can't go down altar steps to give people communion?" "Is it true Fr. Prior, J. McCabe, 'tamquam leo rugiens' put suspension on the same father because he refused to give out communion because of visual defects?"<sup>263</sup> Nolan's version, sent on through Thomas Dillon was that the changing light prevented him from seeing some steps in the church. He feared descending but went down to what he thought was the floor and was actually a step above the floor. McCabe suspended him and campused him in front of a lay brother and lay people. Only later did Nolan give McCabe his version.<sup>264</sup> McCabe's version was that he himself could recall no vision problems of Nolan and that he simply refused to give out communion.<sup>265</sup> McCabe said the penalty was not suspension but he had forbidden Nolan to offer Mass in the church. This he refused to obey.<sup>266</sup> There the matter seems to have rested, at least in correspondence.

---

<sup>261</sup> Petition to General, "Die 28a - 1919," Terenure, CG, Hib(1906-21).

<sup>262</sup> Cogan to Lorenzoni, New York, Apr 23, 1919, CG, Hib(1906-21).

<sup>263</sup> Scrap of paper with pencil writing, n.d., CG, Hib(1900-5).

<sup>264</sup> Dillon to Lorenzoni, Dublin, n.d., CG, Hib(1900-5).

<sup>265</sup> McCabe to Lorenzoni, Dublin, Apr 12, 1919, CG, Hib(1900-21).

<sup>266</sup> Same to same, Dublin, May 12, 1919, CG, Hib(1900-21).

If the confused accounts of the chapter of 1919 are an indication, this chapter must have been full of gremlins and other assorted characters. Denis O'Connor seems to have been the preses but one account has Southwell in this position. The slowness of Southwell's ship at sea delayed the first session of the chapter and in this wait a letter arrived appointing Magannety his "procuratorem." Southwell, Colfer, O'Connor and Slattery as a definator, also attended. O'Farrell represented the American houses. Father Tabone, the Maltese Carmelite prior of the Irish student house in Rome, San Celso, was a delegate to the chapter. Cogan was re-elected provincial on the first ballot and Gerard O'Farrell was elected fourth definator. He had to resign this post when he was appointed the pastor in 28th Street. O'Farrell is prominent in the minutes of the chapter because he proposed support for the American "college," St. Albert's in Middletown. Some response was gained as Gabriel Cleary was appointed "prefect" of the college and it was placed immediately under the rule of the provincial. This, however, was never carried out. Dublin had to give £450 for the novitiate while the tax levied on each other house was but £40 per priest. While some of the Irish and Australian houses had special accessions laid upon them, no American house was subject to such. Denis O'Connor was appointed prior of New York, Southwell of Tarrytown and McCabe of Middletown.<sup>267</sup> Because the General Chapter was to open, Slattery went on to Rome as a delegate. The others returned to the United States in a bit of triumph because their departure in the company of Elias Magennis was seen by some as exile and a victory for the Protestant elements that had protested their involvement in Irish activities.<sup>268</sup>

The General Chapter of 1919 opened on October 12. Elias Magennis was elected general. Aloysius Slattery was elected an assistant general. Thus both were further vindicated in the eyes of the American supporters of their Irish activities.<sup>269</sup> Antonio Franco had been appointed prior of San Alberto just previous to the chapter. Just over a year from what would be the end of its resident faculty, Francis Ronayne was appointed professor of moral theology at the college.<sup>270</sup>

In 1920, there was a report that a Catholic motion picture, "The Scapular," was soon to make an appearance. No Carmelite is mentioned in connection with it and there is no evidence of it ever being issued.<sup>271</sup>

---

<sup>267</sup> Acta Capituli Provincialis, Dublin, Sept 8, 1919, CG, Hib, Capit et Cong(1900-64); Analecta Ordinis Carmelitarum IV(1917-22) 378-9. For Tabone, cf. C. Murphy, "Father Paul Clery, O. Carm., A Memoir," Nubecula 29, no 2(1978)12.

<sup>268</sup> A. Isacson, The Carmelites of New York and Their Involvement in the Irish Freedom Movement, 1916-1924 (Maspeth, 1980)19.

<sup>269</sup> Acta Capituli Generalis, Oct 12, 1919 (Rome, 1919); Analecta Ordinis Carmelitarum IV(1917-22)370-1.

<sup>270</sup> Analecta Ordinis Carmelitarum IV (1917-22)381.

<sup>271</sup> Gaelic-American (New York) Sept 11, 1920, 7.

By the late spring of 1921, Denis O'Connor had not sent his 1920 financial report in to the chancery office. Archbishop Hayes was reported as being anxious to see it.<sup>272</sup> O'Connor was able to send it within four days despite the press of duties he listed in his accompanying letter.<sup>273</sup>

There seems to have been some problem with the debts of the Middletown parish. Archbishop Hayes sent a check to cover some of them but Louis McCabe felt that while he was grateful for the money, it could have been reserved for some other parochial purpose.<sup>274</sup> The manner of borrowing money in those days seems to have been that the chancery office had to endorse any notes that were taken. McCabe sent one in the amount of \$3,900 for the Otisville Sanitarium Church and another in the sum of \$2,600 for the Centerville church. In this latter mission, \$400 had recently been paid off the debt.<sup>275</sup>

In 28th Street, Denis O'Connor faced a problem in the tax status of the parish's property. He received a letter from the city stating the land would be sold for unpaid taxes. O'Connor saw city officials in May, 1921, and had shown them the school, church and priory had been exempt. They said they were satisfied, had no legal right to collect taxes, cancelled the sale of June 1 and assured O'Connor they would remove all of the church property from tax rolls.<sup>276</sup>

During August of 1921, while William Daly, later to be Father Mel, was home in Stamford preparing to go to Ireland for his college work, Albert Metcalf wrote him an encouraging letter. He was sorry he had not the time to visit him before he left for Ireland but encouraged "Willie" and gave him a list of clothes to bring. He assured him Fathers Gerhard and O'Connor would provide his ticket. He mentioned his personal disappointment at the past school year and the departure of one student, Harry Regan.<sup>277</sup>

In what seems to have been 1921, an Italian Carmelite named Ronci was in Tarrytown. Another Carmelite named Micaleff was working in New Jersey. The presence of both was displeasing to Elias Magennis. If the procurator general was willing, Magennis said he would give Ronci his secularization. Ronci's case was before the Congregation for Religious. While Magennis was in

---

<sup>272</sup> Dineen to O'Connor, New York, May 16, 1921, DA, 0-19a.

<sup>273</sup> O'Connor to Dineen, May 20, 1921, DA, 0-19a.

<sup>274</sup> McCabe to Hayes, Middletown, July 5, 1921, DA, 0-19a.

<sup>275</sup> Same to same, Middletown, June 28, 1921; same to same, Middletown,

<sup>276</sup> O'Connor to Dineen, New York, Aug 5, 1921, DA, 0-19a.

<sup>277</sup> Metcalf to Daly, Middletown, Aug 11, 1921, ANYP.

New York, Ronci saw him and requested permission to remain in the United State for another period of time.<sup>278</sup>

During summer, 1921, Elias Magennis made a visitation of the American houses. He wanted St. Albert's in Middletown to receive every consideration. The tax for the school was to be paid regularly and in advance. He wanted a report of the school sent to all the fathers at the end of the academic year. Magennis forbid intoxicating drink to be present in anyone's room. Suspension was the penalty for anyone breaking this rule and endured as long as the drink was in one's possession. Vacation was to be given only to those who had done a fair year's work. No one who gave scandal or was in such a condition that scandal might be taken was to have vacation. In the case of any infringements on the constitutions, superiors were fully accountable. They had no options in dealing with offenders. He called for full observance because the good name of the Carmelite Fathers depended on every father. In parishes, he asked for absolute justice in recompensing the order for labor. The judge of this was not to be the prior or pastor but the order.<sup>279</sup>

When Christopher Slattery resigned as the assistant general in 1921, Basil Kahler, the American provincial, wrote Magennis from Englewood to propose the name of Francis Ronayne. In his recommendation, he used as an introduction, "Having heard of the excellent qualities of Fr. Ronayne..."<sup>280</sup> The letter was of some value in the straw polls as the recommendation sent Rome from Ireland had Taylor with two votes and Ronayne with one.<sup>281</sup> Ronayne was selected to fill the vacant post.<sup>282</sup>

Edward Southwell, the prior and pastor of Transfiguration Church in Tarrytown, died on May 10, 1922. He had been born in Kildare in 1840, joined the Carmelites as a young man and was ordained in 1865. He came out to America with the other three founding fathers in 1889. Except for 1906 to 1913, he spent the remainder of his life working in the 28th Street parish and Tarrytown. He built the school in the Manhattan parish as well as the church in Tarrytown and the latter celebrated its silver jubilee a month after Southwell's death. The funeral was from Our Lady of the Scapular with Archbishop Hayes presiding. Denis O'Connor, the Commissary General, celebrated the Mass with Lawrence Flanagan and Christopher Slattery assisting him.

---

<sup>278</sup> Magennis to Franco, New York, Aug 13, ^,19217, CG, General! 2

<sup>279</sup> Visitation Report, Magennis, Aug 28, 1921, ANYP.

<sup>280</sup> Kahler to Magennis, Englewood, Nov 19, 1921, CG, Hib(1900-5)

<sup>281</sup> Cogan to Magennis, Dublin, n.d., CG, Hib(1900-5).

<sup>282</sup> Analecta Ordinis Carmelitarum IV(1917-22)372.

Monsignor Livingston, pastor of St. Gabriel's preached the eulogy and the archbishop gave the final absolution.<sup>283</sup> His passing draws the curtain on the beginning of Carmel in New York.

---

<sup>283</sup> The New York Times (May 12, 1922)19; Vestigium II, no 1, 16. Also, unidentified clippings, St. Simon Stock scrapbook, ANYP.



## CHAPTER VII

### The Irish Question

The involvement of the Carmelites of 28th Street and their parish in the Irish freedom movement has been more specifically chronicled elsewhere.<sup>284</sup> The overwhelming amount of activity in the area of Irish politics, culture and social activities is ample testimony of the importance of this parish and its personnel in the history of this movement. When Eamon De Valera called Our Lady of the Scapular, "The Cradle of Irish Independence in America," he was simply publically recognizing this fact.

Besides material that has already been chronicled, other data fortifies this remark of the Irish leader. It was a center where information between the Sinn Fein leaders in Ireland and exiles in New York could be exchanged. The priory was a place where messages could be safely left. Carmelites traveling between Ireland and the United States carried verbally and on their person, messages and letters.

Carmelite involvement in the Irish freedom movement was almost always on the side of liberalism. When Ireland was totally under the crown, the Carmelites were anti-royalist; in the treaty era, the Carmelites were anti-treaty; later, they were not for simply a representative government but a republic. When finally there was a free-state, the Carmelites supported the still not achieved union of the six northern counties with the south.<sup>285</sup>

When we speak of Carmelites, we refer to the New York province and mainly to superiors. Superiors could make themselves available for speaking engagements - something not easily done by subjects. The title coming with the office made superiors more newsworthy and quotable. A certain amount of prestige came with an office in those days and this in a speaker made him more credible and attractive.

Subjects had little or no outlet. Among Irish issues and personalities attached to them, there was not agreement between subjects and superiors. To the resentment of subjects, sometimes,

---

<sup>284</sup> "William J. Carr," The Irish Carmelites of New York City and the Fight for Irish Independence, 1916-1919 (Middletown, 1973) , Peter O'Dwyer, A True Patriot (Dublin, 1975), Alfred Isacson, The Carmelites, of New York and their Involvement in the Irish Freedom Movement, 1916-1924 (Maspeth, 1980), Elias Holland, "The First Carmelite Foundation in New York," Sword 3(1939) 204. It might be well to point out here that Holland is incorrect in having an Irish provincial chapter take place in 1915. It took place in 1916. Cf. Acta Capituli Provincialis, July 30, 1916, CG, Hib, Capit et Cong (1900-1964).

<sup>285</sup> Carr, The Irish, 1-2.

superiors views on issues were taken as the Carmelite view when actually there was disagreement among the Carmelites as a group.

Carmelite reaction to the Rising of 1916 appeared in print two months after the event when Elias Magennis spoke to the Padraic Pearse Branch of the Friends of Irish Freedom (FOIF) at Saint Charles Borromeo Church, Harlem.<sup>286</sup> Denis O'Connor and Albert Metcalf had been in Dublin at the time of the Rising. The latter was an unofficial chaplain to the rebels at Jacob's Biscuit Factory and was known as the "Republican Priest." When they returned to the United States, they both gave interviews and lectured on their experiences.<sup>287</sup> These pedestrian activities of these three Carmelites gave no indication that they would later become ardent supporters of the Republic.

A chronology of the presence of Elias Magennis in the United States is helpful for an understanding of the Carmelites part in the cause of Irish freedom. He was present early in the year for missions in 1914, 1915 and 1916 and in this latter year, he seems to have remained in New York until he left for the Irish chapter which took place that July. He returned to the United States that fall and remained until January, 1917 when he returned to Ireland via England.<sup>288</sup> Magennis gave Lenten missions in 1917 so he must have returned to the United States.<sup>289</sup> He seems to have remained there until August 19, 1919 when he left for Ireland and the Irish chapter. He did this trans-Atlantic travel despite the submarine warfare of the Great War. From there he went to Rome and the general chapter at which he was elected general of the order. At the time of the 1916 Rising, Denis O'Connor, Gerard O'Farrell, Christopher Slattery and Dionysius Flanagan were stationed in the 28th Street parish. Hugh Devlin and Dominic Hastings were present there as the period came close to the Civil War of 1921. Albert Metcalf was stationed in Middletown but was present for many of the 28th Street events.<sup>290</sup>

When Donald O'Callaghan was doing research in the 1940's on the history of the province, he prepared a series of questions concerning the Carmelites and the Irish freedom movement. These he presented to the older Carmelites of his time. Fortunately, these answers have been preserved and they give us some insight into Carmelite activities that rely on oral tradition. He learned that Elias Magennis belonged to the Clan na Gael a secret and Fenian organization. Devlin remembered that messages were carried by Carmelites in 1919 between the Clan na Gael in the

---

<sup>286</sup> *Ibid.*, 20

<sup>287</sup> *Ibid.*, 21-5.

<sup>288</sup> Magennis to Lorenzoni, Terenure, Jan. 26, 1917, CG, Generali 2; O'Dwyer, A True, 9-30.

<sup>289</sup> Elias Magennis, "Peter Golden," Catholic Bulletin 16(May, 1926)531.

<sup>290</sup> Carr, The Irish, 16; Irish Catholic Directory (Dublin, Duffy) for the years covered.

United States and the Republicans in Ireland. He told of himself bringing a message to Liam Mellows in 1921. Hugh Devlin recalled that during the first World War, the telephone wires of the 28th Street priory were tapped and the place and priests were sometimes under surveillance due to the anti-British tone of the Irish freedom movement. Magennis and Christopher Slattery were remembered by another Carmelite as having been couriers.<sup>291</sup>

Edward Southwell was from a section of Kildare where British soldiers were permanently stationed and not of the same political persuasion as other members of his 28th Street community. Not only was he not interested in the Irish movement, he has left indications that he disapproved of Carmelites being involved in it. Having been born in 1841, he was older and also of another age. In 1916, he was transferred to Tarrytown and was replaced in 28th Street by Denis O'Connor who was politically more active.<sup>292</sup>

Denis O'Connor was the prior and pastor of the 28th Street parish from 1916 to 1924, the period of the greatest amount of Irish activity. At his death in 1924, there is an appreciable decline in the amount of Irish activity in that area. He was the leader that did more than allow; he led all the activities that used the parish facilities during his tenure.

Elias Magennis was very fond of O'Connor and when the latter died rather prematurely at the age of 53, Magennis wrote a beautiful tribute that was published in The Catholic Bulletin. Besides telling the facts of O'Connor's life and some of his character, the article does give a good insight into the thinking of Magennis.

The two had met as students at Terenure College and had worked together in Australia. Separated for twelve years, the two met again in the United States. O'Connor had been a devotee of the Knights of Columbus, having obtained the fourth degree and was the chaplain to the Tarrytown council. O'Connor had maintained the Knights were Catholic, American and distinctly Irish. When the Knights were faithless to the Irish cause, O'Connor would not attend the council or any celebrations. This action caused the Tarrytown council, much to his satisfaction, to move to another church for their affiliation.

When British propoganda tried to get the Irish youth to join their forces, O'Connor fought against the campaign. He was so opposed to the English that when other parishes had lists of those enrolled in the armed forces and flags with gold stars on them for those killed in action, Denis O'Connor had none. He felt the Irish were being asked to fight on the side of their very oppressors. This was not logical or moral.

---

<sup>291</sup> O'Callaghan Notes, ANYP.

<sup>292</sup> Carr, The Irish, 15.

When places for meetings were scarce because pro-Irish activities were often anti-English during the time of World War I, Denis O'Connor made his parish hall open to the activities of all Irish groups though at times this included those views that he personally did not favor.<sup>293</sup>

Denis O'Connor promoted the use of the 28th Street hall for Gaelic music and dancing. When the Department of Justice made him answer for the tone of Sunday afternoon dramas, he was diplomatic. Violin classes as well as dancing classes were held in the hall and as a result, many prizes were won at the annual feis. From the hall, Denis O'Connor carried the Irish flag down Broadway in a St. Patrick's Day parade for the first time. De Valera began his tour of speeches from the Carmelite Priory and it was the site of the best branch of the Friends of Irish Freedom (FOIF). That Council paid the first rent for the Central Executive Committee. When Eamon De Valera came to the commencement of the Carmelite school, a student named Mary Kelly came forward with \$100 collected from the children to buy the first Irish bond. When the bond drive of the Irish Republic was inaugurated in 1919, Denis O'Connor did his utmost for the drive's success through the American Association for the Recognition of the Irish Republic.

"To the end and as the end approached, more so, he was loyal to the cause of Irish freedom." This Magennis said of O'Connor and could easily have been said of himself.<sup>294</sup>

So great was the personal loss to Ellas Magennis and so great were O'Connor's deeds for the Irish cause that Magennis had a stained glass window placed in the chapel of Collegio San Alberto, Rome, in Denis O'Connor's memory.<sup>295</sup>

Gerard O'Farrell regretted that his work as a priest prevented him from doing more for the Irish cause. His lectures were often in the area of literature, art or music.<sup>296</sup> He gave a series of lectures on Padraic Pearse, first president of the Irish Republic. They were published in the form of a pamphlet in 1919. As lectures, they had been given to the Carmelite Branch of the FOIF. O'Farrell dealt with the plays and poems of Pearse in a way that showed he was very familiar with them. He analyzed the poems and gave an appreciation of each.<sup>297</sup> Since three-fourths of the work is concerned with Pearse's literary work, one is reminded of the often made comment that the Irish Rising was a revolt of poets and dreamers.

Dionysius Flanagan or Father Larry, after his baptismal name, was perhaps the closest of all the Carmelites to the Irish cause and its leaders. In regard to chronicled events, there is very little

---

<sup>293</sup> Ibid., 17-18.

<sup>294</sup> P. A. Magennis [sic], "An Irish Priest in America," Catholic Bulletin 14(Apr, 1924)312-20.

<sup>295</sup> Carr, the Irish, 18.

<sup>296</sup> Ibid., 18-9.

<sup>297</sup> An Appreciation of Padraic H. Pearse, First President of the Irish Republic (New York, 1919) .

that can be mentioned under his name. O'Farrell and O'Connor died young and Magennis was not often in the United States after 1919 and so Flanagan remained the only one of that group left in this country. From 1922-24, he was in Middletown but returned to 28th Street in 1924 when O'Connor died and 16 then became involved in the cause.<sup>298</sup> He was in a position of authority much of his life and so was the one welcoming visitors and speaking on important occasions. Dionysius Flanagan was not a leader in the Irish movement. He was a wise, trusted and important advisor. He was a confidant of Eamon De Valera, his school companion at Blackrock, and their affection endured until Flanagan's death in 1966.

Liam Mellows and the hospitality he received at the 28th Street priory is a good example of how the Carmelites helped those exiles and fugitives whose thinking was akin to their own.

Because of his part in the 1916 Rising, Mellows became a wanted man. He escaped to the United States around Christmas, 1916, by a munitions ship out of Liverpool.<sup>299</sup> During 1917, Mellows and Patrick McCartan tried to leave the United States on a mission they believed important. Unfortunately, they had false identification papers and Mellows was arrested before he left New York while McCartan was taken in Halifax. Mellows was held in the Tombs prison but was eventually released. That same year, he was also in difficulty with the New York City Draft Board because he answered a questionnaire stating that he owed allegiance, to only one country, Ireland, and thus could not serve in a war on the side of England.<sup>300</sup>

Liam Mellows addressed meetings and worked at the Gaelic-American. He was also an organizer for the FOIF. He began to have difficulties with the Clan na Gael and when the Kirwans, with whom he was living, did not take his part in this matter, Mellows went to stay at the Carmelites' 29th Street priory. He left after a while to room with Peter MacSwiney but he spent a lot of time with the Carmelites teaching Irish dancing and music in their school. He entered a feis of the Gaelic League and won a prize for his singing. As he put it, "The fiddle did duty once more."<sup>301</sup>

Because of difficulties with John Devoy, the editor, Mellows left the Gaelic-American at Christmas, 1918. Prevented from going to California because of his forthcoming case in court, he

---

<sup>298</sup> Flanagan to De Valera, Williamstown, Feb 15, 1963, ANYP; Carr, The Irish, 20.

<sup>299</sup> Sean Cronin, The McGarrity Papers (Tralee, 1972)69-70; Sean Cronin, The Revolutionaries (Dublin, 1971)171.

<sup>300</sup> Charles C. Tansill, America and the Fight for Irish Freedom, 1866-1922 (New York, 1957)251-2; J S. Cronin, The Revolutionaries, 172-3.

<sup>301</sup> C. Desmond Greaves, Liam Mellows and the Irish Revolution (London, 1971) 151, 153, 162-3; P. Magennis, "An Irish Priest in America," Catholic Bulletin 14(Apr., 1924)318-9. Cf. also, C. Desmond Greaves, "Liam Mellows," Capuchin Annual (1972)109-17; E. P. Magennis, "The Flowers that Fell in America," Catholic Bulletin 14(Dec., 1924)1068-9.

worked on the docks as a day laborer until he got a job at the Carmelite School teaching Gaelic and Irish history.<sup>302</sup>

January 24, 1919, Mellows received a special invitation to come to the Priory after his classes. He arrived to find a party in his honor in progress. Patrick McCartan had come from Philadelphia. After speeches in Mellows' honor, the celebrants presented him with a check for \$500. Like many a party, this one had a bad after effect. Mellows contracted the flu and was laid up for a week. Because he had not much money, Elias Magennis sent him up to Saint Albert's, Middletown, N.Y. to recuperate. Albert Metcalf was the prior of this Carmelite preparatory seminary. Mellows knew his brother, Alphonsus, who was active in the republican movement in Ireland, and so Mellows felt very much at home. Liam was there for some time as accounts indicate he was still there on March 18 when he felt good enough to leave his bed. After two more weeks of recuperation, he returned to the city but thereupon suffered a relapse.<sup>303</sup>

Later in the year and in good weather, Mellows spent two weeks vacation at Saint Albert's with a Father Feeney who had been active with him in Galway during the Rising. They constructed a makeshift boat and sailed it on the school's lake. Mellows planned to return home and was trying to get himself into physical shape for the trip. Just before the vacation, his trial in New York had ended with a fine of \$250.

Returning to New York after his Middletown vacation, he arrived at his rooms to find clothes and luggage there. Going to the Carmelite priory for supper, he learned the effects were De Valera's who had just arrived in New York.<sup>304</sup>

Mellows remained closely associated with the Carmelites in their activities and taught in the school until his return to Ireland in 1920.<sup>305</sup> A republican always, he did not support the treaty and was captured in the Four Courts in 1922. That December 7, while being held in Mountjoy Prison, the Cosgrove government told Mellows and three other prisoners they would be shot in the morning in reprisal for the street shooting of a British officer. December 8 saw the end of this young man who in his last letter to his mother sent regards to Elias Magennis.<sup>306</sup> That

---

<sup>302</sup> C. Greaves, Liam Mellows, 199-200.

<sup>303</sup> c. Greaves, Liam Mellows, 203-4; W. Carr, The Irish, 51; Cronin, The Revolutionaries, 177 states that Liam recuperated with McGarrity at Philadelphia and Atlantic City. This could be after his relapse when he returned to New York from Middletown.

<sup>304</sup> C. Greaves, Liam Mellows, 207.

<sup>305</sup> S. Cronin, The Revolutionaries, 179.

<sup>306</sup> C. Greaves, Liam Mellows, 387; Irish World (New York) Jan 6, 1923, 3; Dorothy Macardle, The Irish Republic (Dublin, 1951) 822-3; P. O'Dwyer, A True, 41-2. C. Desmond Greaves, The Life and Times of James Connolly

morning of his death he wrote in his characteristic lightness to his fellow prisoners, "God bless you, boys, and may He give you fortitude, courage and wisdom to suffer and endure all for Ireland's sake. "Du Problact Abui [The Republic Forever]".<sup>307</sup>

Elias Magennis was in Dublin at that time. Magennis tried to see his old friend before his execution but was denied permission. Publicly, Magennis denounced this action of the government as barbarous.

Elias Magennis was much attached to Liam Mellows. At one point Magennis' fame was as "Mellows friend."<sup>308</sup> Writing in 1920 of Mellows, Magennis described him, "Of a kindly and even retiring nature, he is the very soul of Celtic wit and humor and attracts the young as if he were a human magnet. Gentlemanly in his every act, he knows how to treat with the poor and the ignorant, for he is of infinite toleration. He sings the old songs and the listener feels the unbidden tears flow, he plays the violin and drags the soul of the audience back again to the hills and the dales of the land of Eire."<sup>309</sup>

When Sean T. O'Kelly was in Kilmainham Prison in 1922, Elias Magennis tried to visit his friend. The commandant wrote him that it was not in his power to allow this and he needed permission from the government. Magennis knew this would not be forthcoming.<sup>310</sup>

Concerning the Carmelites, O'Kelly wrote:

"I went to the U.S.A. in Sept. 1924 to represent the Republican Party. I had heard much about the Carmelites in New York and the active help they had at all times given in the fight for freedom. In particular, I heard how they had assisted De Valera in 1919/20. Also how they had permitted their hall in 29th St. to be used as a Republican H.Q. and how it had been used as a storehouse for arms, even tho' such activity was sometimes frowned on by higher ecclesiastical authority. All this I had learned from people like Joseph Boyle, R.I.P., Liam Pedler, Jim McGee of the Clan, Sean Nunan, Dan Doran of San Francisco and many others. I presented myself to the Carmelites and was at once warmly received by them and

---

(London, 1972) shows on 368 the loyalty of Mellows: "Mellows was a man of loyalties. Connolly added one more loyalty, which Mellows never lost. After Connolly's death, this loyalty was transferred to the cause."

<sup>307</sup> Mellows to Martin, Dublin, Dec. 8, 1922, copy in author's possession.

<sup>308</sup> Flanagan to De Valera, Williamstown, Apr. 9, 1963, ANYP.

<sup>309</sup> S. Cronin, The McGarrity, 85.

<sup>310</sup> P. E. Magennis, "Irish-America - A Contrast," Catholic Bulletin 10(Jan., 1920)24.

was often hospitably entertained at . their table by Fr. Larry Flanagan and his colleagues."<sup>311</sup>

Harry Boland, killed in the Civil War, shared the Carmelite hospitality in their 29th Street monastery and when hit with the flu, stayed two weeks there. He was called by Magennis, "My Friend." In lamenting his death, Magennis wrote: "But our love [for Ireland] was a fateful love, for she lured him to the death, and me she has consigned to a despair bad almost as death."<sup>312</sup>

When Jeremiah O'Leary was arrested for espionage in a classic instance of entrapment, he was seized with flu during his trial and sent to Bellevue's prison ward. The Carmelites as Bellevue's chaplains, not only took care of his spiritual need, but also took care of his physical needs by sending him parcels of food and visiting him almost every day.<sup>313</sup> Magennis was one of his visitors and was present in court when he was on trial for treason.<sup>314</sup>

Dr. Patrick McCartan, physician, diplomat, Fenian and journalist was a good and close friend of Elias Magennis. McCartan stayed at the priory when he came to the United States in 1918. In his version of the events of Irish freedom movement in America, he wrote glowingly though inaccurately about his Carmelite friend. Citing Magennis as provincial instead of assistant general, McCartan credited him with the founding of Saint Albert's in Middletown, the building of churches and the extension of the work of the Carmelites in the Irish-American province. He did this, McCartan said, despite a press campaign against him and ecclesiastical disapproval.<sup>315</sup>

After Eamon DeValera's escape from Lincoln Prison in February, 1919, he came secretly and in disguise to the United States after he had spent some time in Ireland. He stayed with the Carmelites on East 29th Street for his first week in the United States and when he made his first public appearance on June 23 at the Waldorf Astoria Hotel, Elias Magennis was one of the few allowed in the Gold Room for the reception. The night before, he had spent at the 29th Street Priory.<sup>316</sup>

---

<sup>311</sup> O'Kelly to O'Callaghan, Roundwood, Jan. 8, 1961, ANYP. This letter is printed in Carmelus 17(1970) 239-41. Also printed in . the same issue, 236-8, are the recollections of Magennis by O'Kelly given at Gort Muire, July 21, 1955.

<sup>312</sup> Elias Magennis, "An American Memory of Harry Boland," Catholic Bulletin 12(1922)566; "An Irish Priest in America," *ibid.*, 14(Apr., 1924; 318-9; Patrick McCartan, With De Valera in America (New York, 1932) 40; O'Dwyer, A True, 39; E. Holland, "The First Carmelite Foundation in New York," Sword 3(1939)204.

<sup>313</sup> W. Carr, The Irish, 52; O'Dwyer, A True, 25.

<sup>314</sup> Elias Magennis, "A Soggarth Aroon in America," Catholic Bulletin 16(June, 1926)628; *ibid.*, "Another of the Faithful Few Passes," Catholic Bulletin 24(Apr., 1934)342.

<sup>315</sup> McCartan, With, 40-1. Concerning McCartan, cf. Kevin Cahill, "A Fenian Physician," The Recorder 39(1978)77-85.



The Carmelite school, staffed by the Christian Brothers, Sisters of Mercy and lay personnel specialized in Irish singing and dancing as extra-curricular activities. They performed at many meetings, dances and competitions carrying off many more prizes than the size of the parish would warrant. The school was also used for Gaelic language and history classes. After this had been done in an informal way, the program was organized into a formal program. The departure of Magennis in 1919, the death of O'Connor in 1924 and the departure of O'Farrell to the Bronx and his death in 1926 brought about the end of this program.<sup>317</sup>

Those killed in the troubles were remembered in memorial Masses held at the Carmelite church. When prominent republicans were to be married or buried or their children baptized, it was invariably done in the Carmelite church with one of the priests more prominently involved in the Irish movement officiating.<sup>318</sup>

The Carmelites also supported the cause by distributing 400 copies of Seumas MacManus' Ireland's Case to schools.<sup>319</sup>

Peter Golden, the Irish composer and singer, was another of the friends of the Carmelites who did much to make gathering at the Carmelite Hall joyful occasions. Magennis credited him with saving many a meeting.<sup>320</sup>

A group called the Citizens of the Irish Republic met at the Carmelite church each Sunday after the 10:00 A.M. Mass. Fathers Magennis and O'Connor were prominent in its leadership and the society acted on various phases of the Irish freedom movement. Liam Mellows was an active member of the group.<sup>321</sup> They were active by 1920 but must have existed before that time if Magennis and Mellows were active in its membership.

---

<sup>316</sup> Macardle, The Irish Republic, 282, 299; McCartan, With, 40; C. Greaves, Liam Mellows, 160; O'Dwyer, A True, 28; Magennis, "An Irish Priest in America," Catholic Bulletin 14(Apr., 1924) 318-9; De Valera to O'Callaghan, Dublin, n.d., ANYP.

<sup>317</sup> W. Carr, The Irish, 50-1; A. Isacson, The Carmelites.

<sup>318</sup> W. Carr, The Irish, 50.

<sup>319</sup> Seumas MacManus, Ireland's Case (New York, 1919) 241.

<sup>320</sup> E. Magennis, "Peter Golden," Catholic Bulletin 16(May, 1926) 529..

<sup>321</sup> Butler to author, Philadelphia, Dec. 21, 1974.

When the First Irish Race Convention was held in the first week of March, 1916, at the Astor Hotel in New York City, accounts made no mention of any Carmelite being present. This is surprising in view of the later prominence of Carmelites at subsequent similar gatherings.<sup>322</sup>

An area of great Carmelite activity for Ireland was the organization, Friends of Irish Freedom (FOIF). This organization was founded in 1916 in New York at the First Irish Race Convention. Victor Herbert became the first president of the group. One article in the constitutions perhaps states best the purpose of the group, "to encourage and assist any movement that will tend to bring about the National Independence of Ireland." Branches were founded in many parishes of the New York area and the Rising of 1916 contributed much to the increase of Branches and membership.<sup>323</sup>

The Carmelites from the 28th Street parish spoke to various branches of the Friends of Irish Freedom.<sup>324</sup> However, it was not until June, 1917, a few months after the United States had entered the Great War, that the Carmelites began their Branch of the FOIF. The inaugural meeting took place on a Sunday, June 16. There were present, according to contemporary accounts, 800 at the meeting. Besides being addressed by Elias Magennis, the gathering was spoken to by Daniel Cohalan on the matter of American support for Irish freedom. This would happen if America insisted on the rights of small nations.

The political activities of the Carmelite Branch were decidedly anti-English in tone and republican in their goal. In a lecture program, history and economics were dealt with as they concerned and affected Ireland. John Devoy, editor of the Gaelic-American, addressed the Branch and when his paper was barred from the mails and its second class permit revoked, the Carmelite Branch was most active in promoting the paper through newsstand sales and in soliciting contributions to keep the paper alive.<sup>325</sup>

Secret Service agents would attend some of the meetings and lectures at the Carmelite Hall because of the fact that speakers were accustomed to attacking England and the Wilson policy of total English support. On one such occasion, Liam Mellows as he opened a meeting addressed two Irish looking agents with the words, "What will you say when your grandchildren ask you what you did in this great war to free small peoples? Will you tell them you were engaged in

---

<sup>322</sup> W. Carr, The Irish, 11-2.

<sup>323</sup> C. Tansill, America, 189.

<sup>324</sup> W. Carr, The Irish, 26.

<sup>325</sup> *Ibid.*, 27-9; O'Dwyer, A True, 13-4.

New York City holding down the unarmed Irish, and with revolvers trying to silence their claim to be free?"<sup>326</sup>

The feature that distinguished the Carmelite Branch was the emphasis it placed on cultural and intellectual activities. Each year, there was a lecture series based on Irish history or literature. Music and drama, even to the extent of performing plays and scenes, were also in the ambit of the Branch.

Each of the meetings of the Branch had a portion devoted to Irish songs, poetry, recitations and dances. There were also ceilidhs in the auditorium of the Carmelite school charging a small admission fee and drawing good numbers in attendance.<sup>327</sup>

The Carmelite Branch supported the Pair Trial Fund established on behalf of Jeremiah O'Leary, Patrick McCartan and Liam Mellows. This continued for a period of over two years.<sup>328</sup>

After the elections of November, 1918, in which Sinn Fein swept the results, a meeting was held at the home of Judge Daniel Cohalan on December 29th to decide what should be the course of the FOIP. Elias Magennis was in attendance. The outcome of the meeting was to await the action of these newly elected officials and not make any statements for or against the establishment of a republic until then.<sup>329</sup>

Serious differences arose among the Irish in the United States. The problem really does not concern the Carmelite history except that when the dispute became rather serious and divided the Irish into the pro and anti-DeValera forces, the Carmelites, especially Magennis and O'Connor, totally supported DeValera. Unwavering is the way this support could be characterized.<sup>330</sup>

After the Republican National Convention of 1920 in Chicago, the 28th Street Carmelite Council of the FOIF passed resolutions condemning Judge Cohalan's presentation of a resolution to the convention and his attacks and those of the Gaelic-American on DeValera. Then the council pledged its support of De Valera as the president of Ireland.<sup>331</sup>

---

<sup>326</sup> S. Cronin, The Revolutionaries, 172.

<sup>327</sup> W. Carr, The Irish, 30-3.

<sup>328</sup> *Ibid.*, 30.

<sup>329</sup> C. Tansill, America, 293-4; D. Macardle, The Irish Republic, 265-7; McCartan, *With*, 65.

<sup>330</sup> De Valera to Flanagan, Dublin, Jan. 17, 1963; Flanagan to De Valera, Williamstown, Feb. 15, 1963; same to same, Williamstown, Apr. 9, 1963, ANYP. For the dispute, cf. D. Lynch, The !. R. B. and the 1916 Insurrection (Cork, 1957)207-8; C. Tansill, America, 340-68; Macardle, The Irish Republic, *passim*.

<sup>331</sup> Resolutions, Carmelite Council, n.d., ANYP. This copy is in the hand of Dionysius Flanagan.

When the FOIF came more under the control of Judge Daniel Cohalan and the anti-De Valera forces, the Carmelites withdrew their Branch from membership to place it in the newly founded American Association for the Recognition of the Irish Republic (AARIR). This group supported De Valera and the idea of a republic.

The FOIF had begun in 1917 to use the technique of street corner preaching to spread their anti-English views. That England had enticed the United States into World War I, that Germany was a better friend of Ireland than England and that many of the early American patriots had done more treasonable things than Roger Casement were some such views. Cleveland Moffett of the National Defense Council was incensed at these activities and determined to stamp them out. Moffett's activities did nothing but bring about violence and arrests. He also increased the determination of the POIF that their free speech would not be curtailed. On one occasion, those arrested were brought before a grand jury of New York County which dismissed the charges. The New York Times implied this failure to indict was due to the police, magistrates and district attorney failing to act in a proper manner.

The Carmelite Branch was enthusiastic in its support of the street corner preaching of the FOIF. Some speakers addressed the Carmelite Branch on their purpose and techniques. Financial aid was also given by the Branch.

Although the Carmelites did not participate actively in this street preaching, they supported them in talks they gave. Elias Magennis was particularly strong in their defense, attacking the New York newspapers and the city administration for the infringement of freedom of speech and their support of England.<sup>332</sup>

The Irish Progressive League was formed as a result of this harassment by the city administration. In the politics of the time, it was somewhat leftist. Some enemies described it, "This League was a radical organization with some distinctly dubious members." After Magennis resigned as president of the POIP and the Cohalan forces gained control of the group, the Irish Progressive League was expelled from "associate society membership" of the FOIF.<sup>333</sup> Liam Mellows was an active member but John Devoy would not support the group. McCartan, present at many of the gatherings of the Irish Progressive League, stated openly the Carmelites were behind its activities. Magennis, he testifies, was the usual chairman of the police supervised meetings of the League. One such meeting on January 6, 1919 had the socialist, Norman Thomas, as the main speaker.<sup>334</sup>

---

<sup>332</sup> W. Carr, The Irish, 33-9; O'Dwyer, A True, 12.

<sup>333</sup> C. Greaves, Liam Mellows, 218.

<sup>334</sup> McCartan, With, 40, 70; Tansill, America, 295.

A meeting was held in Madison Square Garden at Union Square on May 4th, 1918, under the auspices of the Irish Progressive League to protest Irish conscription in Ireland by the British. A Mrs. William Jay of 850 Park Avenue, acting for the Ultimate Committee for the Severance of all Social and Professional Relations with Enemy Sympathizers, and a Dr. William T. Hornaday, a trustee of the American Defense Society, had tried to prevent this meeting from ever taking place. She protested to the New York Life Insurance Society, the owners of the Garden, and he to the New York Port Enemy Alien Bureau.<sup>335</sup>

The attempts to stop the meeting failed. As could be expected, the meeting was decidedly anti-British in tone. The Irish were protesting that England, long their oppressor, was now allied to the United States. Thus America in helping England in the German war was unwittingly assisting the further oppression of Ireland.

The Garden was half full for the gathering and when Elias Magennis spoke to the group, the opponents of the meeting had a band outside the Garden play during his speech. He had to yield the platform to Liam Mellows. Magennis, unfortunately attacked Mrs. Jay in his speech and Mellows urged the audience, as Irish citizens, to resist conscription of the Irish into the English army. John Devoy also addressed the gathering.<sup>336</sup> Two days later, stenographic copies of the speeches were handed over to the Department of Justice to see if there were any violations of the laws of the United States.<sup>337</sup>

The group of prominent people who had tried unsuccessfully to prevent the rally, protested this speech of Magennis to Cardinal Farley, Archbishop of New York. The letter hoped the cardinal would not allow any of his priests to make any further seditious or unpatriotic utterances.

Later that same month, on May 21, Mrs. Francis C. Barlow released the news that on May 10 she had sent a protest to President Wilson, Mayor Hylan of New York and Cardinal Farley stating that the "U.S. should not be made the base of hostile Sinn Fein action vs. Great Britain." Barlow released the texts and reported that Wilson acknowledged the receipt of the protest but no word had come from Farley whose secretary, Monsignor Carroll, had received on May 18 an additional protest sent by registered mail. Because of what she considered evasive action, Barlow decided to make the letter public. The New York Times reported Farley, Carroll and Magennis all out of town and thus unavailable for comment.<sup>338</sup>

---

<sup>335</sup> The Sun (New York) May 5, 1918, 12; C. Greaves, Liam Mellows, 156.

<sup>336</sup> The New York Times (May 5, 1918) 12; C. Greaves, Liam Mellows, 160.

<sup>337</sup> The New York Times (May 6, 1918) 5.

<sup>338</sup> The New York Times (May 21, 1918)4.

The next day, the papers printed the reply of Monsignor Carroll to Barlow. It stated Magennis was not to take part in meetings of a political character in the future.<sup>339</sup>

The letter of Carroll was as follows:

"Dear Madame:

His Eminence Cardinal Farley, Archbishop of New York, has received the protest signed by a number of ladies and gentlemen of this city regarding the meeting held in Madison Square Garden on the evening of May 4. His Eminence desires me to state that this meeting was not held under the auspices of the Catholic Church and that he did not believe the notices published that the Rev. Peter E. Magennis would preside.

The fact that Father Magennis did act as Chairman of the meeting surprised His Eminence, who has since informed the Father that he will not be permitted to remain in the Archdiocese of New York if he attempts to preside at such meetings. Father Magennis is a member of the Carmelite Order and does not belong to the diocesan clergy of New York. His Eminence, however, as the Cardinal Bishop, has control of his public activities."<sup>340</sup>

The Gaelic-American commented on this reply of Carroll: "Needless to say, it created a painful impression among Irish Catholics, because it assumed that the impudent claim of the bigots that pleading for Irish liberty is disloyalty to the United States."<sup>341</sup>

The Gaelic-American also told of the attempt to stop the May 4 meeting by a "woman with a past" and that women tried to cause trouble at the meeting and had to be ejected by the police. The article also expressed the opinion that New York Catholics were shocked at Farley's actions.<sup>342</sup>

Magennis replied to his attackers, who called themselves loyalists, in a letter to the New York Tribune of May 23. Attacking his critics, he called them "Society people" and recalled to those self-named "loyalists" the meaning of that name in the American Revolution, thus subtly

---

<sup>339</sup> The Sun (New York) May 22, 1918, 2.

<sup>340</sup> Gaelic-American (New York) June 1, 1918, 1.

<sup>341</sup> Ibid.

<sup>342</sup> Ibid. , p. 1, 7; The New York Times (June 1, 1918) 7; C. Greaves, Liam Mellows, 160.

comparing them to the English Tories of that time. He defended himself by stating he simply aimed to explain the condition of Ireland to Americans, a right in any representative government.<sup>343</sup>

Reaction among the Irish to the actions of Farley was hostile. The Carmelite Branch had a meeting addressed by Magennis in which he explained his actions and the support of the gathering was overwhelming in his defense.<sup>344</sup>

Irish organizations rallied to the support of Magennis. Branches of the FOIF passed resolutions in his support. The Cumann na m Ban and the Gaelic League in Philadelphia had their backing published in the press.<sup>345</sup> Individuals and some FOIF Branches sent letters to Farley. The Cumann na m Ban sent Farley a letter protesting his action accompanied by three pages of signatures.<sup>346</sup>

Because of the public reaction to his letter, Monsignor Carroll later gave some qualifications:

"It was in no sense the intention of the Cardinal, in making his announcement, to pass judgment one way or another on the Irish Question. Neither was it his intention, nor is it, to attempt to influence in any way a priest's private political opinions. Those are every man's own personal concern but the Church does not countenance its clergy mixing in political meetings.

"This was all that Cardinal Farley forbade Father Magennis to do. Father Magennis, on his side agreed that he would refrain from such participation in the future. This agreement he has so far lived up to. It is true that he has been elected to the presidency of the Friends of Irish Freedom. That, though, is an entirely different matter. Holding an office is not participating in a meeting. So far as the propriety of the activities of the Friends of Irish Freedom goes, that is a question for the United States authorities, not the Church, to decide."<sup>347</sup>

---

<sup>343</sup> Gaelic-American (New York) June 1, 1918, 1.

<sup>344</sup> W. Carr, The Irish, 39-46; O'Dwyer, A True, 16-8.

<sup>345</sup> Gaelic-American (New York) June 8, 1918, 5; July 13, 1918, 3.

<sup>346</sup> Farley Papers, DA; Cumann na m Ban to Farley, New York, June 13, 1918, copy ANYP.

<sup>347</sup> Gaelic-American (New York) June 1, 1918, 1.

In a letter marked, "Private and Confidential," Edward Southwell wrote Cardinal Farley on June 10 from Tarrytown where he was then stationed. He told the cardinal he was grieved by the annoyance Magennis' activities in Irish politics had caused him. He also disclaimed all participation in such activities and sympathy with such views. Only two men in the 28th Street community, Southwell said, were in favor of the Carmelites taking part in political demonstrations. Such participation was never seen in Ireland. The excited state of the country and the prejudice against Catholics in some places, made it especially important that priests, let alone members of a religious order, be guarded in their actions.

Southwell went so far as to mention Magennis was subject in the order only to the general.. He then gave Farley the general's name and address, surely a hint to write. He also told Farley he hoped his actions against Magennis would be sufficient to make him desist from further actions of this type. Southwell did say he found it hard to speak in this way of a brother and a priest but did it only to protect others.<sup>348</sup> And so a brother in need would have no friend, hopefully, like Southwell.

Almost three weeks later Farley replied to the letter of Southwell. It was, however, through his secretary, Monsignor Carroll, that he communicated. Mentioning that the Cardinal was sorry he had to reprimand Magennis and that such publicity had arisen over the case, Carroll told Southwell he had written Mrs. Barlow several days after her letter had been made public. He had written at midnight of the day she demanded Farley's reply. He was apparently reluctant to write but did it only when forced by Mrs. Barlow.

Carroll did reveal that the Cardinal had received complaints about meetings held at Our Lady of the Scapular. Some contained quotes of what the sender considered objectionable material. This was opposition to American involvement in World War I on the side of the English. Along these lines, Carroll mentioned England was in fact an ally of the United States. He stated, "We need her and she needs us..." Further, he said the Cardinal would not allow anyone representing the Church to impugn the loyalty of American Catholics.

Farley would not write Lorenzoni in Rome. He felt Magennis had come to realize he represented more than himself when he expressed his views "on such an inflammable subject as Irish politics."<sup>349</sup>

While Carroll's letter was enroute to Southwell's residence in Tarrytown, Southwell took the liberty of dropping in to see the Cardinal in Manhattan. This was a faux pas because there was additional turmoil in Farley's circle over the Magennis affair. Southwell regretted to Carroll he

---

<sup>348</sup> Southwell to Farley, Tarrytown, June 10, 1918, DA, 1-29.

<sup>349</sup> Carroll to Southwell, New York, June 29, 1918, DA, 1-29.



had dropped in and revived unpleasant memories. Citing the whole matter as unfortunate for the Carmelites in the United States, he asked that the Cardinal see the event as exceptional behavior for a Carmelite and not a course that was supported even in Ireland.

Southwell mentioned that were there not a war on, the provincial, John Cogan, would have come over. Southwell stated he would urge Cogan to come and remain until the trouble was over and each father was sticking to his ecclesiastical duties. He also said he would keep his interview with Farley secret except to Cogan.<sup>350</sup>

In the midst of this turmoil, the Second Irish Race Convention was held at the Central Opera House on May 18, 1918. 2,500 delegates attended. Elias Magennis addressed the gathering and was also elected the president of the Friends of Irish Freedom. The speeches of the convention were described to President Wilson as "most seditious."<sup>351</sup> Victor Herbert had expressed his disinterest in serving another term as president of the FOIF. Magennis' election prompted a typically scholastic distinction from Monsignor Carroll that Farley's ban did not apply to this instance since "holding an office is not participating in a meeting."<sup>352</sup>

After the election of Magennis, he headed a delegation sent by the Second Irish Race Convention to Wilson and the White House. They were to give the president a plea from the convention that the principle of self-determination be applied to Ireland. The delegation was rebuffed by Joseph Tumulty, the president's secretary on May 24, 1918 but the petition was later accepted by Tumulty.<sup>353</sup>

When he was the national president of the FOIF, Elias Magennis increased the activity of the organization. Within a year of his election, so many branches had begun in New York that there was not enough room to list them all in the regular schedule that appeared in the Gaelic-

---

<sup>350</sup> Southwell to Carroll, New York, July 3, 1918, DA, 1-29.

66. <sup>351</sup> There seems to be some question about the presence of Magennis at the Second Irish Race Convention, New York, May 18-9, 1918. Tansill, America, fn 51, p. 274, acknowledges that McCartan, With, p. 46, mentions that Magennis spoke at the convention. He also refers to a memo of Tumulty to Wilson, May 23, 1918, p. 273, which states the same fact. Tansill, writing about the place in the Irish movement of Daniel F. Cohalan at the behest and hire of the Cohalan family, denies that Magennis attended the convention even though he was elected president of the Friends of Irish Freedom at it. There is no documentation available to prove his presence and newspaper accounts, while mentioning a speech of Magennis, write of his election in such a manner that the fact of his presence could be questioned. The fact of his presence is of little or no consequence but the obvious partisanship of Tansill in the footnote cited above is of some consequence. In this same note, we might correct that Magennis was Very Reverend in 1918 by virtue of his office of assistant general; he would become Most Reverend when elected general of the Carmelites in 1919.

<sup>352</sup> Gaelic-American (New York) June 1, 1918, 1; W. Carr, The Irish 46-7

<sup>353</sup> C. Tansill, America, 270-4; P. McCartan, With, 46; D. Lynch, The ! . R. B., 201; S. Cronin, The McGarrity Papers, 70-1; C. Greaves, Liam Mellows, 159-60, places all these activities after the First Irish Race Convention.

American. He also began branches in other states. There was a marked tendency under his administration to have the meetings in church buildings like school halls or auditoriums. This association of the Irish freedom movement with the church bears the definite imprint of Elias Magennis. Due to his friendship with the numerous priests he encountered in his mission work, he was able to turn many from conservative views and forms of Irish nationalism and convert them to the more radical forms he espoused. This church association seems to have been his principal contribution to the organization.<sup>354</sup>

Magennis exercised his office of president of the FOIF until June, 1920, but was able to participate in the activities of the organization only until August, 1919, when he left for Ireland and the general chapter of the Carmelites in Rome which elected him general of the order.<sup>355</sup>

When Elias Magennis resigned as the National president of the FOIF He was succeeded by Bishop Michael Gallagher of Detroit. The reason for Magennis' resignation seems to have been the fact that being general of the Carmelites, a post he was elected to in October, 1919, called for his residence in Rome and thus rendered it impractical for him to hold down such a post.<sup>356</sup> Judge Cohalan's control of the FOIF also obliged him to disassociate himself from the organization.<sup>357</sup>

Speaking of the resignation of Magennis from the FOIF presidency, De Valera said:

"That was a severe setback to the Cause of Irish freedom. Had Fr. McGuinness /sic/ been able to continue as president I am confident that many of the later disastrous differences which arose in that Organization would never have occurred. Bishop Gallagher, whose views were quite different, succeeded Father McGuinness [sic]."<sup>358</sup>

The Irish provincial chapter was held in September, 1919, and in the next month the general chapter of the order took place in Rome. Elias Magennis, as assistant general, attended both. He

---

<sup>354</sup> W. Carr, The Irish, 46-9; O'Dwyer, A True, 16-24.

<sup>355</sup> W. Carr, The Irish, 47; O'Dwyer, A True, 29-30

<sup>356</sup> O'Dwyer, A True, 34-6; C. Tansill, America, 387, is grossly inaccurate in stating that Magennis was not a De Valera supporter and was forced out of the Friends of Irish Freedom by Dev so that he could get one of his own men in. The Carmelites were so pro-De Valera that when Cohalan exerted control over the FOIF, they placed their Branch in the newly established American Association for the Recognition of the Irish Republic (AARIR) which took the place of the FOIF for De Valera's supporters. The AARIR was announced in October, 1920. Cf. S. Cronin, The McGarrity Papers, 85.

<sup>357</sup> Flanagan to De Valera, Williamstown, Feb. 15, 1963, ANYP.

<sup>358</sup> De Valera to O'Callaghan, Dublin, n.d., ANYP.

traveled to Ireland with Denis O'Connor, Gerard O'Farrell and Aloysius Slattery. Slattery went on with Magennis to the general chapter in Rome. These travels were seen in the English press as summons to Rome to explain political activity on behalf of the Irish cause. All three returned to the United States with positions given them by the chapter and thus gave lie to these rumors.

When Magennis was elected general, fearful his position would increase his influence for the Irish cause, the English tried to have his election not be confirmed by the Holy See.<sup>359</sup> They were unaware the election needed no such confirmation. The action of the English did nothing but enhance the reputation of Magennis and enlarge the esteem in which he was held by the Irish.

The role of Elias Magennis in the Irish freedom movement is well chronicled, especially in his speeches and work with organizations. His presence at so many meetings was a feat unequalled in those times and even to this day.<sup>360</sup> He also seems to have performed a number of other important functions for the cause so close to his heart. The travel imposed upon him by his position as assistant general and later on as general gave him the opportunity to bring messages across the Atlantic. During the time he was at Rome as general, he was able to offset British influence at the Vatican due to his own friendship with Benedict XV.

During the time of Terence MacSwiney's hunger strike, much pressure was brought to bear upon the Vatican to condemn this method of protest. Monsignor Cerretti, then assistant secretary of state and later a cardinal, asked Magennis to draw up a defense of this method of protest for one of the Vatican congregations. He did and because of his persuasive arguments, the hunger strike and its participants did not receive any condemnation from Rome.<sup>361</sup>

The Third Irish Race Convention was convened in Philadelphia on February 22-23, 1919, with the purpose of supporting the newly established Pail Eireann and its attempt to gain a hearing at the Paris Peace Conference. The part of Magennis in calling this gathering is attested to by his friends and denied by his enemies. The Cohalan faction would claim this honor for the judge and John Devoy while Dorothy Macardle would claim it for Magennis, McCartan and McGarrity.<sup>362</sup> McCartan would have Magennis helping McGarrity with the convention preparations and Diarmuid Lynch assisting Magennis. Magennis was still the president of the

---

<sup>359</sup> O'Dwyer, A True, 31; Isacson, The Carmelites,

<sup>360</sup> O'Dwyer, A True, 14-6.

<sup>361</sup> Ibid., 36; W. Carr, The Irish, 16-7.

<sup>362</sup> C. Tansill, America, 296-8; Macardle, The Irish Republic, 278-9; S. Cronin, The McGarrity Papers, 71-2.

POIF but Cohalan is cited by McCartan as presiding at the gathering.<sup>363</sup> In any case, Magennis was present at the convention.<sup>364</sup>

When Sean T. O'Kelly had resigned his post as representative of the Provisional Government of the Irish Republic in Paris, he went to Rome for a vacation. This was in the early part of February, 1920. He stayed at the Irish College and became ill. Despite his own misfortune, he had to see Benedict XV in private audience to present the cause of Irish freedom. The English had already seen the Pope and had presented a strong case for the condemnation of the republicans and their methods of warfare. O'Kelly, rising from his sick bed, presented the case very forcefully. He was assisted in its presentation by the Irish College's rector, Monsignor Hagan. Recalling this incident, O'Kelly testified to the reliance of Hagan on the advice and counsel of Elias Magennis. O'Kelly said of Magennis, "Speaking from my own experience I can say that his advice was always sound. He stood for bold, courageous action and no surrender."<sup>365</sup>

Elias Magennis believed that the change for Ireland would best come through a constitutional movement. The Easter Rising of 1916 changed his opinion so radically that he espoused force as the only way to gain complete independence for Ireland.<sup>366</sup>

Magennis did not like the Knights of Columbus. He felt they and the Catholic Press had abandoned the Catholics of Mexico when Dwight Morrow was settling problems in 1927-30. Both he felt could have helped Ireland during her troubles. Those he called "Knight-Defenders" also felt the wrath of his sarcasm.<sup>367</sup>

Michael Collins was ambushed and killed on August 22, 1922. The next day Patrick McCartan wrote to Joseph McGarrity in Philadelphia to say he and Elias Magennis had been scheduled to meet with Collins on August 23. After this conference, McCartan and Magennis were to go south on passes arranged by Collins and meet with De Valera and some of the irregulars' offices to arrange peace. McCartan told McGarrity he was sure there would have been some sort of peace in the Civil War by the end of the week had Collins not been ambushed in Cork.<sup>368</sup>

---

<sup>363</sup> P. McCartan, *With*, 80, 84.

<sup>364</sup> O'Dwyer, *A True*, 24-5.

<sup>365</sup> O'Kelly to O'Callaghan, Roundwood, Jan. 8, 1961; "First Audience with His Holiness Pope Benedict XV, April, 1920," a manuscript sent Donald O'Callaghan and now in ANYP.

<sup>366</sup> O'Dwyer, *A True*, 11.

<sup>367</sup> E. Magennis, "God Help Mexico," *Catholic Bulletin* 26(Jan., 1936)63-8

<sup>368</sup> S. Cronin, *The McGarrity Papers*, 123.

Magennis must have been a difficult man to live with. He attacked what he called "itinerant Irish showmen" and "those carpet-bagger litterati." He did not like the pro-Cosgrove attitude of Padraic Colum and he rejected the "Castle Catholics" of the United States. They claimed to represent Cosgrove but he could not class them more than "Itinerant showmen." Magennis felt the Abbey Players of that time represented the worst of Irish life. Consequently, he suggested they be kept in Ireland. Nothing of Ireland seemed to have pleased him in his later years.<sup>369</sup> Perhaps, his dream was not attained and he was simply ventilating his frustrations.

As general and assistant general, Elias Magennis insisted on observance. He revived the order by getting people to foster vocations despite financial and other problems. He was the saving factor in the modern history of the order. Perhaps what could be taken as an indication of the attitude of Magennis is in his biography of Joseph P. Cowley which he wrote at the man's death. Speaking of Cowley, the first Irish Carmelite priest to obtain a degree from the Royal University, he said, "Dolendum est quod e-jus exemplum alios apud nos ad similiter tendandum non instigaret."<sup>370</sup>

When he was general, Elias Magennis spoke about the Irish in America to a gathering at the Irish College in Rome. The Augustinian general, Doctor O'Gorman, remarked on the occasion that the Irish cause occupied the position it did in the United States due in a great part to the role Magennis played.<sup>371</sup>

---

<sup>369</sup> E. Magennis, "Ireland in America Today," Catholic Bulletin 23(April, 1933)327-31.

<sup>370</sup> Interview with Kilian Lynch, Tadcaster, Nov. 15, 1976. For more information about Elias Magennis, cf. P. O'Dwyer, A True Patriot (Dublin, 1975) and P. Feeley, "A Second Elias," Vox Eliae (1950)34-9.

<sup>371</sup> "Notes From Rome," Catholic Bulletin 10(March, 1920) 143-3; O'Dwyer, A True, 33.

## CHAPTER VIII

### St. Simon Stock - The Commissariate

Cardinal Farley had promised the Carmelites a new parish in the Bronx. Magennis wrote Lorenzoni on April 3, 1918, to tell him the opening of the preparatory seminary in Middletown prompted Farley to offer the Carmelites "a beautiful parish in a part of New York with great promise for the future." It would not begin until after the war.<sup>372</sup> Scarcity of materials, the slowing of development in the Bronx and the inability to bring personnel from Ireland because of submarine warfare postponed the new parish. The matter was further complicated by the death of Farley in September, 1918.

John Cogan, the Irish provincial, came to New York in April, 1919, to see Farley's successor, Patrick Hayes, about the redemption of the promise. Cogan was successful and returned to Ireland at the end of July with Hayes' promise of a parish in "the northern part of the city."<sup>373</sup>

The name, St. Simon Stock, was chosen for the new parish by the Carmelites to honor their first western general and the recipient of the Scapular Promise. Some overzealous Irish patriots protested this choice because Simon was English, the nationality of their oppressors. The Gaelic-American printed a letter from one such whose comments were not so much anti-English as wondering why an Irish saint was not chosen especially when they were so numerous.<sup>374</sup>

We are fortunate in having a firsthand account of the foundation of this new parish. The account is by Anna Hart, long an associate of the Carmelites and one of the pioneer members of the parish. She prepared this piece for the 1945 silver jubilee journal of the parish. We will quote it verbatim. Footnotes made by this author, clarify and also substantiate her statements.

"In late August of 1919 Father O'Connor sailed for Ireland. He took with him to attend the Provincial Chapter a young priest from the 29th Street Convent, Rev. William G. O'Farrell, who had been ordained only three years before, but who had already made a name for himself in various States through his missionary work. The Irish Chapter took place in

---

<sup>372</sup> Magennis to Lorenzoni, New York, Apr 3, 1918, CG, Generali 2.

<sup>373</sup> Cogan to Lorenzoni, New York, Apr 23, 1919; same to same, Dublin, July 26, 1919, both in CG, Hib(1906-21).

<sup>374</sup> Isacson, The Carmelites of New York and Their Involvement in the Irish Freedom Movement, 1916-1924 (Maspeth, 1980) 44.

September, and early in the month of October word reached America that Father O'Farrell had been appointed Pastor of the new parish.<sup>375</sup>

Father O'Connor and Father O'Farrell returned to America in November and immediately set out to ascertain the location in the Bronx for the new parish and particularly the most convenient site for church, school and monastery. After careful consideration, they finally bought the two-story frame house standing on the hill of the southwest corner of 182nd St. and Valentine Avenue. The new parish took in the corners of four neighboring parishes; Our Lady of Mercy, St. Nicholas of Tolentine, St. Joseph's and Holy Spirit. Father O'Farrell was welcomed with joy by the Pastors of these surrounding churches. They did everything they could to help the new Pastor. Father O'Farrell immediately had plans drawn for the renovation of the house and before long carpenters were busy tearing out walls and staircases and rearranging the "house on the hill". While this was going on in the house, Father O'Farrell was visiting the members of the parish and taking a complete census. It meant that day after day, this delicate looking young priest would start out at an early hour from 29th Street and travel to the Bronx, with an apple in his pocket for his noon-day meal, and start on his rounds of the recently declared parish. It was a very severe winter, and many times Father O'Farrell made the first foot-prints in the snow as he went through the then sparsely settled neighborhood. Sometimes a kindly parishioner would take pity on him and give him a cup of tea, but more often, the apple he carried was his only meal from early morning until he reached the Priory in 29th Street in time for dinner. 'Till the late hours of the night, he would then work settling the census and indexing the various names and addresses.

In March 1920, the preliminaries were finally finished and on Palm Sunday, March 28th, the first Mass was offered for the new parish, which

---

<sup>375</sup> Acta Capituli Provincialis, Dublin, Sept 8, 1919, CG, Hib, Capit et Cong (1900-64). Accounts of the foundation of St. Simon Stock parish state that O'Farrell was appointed pastor of the new parish at the Irish chapter of 1919.. There is no mention in the results of the chapter sent to Rome of this appointment. O'Farrell, in fact, is named pastor of the 28th Street parish.

Mel Daly, "St. Simon Stock Church Marks Golden Jubilee," Sword 30(Oct, 1970)15-9, 74 has no data conflicting with that of Hart. St. Simon Stock Church, Bronx, N.Y. (Hackensack, 1970) also relies on Hart and has neither conflicts or new data. Cf. V. McDonald, "New York Province Is Diamond Jubilarian," Sword 24(June, 1964) 19 and J. Ryan, "A Brief Outline of the History of the Province of St.Elias," Vox Eliae (1957)29. When Denis O'Connor bought the house and land of Isaac Roth, he paid \$24,000 and after the acquisition of the land by O'Connor, he had to wait for the incorporation of the parish before he could personally relinquish the ownership. Cf. Agreement, O'Connor and Roth, Dec 4, 1919; Certificate of Incorporation, Mar 23, 1920, both in CONY.

had been named Saint Simon Stock after the Saint of the Scapular. Many of us remember that first Sunday and that Mass, with the little chapel, about 200 people, barely finished, with the whitewashed walls, the simple folding chairs, and the tiny altar. With what joy and pride we watched the young Pastor saying that first Mass. We may wonder how so young a man dared undertake so big a work; but how quickly our doubts were dispelled when he turned and addressed us. While he briefly outlined his plans for the future, he seemed to enkindle in us all his own great, burning zeal and enthusiasm for the Glory of God. The Reverend Elias Vella, Father O'Farrell's assistant, was another young man, also from a distant Isle - the Isle of Malta. He immediately won a place all his own in the hearts of the people by his piety and sincerity. While the two young priests were entirely different in disposition and character, they became greatly attached to each other and worked in perfect harmony. The Parishioners vied with one another in showing little attentions and in doing simple homelike things for these two priests.

The Masses on that first Sunday morning were attended by about five hundred people; and the voluntary offering for that day amounted to \$100.00.

The parish seemed to grow immediately; Societies were formed and flourished and before long the little chapel was crowded to overflowing at all the devotions, The people were forced to stand on the narrow porch and on the walk. Indeed not a few were compelled to hear Mass standing out on the lawn looking through the grill-work of the windows of the temporary chapel. Finally it became necessary to admit the parishioners into the vestry, then into the priests' dining room which adjoined the vestry, and it was not an uncommon sight to see the faithful kneeling on the stairs leading to the priests' rooms on the upper floor of the house, trying to assist at Mass.

Every affair that was started seemed to have God's blessing on it. Success crowned every effort and the mutual cooperation between priests and people grew stronger day by day. Harmony and peace reigned on "Carmel Hill," as the rectory was lovingly called by the people throughout the parish.

After having several successful entertainments and lawn parties, Father O'Farrell was enabled to break ground for the Basement Church on February 1st, 1921. Many of the parishioners grouped there, day after day,



to watch the work, which was retarded on account of the rock in the excavation; but the building was finally completed and the cornerstone ready to be laid on the first Sunday of October, 1921.

For that joyous occasion, the beloved Cardinal of Charities, Archbishop Hayes, came to preside. Father O'Farrell, clad in the beautiful white and brown habit of Carmel, led his people in procession, throughout the solemn ceremonies. Most Reverend Hilary M. Doswald, then President of Saint Cyril's College, Chicago, and now the Prior General of the Carmelite Order, preached a most eloquent, inspiring sermon. Later in the evening a banquet was held. The most outstanding event at that banquet was the simple, but soul-stirring speech of Father O'Farrell given in reply to the applause of his people.

The fire of enthusiasm that he had kindled and fanned in others was now throwing its blaze of glory upon himself. At first he stood silent, his eyes beaming with joy; then, before he spoke, he grew somewhat nervous, and a slight shadow of displeasure seemed to flit over his face. The devotion and love of these loyal men, so he seemed to think, centered too much upon himself and not enough upon the Church and upon his Order.

"The inspiration that made me give the best I had," he said, "the inspiration that urged me, a man, to do a man's work for the new parish, I received from the Church and from my Order. Through the training of - my novitiate even a trivial duty assumes for me a soul, and becomes a living thing. Equipped with this talisman of Carmel I shall gladly give my best again to the service of the sick, should my Superior, Father O'Connor, call me back to the Bellevue Hospital. I hope that then you will give my successor the support that you so generously gave to me."

Thus did Father O'Farrell try to transfer to the Order the love and affection the people lavished upon him. Great as did this Carmelite Priest appear in the accomplishments of his work, greater still did he strive forth in the beauty and richness of his sentiments.

After the Basement Church, came plans for a Rectory which was badly needed; the Archbishop wanted a school built because the children of the parish were in neighboring schools. Unfortunately there was not room for them in the Catholic schools nearby. Apartment houses were being built in every street, which meant more families and more children to be taken care of, thus making the erection of a school a matter of obligation.

The parishioners redoubled their efforts to obtain necessary funds, and every conceivable means was used to raise money to finance the building. Plans were drawn up, and in 1925 ground was broken for the School, Rectory and Auditorium. The original rectory was moved down the street by the man who bought the house, and the priests took up their residence in a small house across the Avenue which they rented temporarily. In the meantime, Father O'Connor had died, leaving the office of Superior of the Carmelites in the State of New York vacant and Father O'Farrell was nominated as Commissary-General by the Roman Authorities. This entailed many duties connected with Saint Albert's College, the Carmelite preparatory seminary for the priesthood, and the other parishes; hence Father Vella was chosen Pastor of Saint Simon Stock's Parish while Father O'Farrell remained in an advisory capacity. Although he could have chosen any of the houses for his home, he wished to assist Father Vella in the task of erecting those buildings, for which he had laid plans. The buildings were completed in the latter part of 1925. The priests moved into the new Rectory on December 8th, 1925, and the school was fully equipped and opened on the 2nd day of February, 1926 with eight Sisters of Mercy as a teaching staff. On account of weather conditions, it was deemed advisable to delay the laying of the cornerstone of the school building until the Spring.

During the month of March, Father O'Farrell was stricken with a very serious ailment, which necessitated an operation. He refused to have this done, determined that nothing should interfere with his plans for the celebration on May 30th. The cornerstone was laid by His Eminence Cardinal Hayes, and the Auditorium and Rectory were blessed, in an elaborate ceremony. The speeches on the occasions were delivered by His Eminence, Father O'Farrell, Father Flanagan, and Monsignor Burke. After the blessing, a thanksgiving ceremony was held in the church. It was a very beautiful and significant ceremony and one long to be remembered by the attending parishioners.<sup>376</sup>

The announcement of the establishment of the St. Simon Stock parish as well as a history of the Carmelites, the plans to build a church, the announcement of the Palm Sunday, 1920 first Masses, fund raising plans and almost all of the activities of the parish were covered by

---

<sup>376</sup> St. Simon Stock Silver Jubilee, 1920-1945 (Bronx, 1945).

newspapers, especially the Bronx Home News. They form an interesting detailed picture of those early days.<sup>377</sup>

When he was beginning the parish of St. Simon, Gerard O'Farrell wrote to all the superior generals of the orders and congregations of sisters in New York asking them for donations of money and articles like vestments and church furniture.<sup>378</sup>

The granting of the parish of St. Simon Stock to the Carmelites involved them and the archdiocese of New York agreeing to a contract governing their relationship. This was done November 21, 1919. The Congregation of the Council gave Hayes permission to give the parish to the Carmelites. John Cogan, the Irish provincial, then requested permission from the Carmelites' Curia to accept the parish. This was given by an order of February 17, 1920 but it was not until May 13 that the Congregation of Religious gave their approval.<sup>379</sup> Thus the package of permissions was completed.

In 1921, with the completion of the new St. Simon Stock complex imminent, the Carmelites and Gerard O'Farrell were seeking as prominent a ceremony as possible. This was only the second Carmelite church in the city and the first had been dedicated some thirty years previous. So O'Farrell wrote the archbishop requesting an appointment to make arrangements for the cornerstone ceremony.<sup>380</sup> Hayes declined to be present at that ceremony but promised formally to bless and open the church. For the cornerstone, Hayes would assign another prelate.<sup>381</sup>

Since Archbishop Hayes had declined to attend the ceremony when it was listed as a cornerstone laying, it is likely that O'Farrell pushed ahead the completion of the church to such an extent that it could be dedicated though it was not quite completed. In this way, he finally obtained the attendance of Hayes.<sup>382</sup>

O'Farrell won this duel with authority but Hayes excused himself from attending the dedication dinner due to the fact that he had another function.<sup>383</sup> O'Farrell's plan was to assemble at 181st Street and the Concourse and process to the church. He had scheduled the singing of "Ecce Sacerdos Magnus," the laying of the cornerstone, the sermon, a collection and benediction. He

---

<sup>377</sup> St. Simon Stock scrapbook, ANYP.

<sup>378</sup> O'Farrell, form letter, New York, Dec 26, 1919, ANYP.

<sup>379</sup> Establishment of St. Simon Stock, Lib III, p 130/1920, ANYP.

<sup>380</sup> O'Farrell to Dineen, Bronx, June 28, 1921, DA, 0 19a.

<sup>381</sup> Dineen to O'Farrell, New York, June 29, 1921, DA, 0 19a.

<sup>382</sup> Unidentified clippings, St. Simon Stock scrapbook, ANYP.

<sup>383</sup> Dineen to O'Farrell, New York, Sept 19, 1921, DA, 0 19a.

promised to keep within the time limit specified by Hayes.<sup>384</sup> The actual ceremony took place on October 2, 1921 with Hilary Doswald, then president of St. Cyril's College, Chicago, giving the address. Doswald was so impressed with the ceremony that he wrote a description of the parade with its bands and trumpets. He spoke on the spirit of Carmel, inspired as he was by the parade and the arrival of Gerard O'Farrell. That evening, so Doswald described, they all went to the home of a prominent citizen, Thomas Quinn, for dinner. O'Farrell spoke there of the spirit of Carmel which he called his personal inspiration. Doswald wrote his account with the point that if you stick to the spirit of Carmel, it will inspire you to work where sent and accomplish great things.<sup>385</sup>

The dedication was well-described by the account of Hilary Doswald. Other accounts add about four hundred children with flags and the parade of all the participants to the church from the Grand Concourse.<sup>386</sup>

The honor of being the first person baptized in the new St. Simon Stock Church fell to Margaret Stokes who beat William Hoffelmeyer by a few minutes in arriving at the church to capture the honors. The girl won despite the fact that she lived two blocks from the church while her male rival lived across from it.<sup>387</sup>

At a reception given Elias Magennis in June, 1921, by the Bronx parish, Magennis told how he had not been in favor of the undertaking. He described taking Gerard O'Farrell up to the designated area and reading to him the names on the doorbells. O'Farrell persevered despite the odds. That night, Magennis apologized for his error in judgment.<sup>388</sup>

In November, 1920, that first year of St. Simon Stock, Gerard O'Farrell's pet collie died and a parishoner gave him a young pup for a replacement. The dog wandered from the temporary priory and only when the loss was reported in the Bronx Home News was the dog returned. He had been found in Tremont by a young boy who brought the dog home. When the lad's father saw the dog, he recalled the news item and returned the dog to the happy pastor.<sup>389</sup>

---

<sup>384</sup> O'Farrell to Dineen, Bronx, Sept 28, 1921, DA, 0 19a.

<sup>385</sup> Invitation, Laying of Cornerstone, St. Simon Stock, Oct 2, 1921; H. Doswald, Carmel in New York (n.p., [1921]), both in ANYP.

<sup>386</sup> Unidentified clippings, St. Simon Stock scrapbook, ANYP.

<sup>387</sup> Home News (Bronx) Apr, 1920, ANYP.

<sup>388</sup> Unidentified clippings, St. Simon Stock scrapbook, ANYP.

<sup>389</sup> *Ibid.*

Gerard O'Farrell had a claim laid against him by a man named Farrell over a Reo truck. O'Farrell told the man's lawyer of his own good conscience in the matter and to restrain his threats. He would not talk to Farrell's lawyer but would talk to the principal and would consider reducing by payment his liability in the incident.<sup>390</sup>

A complaint by one Catherine Battle was sent on to O'Farrell with the notice that Archbishop Hayes wanted a full report on the matter.<sup>391</sup> O'Farrell began this report with the slider, "I would not be surprised if her loyalty to her religion be evidenced more in her adverse criticism of the clergy than in the faithful fulfillment of its obligations." O'Farrell said her complaint was actually a misquote of his announcement of an Irish rally in Madison Square Garden. Battle claimed O'Farrell said the English people were hypocrites. In reporting to Hayes, O'Farrell said his statement was that the English government was hypocritical. He further went after Battle by saying she was the type that considered a priest loyal only if he referred to Germans as Huns and Boches.<sup>392</sup> The reply of O'Farrell is a surprising letter to send to an archbishop. He must have had Hayes very much in his camp and must have known of his strong Irish sympathies else he would not have been able to treat Miss Battle so and get away with it.

James O'Brien, one of St. Simon's trustees, was seen by O'Farrell as an obstacle to the progress of the new Bronx parish. O'Brien sent O'Farrell his resignation from the presidency of the Ushers Society. Seizing the day, O'Farrell wrote him that he had refused his resignation on four other occasions but would now accept it saying it was a resignation from the ushers' presidency and the position of trustee.<sup>393</sup>

O'Brien was quick to point out to his pastor the blatant error he had made. From O'Farrell's move O'Brien got the definite impression O'Farrell wanted him out as trustee and so he put it this way to him, "but since you mention this, I will ask you to kindly state your reason for desiring it and I shall be most happy to comply with your request."<sup>394</sup>

Whether O'Farrell told him the reason he desired his removal, we do not know. O'Farrell did submit the name of James O'Flaherty as the new trustee explaining to Bishop Dunn the problems brought about by O'Brien's tenure.<sup>395</sup>

---

<sup>390</sup> O'Farrell to Larkin, Bronx, Dec 14, 1920, ANYP.

<sup>391</sup> Dineen to O'Farrell, New York, Jan 6, 1921, ANYP.

<sup>392</sup> O'Farrell to Hayes, Bronx, Jan 8, 1921, ANYP.

<sup>393</sup> O'Farrell to O'Brien, Bronx, Mar 3, 1921, ANYP.

<sup>394</sup> O'Brien to O'Farrell, Bronx, Mar 4, 1921, ANYP.

<sup>395</sup> O'Farrell to Dunn, Bronx, Mar 17, 1921, ANYP.

In the report of the Irish Province for 1921, the only mention of the American houses is the presence of one priest in Middletown at St. Albert's.<sup>396</sup> The report of the next year, made by Francis Ronayne, had no mention of the houses.<sup>397</sup> That same year, all priors received a notice from Elias Magennis that as general, he was going to have to make a special report to the Holy See on the status of the order in 1923. He had to know how many novices and students each house actually had and also how many they could reasonably hope for.<sup>398</sup>

Gerard O'Farrell received another letter of complaint. After he had been forwarded this letter by Monsignor Dunn, Dunn was thoughtful enough to write another note saying he had received another letter of complaint from the same person and that O'Farrell should not bother about the matter, so insignificant did Dunn now think it after the reception of the second letter.<sup>399</sup>

In the early years of the commissariate and province, the New York Carmelites solicited subscriptions from the Italian members of their parishes for the fine Carmelite publication, II Monte Carmelo. Elias Vella and Simon Farrington were especially active in this sending the money and names on to Antonio Franco in Rome.<sup>400</sup>

The souvenir journal for 28th Street's Grand Carmelite Bazaar, April 17-30, 1922 listed Denis O'Connor as the chairman, and calls him, "Pro. Provincial." Christopher Slattery, the vice chairman, is listed as assistant general. A picture of the Carmelite school's violin class has Magennis and O'Connor seated with Liam Mellows in the midst of the pupils. The present priory of St. Albert's Middletown, is shown as "Carmelite Novitiate." Gaelic dancing classes and a Boys' Band were other activities illustrated. Musical programs were held each night of the bazaar and each night during the second week, a different Branch of the American Association for the Recognition of the Irish Republic was featured at the affair.<sup>401</sup>

O'Farrell left early for that chapter of 1922 not only to take his holidays and visit his family but also to preach the novena for the feast of Our Lady of Mt. Carmel (July 16) at the Whitefriars Street church in Dublin.

---

<sup>396</sup> Report, Dec 31, 1921, CG, Hib(1906-21).

<sup>397</sup> Report, Apr 18, 1922, CG, Hib, Capit et Cong (1900-64).

<sup>398</sup> Magennis to Priors, Rome, June 25, 1922, CG, Generali 2.

<sup>399</sup> Dunn to O'Farrell, New York, Jan 11, 1922, ANYP.

<sup>400</sup> CG, Am Sti Eliae (1922-38) passim.

<sup>401</sup> Souvenir Program, Grand Carmelite Bazaar, Apr 17-30, 1922, Carmelite Library, Institutum 'Carmelitanum, Rome, Carmel III, 47 int 17.

In O'Farrell's absence, a report that he was offered the position of Irish provincial but refused it to return to St. Simon's became widespread. So on his return, a reception and presentation was tendered him that September with a purse of \$10,000 in gold for the parish debt.<sup>402</sup>

At the Irish Chapter of 1922, Denis O'Connor represented 28th Street, Angelus Rabbit represented Middletown while the other Middletown house had Gerard O'Farrell as its "procuratorem" and he also represented the Bronx. O'Connor represented Tarrytown and Simon Farrington was there in its name, too. Dominic Hastings, as the socius of the New York prior was the only other man present from the United States.

Magennis ruled that Simon Farrington, as vicar prior of Tarrytown since the death of Southwell that May, could vote for that house. Magennis praised Albert Colfer for having at Kinsale the best student training. Before any voting, he appointed Denis O'Connor the procurator provincial in America because of, as he put it, increasing difficulties. Magennis said he did this because there was a seminary open and students in it. This made the hope of an autonomous province and for this and other reasons, it should be a commissary general - a step in the formation of a province.

John Cogan was elected provincial for his fourth term. The superiors of all the American houses were returned to their same positions.<sup>403</sup>

The archbishop of New York, over a period of more than twenty years, had asked the Carmelite curia to establish the Carmelites in his archdiocese in an autonomous group with their own superiors and training facilities. The distance from Ireland and the major superior, the different character of the people in the United States and the need for a separate novitiate for American candidates are reasons advanced for the separation and establishment of another jurisdiction. The archbishop of New York had no one to contact when he wanted to deal with the Carmelite parishes in his jurisdiction. The constant changing of men to and from the United States prevented the living of a good religious life. There was the hope of a province in the future. The men in the United States agreed to separation and the matter was discussed at the 1922 Irish Chapter and had been gone over by the council of the order. These are the reasons placed in a document to be sent to the Holy See to petition the erection of a commissary general. This document was dated March 5, 1923.<sup>404</sup>

---

<sup>402</sup> Unidentified clippings, St. Simon Stock scrapbook, ANYP.

<sup>403</sup> Acta Capituli Provincialis, Sept 7, 1922, CG, Hib, 'Capit et Cong (1900-64); Analecta Ordinis Carmelitarum, V(1923-6)58.

<sup>404</sup> N. IV America S. P. . Eliae, erectio Commissariatus, Mar 5, 1923 CG, Am Sti Eliae(1922-38).

When O'Farrell returned from the 1922 chapter, he gave a speech at the reception tended him and announced that a commissary would be formed to serve the people better.<sup>405</sup> That October, Denis O'Connor sent a donation to the Holy Father in the name of the commissariat.<sup>406</sup> A grant was made by the Sacred Congregation of Religious on January 23, 1923 that allowed the order to transfer the novitiate from Tarrytown to Middletown<sup>407</sup> and also by rescript of January 27 to make on March 7, Stephen McGleenan the novice master despite his lack of the requisite age.<sup>408</sup>

A report of John Cogan to Rome states that the Commissary was established in 1922<sup>409</sup> and the Analeeta Ordinis Cartnelitarum lists it for the same year.<sup>410</sup>

We mention these things because there is extant no official document establishing the commissariate. The letter of petition that was drawn up and to be sent to the Congregation of Religious in Rome was not necessary and seems not to have been sent. It is our contention that the establishment of the commissary general was totally dependent on the Carmelite Order. Someone in Rome drew up the petition but it was never filed when it was discovered that it was not necessary. There is no record of this petition being sent the Congregation of Religious. So the establishment of the commissary general would have to be the Irish chapter, convened September 7, 1922.

Francis Ronayne was named a consultor to the Sacred Congregation for Religious on March 6, 1923<sup>411</sup> and in that July, Elias Varglien, later to work in the New York province, was named the vicar provincial for Pernambuco.<sup>412</sup>

Life at St. Simon's was not all serious and O'Farrell acquired a third dog, presumably to replace the second. A story from March, 1923, involving the dog follows:

Father O'Farrell, of St. Simon Stock's 182nd and Valentine Ave., has a prize-winning Irish terrier named Pat. Pat is endowed with a high sense of

---

<sup>405</sup> Speech, O'Farrell, Sept 18, 1922, ANYP.

<sup>406</sup> Segreteria di Stato, Vatican City, Oct 7, 1922, ANYP.

<sup>407</sup> Rescript, Rome, Jan 30, 1923, p 923, Reg Fol 177, ANYP.

<sup>408</sup> Rescript, Rome, Mar 7, 1923, n.p., Reg Fol 177, ANYP.

<sup>409</sup> "Relatio Status Provinciae Hiberniae," June 30, 1923, CG, Hib, Historia" Statuta, Statistica, Rhodesia.

<sup>410</sup> Analecta Ordinis Carmelitarum V(1923-6)58.

<sup>411</sup> Ibid., 227.

<sup>412</sup> Ibid., 228.



fairness, but his judgment is not in the same class, in the opinion of an electrician who was boosting another up the tree under which Pat is tied. Pat thought the booster was roughhousing the other and promptly sunk his teeth in said booster's leg. Work stopped right there in Pat's sphere of influence, until Father O'Farrell was able to convince the good-intentioned Pat that he was the victim, or rather, the electrician was-of mistaken zeal.<sup>413</sup>

In 1923, O'Farrell was reported as declining the position of assistant general for the English speaking provinces of the order.<sup>414</sup> This was a false report as Charles Ronayne had assumed this position in 1921 on the resignation of Aloysius Slattery, and would function as such until 1925.

Some of the early fund raisers at St. Simon Stock showed some imagination and were quite innovative. A Baby Show, presumably a beauty contest, for example, was featured at the 1923 bazaar.<sup>415</sup>

An examination of the account book of the parish and priory of St. Simon Stock reveals that the community lived a rather ordinary life expending very little in luxury items. The only unusual expense was for a dog license and an unusual practice was that food expenses were taken from the account of the Carmelite Fathers instead of the parish.<sup>416</sup>

In July, 1923, Gerard O'Farrell was able to announce that the St. Simon Stock parish had decided to build a school. The plan was to raise the needed \$50,000 and not contract an additional debt. He announced a lawn party for that September as one of the fund raising affairs. He asked each family to give \$50 but this could be in the form of ticket sales. Each family that did this would be given the title of "Pioneer Family."<sup>417</sup>

Francis Ronayne was in New York to preach the Our Lady of Mt. Carmel novena. The church was packed closing night and there was a procession around the block. He also saw Gerard O'Farrell about a project he and Magennis alone knew about. It was not mentioned but apparently they wanted O'Farrell to assume some position in Rome. Ronayne had lunch with O'Farrell in the Bronx and reported to Magennis that he was willing but really wanted to remain in New York and the new parish. Ronayne was going to see Archbishop Hayes to get an

---

<sup>413</sup> Unidentified clipping, St. Simon Stock scrapbook, ANYP.

<sup>414</sup> Ibid.

<sup>415</sup> Ibid.

<sup>416</sup> Journal, Church of St. Simon Stock (1919-35), ANYP.

<sup>417</sup> O'Farrell to parishoners, Bronx, July 23, 1923, ANYP.

assurance O'Farrell could return to the Bronx parish after he had completed the task they had for him in Rome. With that assurance, Ronayne felt O'Farrell would surely go.

Ronayne also wanted to see the officials of the commissariate before he returned to Rome. One item was the \$43,000 for the new building at St. Albert's and another was Hugh Devlin. Ronayne had converted O'Connor to his view that Hugh should go out of 28th Street. O'Connor was for sending him to Tarrytown but Ronayne's view was "however Hughie will always have a sore head, and consequently I think that it is better that he should be sent to hos [sic] dear homeland."<sup>418</sup>

Denis O'Connor died at St. Vincents Hospital on March 1, 1924. One account has him falling to a heart attack that struck after he had preached. He died a few days later.<sup>419</sup> Another has the cause as septic pneumonia.<sup>420</sup> Another has him dying in St. Vincent's of a heart attack after being ill there for several weeks.<sup>421</sup> Irish circles mourned him and tributes were printed.<sup>422</sup> Dominic of Cork, as he had done on the occasion of the death of another patriot, Liam Mellows, sent a letter of condolence to the Carmelite Council of the AARIR. The Gaelic-American, because of O'Connor's support of DeValera, saw fit to skip even a notice of his death.<sup>423</sup>

Denis O'Connor had been sick for some time before his death. It is hard to discern how long he had been incapacitated but notification of his illness had been sent to Rome. Instructions from Ronayne had come to New York in time for a meeting of the consultors - Gerhard, Farrington, McGouran and O'Farrell on February 17, 1924. McGouran had been placed in charge of the 28th Street community and called into the meeting. It was at McGouran's suggestion that O'Farrell was appointed to assume O'Connor's duties as commissary general and also take over his personal effects and correspondence.<sup>424</sup> After O'Connor's death, this was confirmed by Rome and O'Farrell was given the title of Custos.<sup>425</sup>

---

<sup>418</sup> Ronayne to Magennis, New York, July 23, 1923, CG, Am Sti Eliae (1922-38).

<sup>419</sup> Analecta Ordinis Carmelitarum V(1923-6)226-7.

<sup>420</sup> P. McCartan, With De Valera in America (New York, 1932) 40.

<sup>421</sup> New York Times (Mar 2, 1924)22. This article lists his family as a sister, Annie; two brothers, Dr. John of Wexford and Brother Carmel of Middletown. This latter is Carmel Lynn, a cousin of O'Connor. Conversation, C. Lynn, May 19, 1980.

<sup>422</sup> Irish World (New York), Mar 8, 1924, 3; The Catholic News (New York) Mar 8, 1924, 2.

<sup>423</sup> Dominic to Flanagan, Bend, Nov 25, 1923 and Mar 25, 1924, ANYP.

<sup>424</sup> Gaelic-American (New York) Mar 8, 1924.

<sup>425</sup> Consultors Minutes, Feb 17, 1924, ANYP.

That August, Magennis was in New York and presided at a meeting of the custos or vicar commissary general and his consultants. It was decided to submit three names to Rome for the position of commissary. Magennis specified that two should be from the commissary and one from the Irish province. He promised to place these personally before the curia for the appointment. The names unanimously agreed upon were O'Farrell, Gerhard and Colfer.<sup>426</sup>

Magennis, writing to Antonio Franco that summer told him that the problems, apparently of the Chicago province, were not solved. Priests were needed and Magennis was going to ask Ireland for help. Students had increased in America to 124 in three years. This optimism was toned down by the death of Denis O'Connor. "The death of O'Connor was a calamity not only for the Commissariat but specially for us in Rome because the Fathers can't help as he did; we miss friends."<sup>427</sup>

On the first anniversary of the death of Denis Finbar O'Connor, the Carmelites held a commemorative service in their school hall. The main address was given by the Vincentian, John P. Ewens. The whole of the fifteen page manuscript is in a poetic and figurative style. Ewens took shots at the English throughout the speech by saying that the public education O'Connor had aimed at making the Irish English subjects, that he had come before the "Great War" to the only declared Irish monastery in New York City and that he had organized forces against Irish conscription. He mentioned how many on the run O'Connor had harbored. Ewens by his mention of an "Alien Free State Government" showed that he, like many of the Carmelites, was anti-treaty.<sup>428</sup>

The loss of Denis O'Connor, the first commissary general of the fledgling New York Carmelites, was indeed very great. He was but fifty-two years old and had served in 28th Street and Tarrytown. Unfortunately, a letter explaining the illness of O'Connor never arrived in Rome. The only word they had was of his death. It was then that Gerard O'Farrell was told to act as custos until Elias Magennis, then leaving for Australia, would arrive in June.<sup>429</sup>

---

<sup>426</sup> Ibid., Apr 9, 1924, ANYP.

<sup>427</sup> Magennis to Franco, New York, /Aug 11, 1924/, CG, Generali 2.

<sup>428</sup> "Address in Commemoration of Denis Finbar O'Connor," CG, Am St Eliae, BTMNY.

<sup>429</sup> Ronayne to O'Farrell, Rome, Mar 8, 1924, ANYP.

## CHAPTER IX

### O'Farrell Takes the Reins

Francis Ronayne, as a friend writing unofficially, told O'Farrell what was holding up his confirmation as commissary general was that the curia wanted to follow Canon Law and was also aware overwork had killed Denis O'Connor. They did not want him to hold the positions of commissary general and pastor of St. Simon Stock. The latter would also tie him there as a resident. Ronayne left the solution to him and asked to let Rome know what it was.<sup>430</sup> O'Farrell cabled or sent word to Rome some other way that he would resign the pastorate for on November 3, 1924, Magennis named him the commissary general calling the group the Irish-American Commissariate of St. Simon Stock.<sup>431</sup>

When he received word of his appointment, O'Farrell wrote to Rome that he would indeed resign the pastorate and would ask the consultors to appoint Elias Vella in his stead. He would reside at St. Simon Stock's but would be free to do the duties and travel demanded by his new office. He then wrote these touching and beautiful words:

"I received your communication re the wishes of the Curia regarding my appointment to be Commissary-General of the Irish-American Commissariate, and in the first place I wish to express my heartfelt gratitude to Father General, yourself, and the other Fathers of the Curia for the honour conferred and I hope that with the all-powerful aid of Divine Providence I will fulfill the trust placed in me and make the Order of Carmel better known and hence better loved in this great Republic."<sup>432</sup>

On January 5, O'Farrell submitted Vella's name to the Cardinal who named him pastor of St. Simon Stock.<sup>433</sup>

One of the first dealings O'Farrell had as commissary general was to attend to a dispensation for student Eunan Murphy.<sup>434</sup> Writing back, Francis Ronayne told him Denis O'Connor had paid

---

<sup>430</sup> Ronayne to O'Farrell, Rome, Oct 28, 1924, ANYP.

<sup>431</sup> Decree, E. Magennis, Rome, Nov 3, 1924, ANYP; unidentified clippings, St. Simon Stock scrapbook, ANYP.

<sup>432</sup> O'Farrell to Ronayne, Bronx, Dec 8, 1924; Consultors Minutes, Nov 27, 1924, ANYP.

<sup>433</sup> Carroll to O'Farrell, New York, Jan 12, 1925, ANYP.

fifty pounds sterling for each student at San Alberto. Out of this Ronayne had taken all expenses including things like the transportation home of Eunan Murphy and Mel Daly's violin lessons. He also asked O'Farrell to send Denis O'Connor's violin to Rome as Daly needed it. These extra expenses were possible only because O'Connor had been very generous in sending money, as he put it, "extra rent."

Ronayne planned to send John Maher to Ireland for the summer since all of his Irish novitiate classmates were going. Ronayne was willing, too, to look for novices for O'Farrell but wanted the backing of O'Farrell's consultors so that the matter would be done in a businesslike manner. Ronayne promised to visit O'Farrell's mother when he went to Ireland for a novena. This would be an easy task as he planned on using the same material he had preached in New York the previous year. As Ronayne himself put it, "By the way, some of the old horses you admired in my oratorical displays last year are likely to be brought up to do a canter or two in Aungier Street."

Ronayne also told O'Farrell he had learned well in Rome how to get along with Magennis and adjust to the ceremony and solemnity he demanded.<sup>435</sup> A puzzling comment but perhaps a lesson was intended for O'Farrell.

Towards the end of 1924, Elias Magennis wrote O'Farrell to warn him a letter had been sent to Rome depicting him in not too complimentary a fashion. Magennis wanted to alert him and told him it contained second hand information and complained of things like O'Farrell having a car. Magennis felt this comparison of the Carmelite life style with that of other religious in New York was damaging. The letter had been prompted by the publicity attendant to O'Farrell's appointment as commissary general. This attention, Magennis felt, was good for vocations and donations but it also moved personal enemies to action.

Magennis was happy to hear in a recent letter from O'Farrell that things were going along all right and was doubly happy when Dionysius Flanagan wrote in- the same vein,

Going into his usual cablegram type of writing, Magennis mentioned an Italian priest in Rome wanted to go to the United States and urged O'Farrell to accept him. Advising him not to look for too much from ecclesiastical authorities, citing the privilege of third year theology ordination as being cloudy and pushing the pilgrimage of the Confraternity and the Third Order for the Holy Year of 1925, Magennis ended his letter by warning O'Farrell he and the other delegates to the general chapter might have to come to Rome as much as a month before its October start.<sup>436</sup>

---

<sup>434</sup> Ronayne to O'Farrell, Rome, Mar 8, 1924; Murphy to O'Farrell, New York, Apr 26, 1924, both ANYP; dispensation is Mar 21, 1924, Reg. fol. 178.

<sup>435</sup> Ronayne to O'Farrell, Rome, July 6, 1924, ANYP.

<sup>436</sup> Magennis to O'Farrell, Rome, Dec 27, 1924, ANYP.

Elias Magennis encouraged O'Farrell, "Keep on the good work for there is much of it to be done and the Irishmen at home are not going to do much of the spade-work. I really think they are beyond redemption." He congratulated Elias Vella on becoming the pastor of St. Simon Stock and mentioned Simon Vital as being a vocation prospect.<sup>437</sup>

In answering him, O'Farrell mentioned the crank letters sent to Rome seem to have led Magennis to think that where there was smoke, there was fire. O'Farrell told him not to worry for he could take the heat. He told the general Vital was coming as a student and that Magennis' friend Alphonsus Metcalf had been rejected. He promised to get together the financial report of the commissary since the death of O'Connor and regretted he could not do more, being prevented from this by the poor business ability of some of the superiors. He cited one instance, "Fr. Farrington is an obstacle to progress. A change in the Middletown parish will be necessary when the opportunity presents itself." Because he expected to profess eight novices in August, he wanted to know how many he could send on to Rome for studies. He had appointed McGouran novice master and "He has already shown the wisdom of the choice." He had to send Joseph Borg to Tarrytown where he was not happy and Albert Metcalf to St. Simon Stock. He expected an Italian from Rome and O'Farrell planned to place him in the Middletown parish.<sup>438</sup>

Magennis cast gloom on prospects by stating the Italian was not found to be good and a Spaniard named Cuevas would be sent in his stead. Other bad news from Rome was that Elias Holland had scarlet fever and Brocard Whelan was slowing his ordination process by not sending his records to Rome.<sup>439</sup>

Francis Ronayne got into the act over the Spanish Carmelite saying he would arrive around April 10, that he could be novice master and was to remain for one year. Ronayne was good enough to buy him an outfit but sent O'Farrell the bill. Ronayne was coming to New York for the July 16th novena in 28th Street and wanted a retreat before and one after the novena.<sup>440</sup>

Magennis expected Cuevas to be in New York by April 1, Stating he was a good musician, Magennis admitted the man would have a problem with English but would get over it in time.<sup>441</sup>

---

<sup>437</sup> Same to same, Rome, Jan 11, [1924], ANYP.

<sup>438</sup> O'Farrell to Magennis, Bronx, Feb 11, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>439</sup> Magennis to O'Farrell, Rome, Mar 9, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>440</sup> Ronayne to O'Farrell, Rome, Mar 28, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>441</sup> Magennis to O'Farrell, Rome, Apr 1, 1925, ANYP.

When O'Farrell replied to him, he did not mention Cuevas but he did tell Magennis he had bought more land at St. Albert's - the Maybee parcel - and planned to make a cemetery there. He would bring O'Connor's body there for re-burial but not those of the others as they were not members of the commissary. St. Simon's priory would be ready in August while the school would be finished in December. The Middletown church was ready for its dedication on October 1 and with building at St. Albert's, he did not see how he could get to Rome in September but would go later on. He had to change Borg from Tarrytown sending Hugh Devlin there because of his not being well.<sup>442</sup>

Magennis saw the cemetery idea as good but felt those left at Calvary would be forgotten. He told O'Farrell to be in Rome September 1 and let him know he had considered him for provincial in Ireland but would not let his name go up as he thought he could do more for the commissary. Magennis commented that Ireland was not doing well and the 1925 chapter was his last chance to get them going. He was horrified that O'Farrell had not read his book on the scapular and told him to continue promoting the Third Order and the Confraternity, "to us this always synchronises [sic] with progress."<sup>443</sup> Magennis' book referred to was The Sabbatine Privilege and the Scapular published in 1923.

Magennis wrote again later that same month to say that his friend Katherine Hughes had died and that all funds she and others raised for the Irish movement were being squandered by "those other villains." He told O'Farrell he had given Bishop Dunn and his traveling companions a good time in Rome, that Ronayne was on his way and that he had heard Cuevas was not happy at St. Albert's but would have to remain at least until he earned his passage money. O'Farrell made Coffey prior of St. Albert's and this caused Magennis to comment, "Poor Fr. McGouran [sic] as a master in the spiritual life and Fr. Coffey as Prior or head of the place which is the same thing does not appear a very imposing array for the manufacture of future men of the Order."<sup>444</sup>

Cuevas was in the United States for a while before he was granted faculties. He did receive them towards the end of that May but they were given with the understanding he was stationed permanently at the novitiate. There was a limit on the faculties as the extent of their exercise was left to the judgment of O'Farrell.<sup>445</sup> As will be seen in another case, the archdiocese was cautious in this period in admitting foreign priests, especially those of Italian nationality.

---

<sup>442</sup> O'Farrell to Magennis, Bronx, Apr 14, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>443</sup> Magennis to O'Farrell, Rome, May 1, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>444</sup> Same to same, Rome, May 26, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>445</sup> Carroll to O'Farrell, New York, May 27, 1925; same to same, New York, June 1, 1925, ANYP.

The commissariate was interested in obtaining the services of- sisters to do domestic work at St. Albert's. O'Farrell wrote the Carmelites at Niagara, who had brought German Franciscan sisters from Dilinger, Bavaria, for these chores. He learned they did the laundry and mending, as well as the kitchen and dining room work. Each was paid \$20 a month but the Carmelites hoped to cut this salary. They opined that despite the initial expense, money would be saved in the long run as expenses had already been cut.<sup>446</sup> Despite the obvious benefits of the sisters, the matter was not acted upon although it was discussed at two meetings of the consultors.<sup>447</sup>

A Maltese Carmelite, Luigi Mecallef, was suspected of being in New York and seeking a bishop. Ronayne wrote O'Farrell to tell him the curia had no objections to his secularization but would not permit him to enter any diocese where there was a Carmelite house. Mecallef supposedly had seen Bishop Dunn and was presumed to be trying to enter the New York archdiocese. Ronayne instructed O'Farrell that if Mecallef had seen Dunn, then he should make a formal protest at the chancery in the name of the curia. Mecallef was also not to celebrate Mass in any of the Carmelite churches.<sup>448</sup>

There was a priest in the archdiocese of Newark named Francis Sexton. He was involved in a canonical irregularity but seems to have been in no personal difficulty. Bishop O'Connor, his ordinary, would not place any obstacle in Sexton's way as he attempted to regularize himself but at the same time he was not willing to give him a celebrant. Without that, Sexton himself said, how can anyone accept me? The bishop did relent and promised him a celebrant provided Cardinal Hayes of New York would let him use it.<sup>449</sup>

Gerard O'Farrell promised to place the matter before his consultors in about a month.<sup>450</sup> At that meeting, they decided to open the hospitality of Our Lady of Mt. Carmel, Middletown to Sexton provided he had a celebrant in the archdiocese of New York.<sup>451</sup> Sexton was unable to obtain this and O'Connor, his ordinary, did support him promising a celebrant provided he was acceptable to the local authorities. O'Farrell wrote Sexton the sad news that he would not get a celebrant in New York and repeated the offer of O'Connor apparently to show the priest that whatever difficulty he had was of his own making and not of his bishop. O'Farrell closed the

---

<sup>446</sup> Galligan to O'Farrell, Niagara Falls, Dec 30, 1924, ANYP.

<sup>447</sup> Consultors Minutes, Jan 14, June 22, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>448</sup> Ronayne to O'Farrell, Rome, Nov 12, 1924, ANYP.

<sup>449</sup> Duffy to O'Farrell, S. Orange, Dec 17, 1924, ANYP.

<sup>450</sup> O'Farrell to Duffy, Bronx, Dec 22, 1924, ANYP.

<sup>451</sup> Same to same, Bronx, Jan 16, 1925, ANYP.



matter for himself by saying that he was sorry and was just too glad to offer him the hospitality of Our Lady of Mt. Carmel.<sup>452</sup>

When Philip McGouran was the acting-pastor of the 28th Street parish in 1924, the bazaar was held from April 21 to 30 in the school hall. The American Association for the Recognition of the Irish Republic and other similar organizations had "Banner Nights." Shortly after, on May 11, the school children had a song and dance program in the hall.<sup>453</sup>

Despite O'Farrell's attempts to obtain the services of the recently created Cardinal Hayes for the cornerstone ceremony of the priory and school at St. Simon Stock, he was told that Father Breslin would be the officiant. Bishop Dunn, who sent him this bad news, also told him he only had to send on the notes for the construction payment and Dunn would sign and return them.<sup>454</sup> To deny O'Farrell the favor of the Cardinal's presence hurt Bishop Dunn. Despite the refusal, he was kind in the note. Evidence of this friendship is seen a few months later in an exchange of notes that followed O'Farrell attending Mass at Dunn's church and presenting him with a New Year's gift of \$200.<sup>455</sup> Also, when Cardinal Hayes was returning from a Roman visit, Bishop Dunn invited Gerard O'Farrell to be one of the limited number of lay and clerical welcomers at the pier.<sup>456</sup>

In January, 1925, the construction of the St. Simon Stock priory, school and auditorium was officially announced. Both structures were to be three stories high and the school was to have eighteen classrooms for 1,000 children. The cost was estimated to be \$300,000. The original mansion, whose first floor had been used as a church and whose second story served as a priory, had to be moved from the site at Valentine Avenue and 182nd Street. It was bought by a contractor who moved it intact to a Ryer Avenue site and converted it to a two family dwelling.

This house had been built by a local developer named Flynn who lost it in bankruptcy to Isaac Roth. It was from him that O'Farrell had purchased the home and land. While the construction of the priory was in progress, the fathers lived in a rented house at 2212 Valentine Avenue.<sup>457</sup>

---

<sup>452</sup> Duffy to O'Farrell, S. Orange, Jan 24, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>453</sup> Souvenir Program, Carmelite Bazaar, 1924, ANYP.

<sup>454</sup> Dunn to O'Farrell, New York, Nov 19, 1924, ANYP

<sup>455</sup> Same to same, New York, Jan 1, 1925, Jan 2, 1925; Account Book, Irish-American Commissary, 1924-42, both in ANYP.

<sup>456</sup> Dunn to O'Farrell, New York, Feb 1, 1926, ANYP.

<sup>457</sup> St. Simon Stock scrapbook, ANYP.

For a while there was a rumor the Christian Brothers were not happy with the Carmelite confessors in one of their New York places. A change seems to have been imminent in 1924, probably at the request of the brothers.<sup>458</sup> Five months later, this position was changed and the provincial of the brothers wrote to say they did not want to change the Carmelites. All the movement to change, he attributed to the rumor the Carmelites were too busy.<sup>459</sup>

The post of novice master caused the commissariate a lingering problem. Stephen McGleenan was the master in 1923 and trying to resign but he was not allowed.<sup>460</sup> Two months later, however, the resignation was submitted again and this time it was accepted. Lawrence Flanagan was appointed in his stead.<sup>461</sup> When Denis O'Connor died, transfers were made in the Manhattan and Bronx parishes. Lawrence Flanagan became the prior and pastor in 28th Street and in his place, Joseph Borg was made novice master.<sup>462</sup> In January, 1925, Borg was transferred to Tarrytown and Philip McGouran took over the master's post.<sup>463</sup> This last appointment was made after the commissariate sought to have Tabone, the onetime prior of San Celso, come to the United States as novice master. When he would not, Elias Magennis advanced the opinion to Gerard O'Farrell that Hugh Devlin would be a good man for the job, at least until he was called home to Ireland. Louis Gerhard was the other name he suggested for the post.<sup>464</sup> McGouran was temporarily replaced in December, 1925 by Elias Varglien.<sup>465</sup>

Gerard O'Farrell had a plan for Carmel in the United States. He mentioned this to Lawrence Diether, the American province's provincial, who in turn mentioned the matter to Hilary Doswald who was anxious to learn of the plan.<sup>466</sup> A problem of the availability of scapulars for some service developed in Chicago and Diether had to call O'Farrell for help.<sup>467</sup> Diether was still anxious to talk about the plan and suggested to O'Farrell that he come to Chicago that

---

<sup>458</sup> Dunn to O'Farrell, New York, Nov 19, 1924, ANYP.

<sup>459</sup> Leo to McIntyre, Waltham, Apr 27, 1925; Dunn to O'Farrell, New York, May 1, 1925 both ANYP.

<sup>460</sup> Consultors Minutes, Sept 13, 1923, ANYP.

<sup>461</sup> Ibid., Nov 29, 1923; Document of Appointment, Nov 30, 1923, both ANYP.

<sup>462</sup> Consultors Minutes, Aug 19, 1924, ANYP.

<sup>463</sup> Ibid., Jan 14; 1925.

<sup>464</sup> Magennis to O'Farrell, Rome, Dec 14, /1924\_7; same to same, Dec 27, [1924] both ANYP.

<sup>465</sup> Consultors Minutes, Dec 9, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>466</sup> Doswald to O'Farrell, Chicago, Dec 17, 1924, ANYP.

<sup>467</sup> Diether to O'Farrell, Chicago, Feb 19, 1925; O'Farrell to Diether, Bronx, Feb 27, 1925, ANYP.

summer with Francis Ronayne or travel with Diether to Rome for the general chapter. The plan involved the propagation of the Scapular devotion.<sup>468</sup> The failure to communicate his plan was a disappointment to O'Farrell too, but he had been busy reporting to Cardinal Hayes on the fathers and also doing some missionary work. He did promise to go west with Ronayne and then plan to travel to Rome with Diether.<sup>469</sup>

At the end of 1924, the commissariate seems to have been going along at a good pace. 28th Street had 2034 persons attending Mass one Sunday, but 453 of those did not pay the dime for the seat collection taken at the door.<sup>470</sup>

Notice was sent out by O'Farrell that the 1924 reports were due and from these the 15% tax for the Commissary Fund would be determined. He also reminded treasurers that all surplus Masses were to be forwarded to him and he would send them on to Rome.<sup>471</sup> St. Simon Stock had a budget of \$107,331.79 and a surplus of \$53,615.21. A lawn party that year earned almost \$8,000 and \$5,000 was paid on the mortgage.<sup>472</sup> The Tarrytown report is not extant but when Simon Farrington sent it in, he gave "you" or the president of the chapter full power to act for him. He delegated because he was not sure whether he had rights or not.<sup>473</sup>

Financial reports from the commissary were gathered in Rome for the 1925 general chapter. For a five year period (1920-5) receipts varied from \$31,970 to \$53,555 while expenses for the same time went from \$31,472 to 46 \$53,735. Each year ended with a small balance.<sup>474</sup> One year, 1920-1, saw \$28,310 being sent to St. Albert's, probably including funds for construction.<sup>475</sup>

The gross income figures of Transfiguration, Tarrytown, went from \$13,196 in 1920 to \$16,476 in 1925 and expenses rose in almost the same amounts. The entire period ended with a balance of \$328. The salaries of the fathers increased almost a \$1,000 during this time and contributions

---

<sup>468</sup> Diether to O'Farrell, Chicago, Mar 25, 1925; Consultors Minutes, Jan 14, 1925, both ANYP.

<sup>469</sup> O'Farrell to Diether, Bronx, Mar 27, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>470</sup> 28th Street Report, [1924], ANYP.

<sup>471</sup> O'Farrell to Flanagan, Bronx, Jan 3, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>472</sup> Financial Statement, St. Simon Stock, Dec 31, 1924, ANYP.

<sup>473</sup> Farrington to O'Farrell, Tarrytown, [1924], ANYP.

<sup>474</sup> Financial Statement, Community of 338 E. 29th St., Parish of Our Lady of the Scapular, Aug 2, 1925, in CG, Am Sti Eliae, BTMNY.

<sup>475</sup> Our Lady of Mt. Carmel, Financial Statement," Aug, 1920 - July, 1921 in *ibid*.

to the novitiate fund went from a low of \$600 to a high of \$1,500 for a total of \$4,700. In the last year of this period, the fathers loaned the parish \$900 for painting the church.<sup>476</sup>

The Tarrytown parish in 1921 was able to pay for all house expenses. The church debt in this time was \$19,500. I.H. Poole had drawn plans for the proposed college at Tarrytown and the fathers paid his heirs \$250 for this work.<sup>477</sup>

The 1921 report for the Middletown parish listed the accounts of each mission separately. In the previous two years, the debt had been reduced by almost \$11,000, and at the end of the report period there was \$7,529 banked and \$5,000 in Liberty Bonds.<sup>478</sup> The five year report for the parish has the income of the fathers varying from \$3,295 to \$4,391 and the expenses from \$4,087 to \$2,987. These expenses probably include the amounts sent each year to the commissary treasurer. The balance was from \$190 to \$446. The expenses of the parish were in the range of \$15,000 to \$16,000 except for \$10,575 in 1925 and \$20,291 in 1924. The figures are indicative of a generally healthy financial picture but there was no school in the parish. A "Building Fund" had a total of \$35,327.80 and by 1927, the debt of the parish was \$92,000 but by 1930, it had been reduced to 51 \$71,000.<sup>479</sup>

The 1921 report of St. Simon Stock disclosed that \$54,000 had been paid for the parish's land and the church's cost was approximately \$122,678. With what had been paid out, there was left a debt of \$131,159.<sup>480</sup> By 1925, \$5,000 was being reduced on the debt each year. Receipts in 1923 and 1924 jumped to about \$65,000 but this was brought about by fund raising for the church, school and priory complex.<sup>481</sup>

The 1925 report of St. Albert's lists no amounts but rather seems to be a survey of places that income was expected from. Supply work in the parishes and missions was the principal source. Money for work done in these places in 1923 and due was \$2,000 while a loan of \$1,700 to the Middletown parish to square Father Rabbit's account was also outstanding.<sup>482</sup>

---

<sup>476</sup> Financial Statement, Carmelite Convent, Tarrytown (1919-25), in ibid.

<sup>477</sup> Carmelite Fathers in Account with Tarrytown Parish, June 30, 1921 in ibid.

<sup>478</sup> Financial Report, Our Lady of Mt. Carmel, Middletown, 1921 in ibid.

<sup>479</sup> Ibid., 1920-5 in ibid.

<sup>480</sup> Condensed Report of the Church and Priory of St. Simon Stock, 1921 in ibid.

<sup>481</sup> Financial Statement of the Parish of St. Simon Stock, Bronx, N. Y., 1920-5 in ibid.

<sup>482</sup> Report, St. Albert's, Middletown, N.Y, CG, Hib(1900-5).

The financial report for the year 1924-5 was prepared for the Irish chapter of 1925. The account of the "Irish-American Commissariate" ended the period with a balance of about \$5,000 and the expenses had nothing unusual except that each house had a "Commissary Fund" to which they contributed some of their surplus. \$17,000 was spent on St. Albert's, almost \$900 was contributed to "Irish Provincial Fund, Novices," a priest was transported to South America for \$210, eight students in Chicago and one in Rome were supported and the brother of one of the Carmelites was buried for \$143. Assets included \$26,750 in securities which earned \$3,700 that year.<sup>483</sup>

The 1925 chapter opened in Dublin on July 27 with Elias Magennis presiding. Richard J. Colfer was elected provincial on the first ballot. The chapter produced no changes in the American houses, all superiors being returned to office. No decrees were listed and no directions for the administration to pursue were stated.

Some statistics gathered together by O'Farrell show the gradual growth of the commissariate and potential it indicated. They were for 1920-1925.<sup>484</sup>

	<u>1920</u>	<u>1921</u>	<u>1922</u>	<u>1923</u>	<u>1924</u>	<u>1925</u>
Priests dismissed or died	0	0	0	0	1	0
Solemnly Professed	0	0	0	0	1	1
Simply Professed	0	1	1	2	8	7
Novices	1	2	1	8	10	9
Postulants	6	5	5	4	13	6
Mariani	1	0	0	0	1	1

When Gerard O'Farrell sent in his annual report in January, 1924, he was able to report twelve Mariani and eight clerical novices. There were four students in simple vows and also one priest-student. Nine of his priests were below forty and seven above.<sup>485</sup> A report of that September

---

<sup>483</sup> "Financial Statement of the Irish-American Commissariate," May 16, 1924 - July 31, 1925, CG, Am Sti Eliae (1922-38).

<sup>484</sup> "Catalogas Fratrum" O'Farrell, 1925, ANYP. The one death in 1924 was that of Denis O'Connor.

<sup>485</sup> Report, Jan 1, 1924, CG, Am Sti Eliae, Cap et Cong (1931-64).

shows that all eight novices were professed to make nine in simple vows. Eleven novices and thirty Mariani were enrolled for the school year making a remarkable increase.<sup>486</sup>

Towards the end of 1924, Elias Magennis was able to write O'Farrell great news about the progress of his students Duffy, Holland, Murphy - Mrs. Dunworth's nephew - Carmel Lynn and Connolly, he called the first line students in first philosophy. He stated, "I am sorry to say they beat the Irish also." And he went on, "Murphy is going to be an A-1 lad and Connolly is a very nice chap and good religious. The poor Doc [O'Connor] did well in getting them."<sup>487</sup>

At the beginning of March, O'Farrell sent Ronayne \$2,000 for eight students for the 1924-5 school year. He promised to pay any balance left over and would give donations "extra rem" when Ronayne and Magennis would be visiting the United States.<sup>488</sup>

In March, 1925, Francis Ronayne sent a packet of letters to Gerard O'Farrell. They were written on different dates but sent together. He had a lot to tell and explain.

Ronayne had sent John Maher to Ireland for the past summer against the advice of the Irish Provincial, John Cogan. He did this only because Maher had told him that Denis O'Connor had promised this. He called Maher high-strung and said he had become contentious and disobedient. When Magennis had sent eight students back to their provinces the previous October, Maher was the most outspoken against the general's action. Because he never smoked nor drank, Ronayne could hardly admonish him. '

Kieran Hickey had been sent to Ireland the previous October for disobedience. He returned to Rome after staying for a time at Terenure and taking care of the study hall there. A plan for him to stay at the Ardavan novitiate and attend the university fell through. After he had arrived back in Rome a bill from Cogan followed. He charged him for all clothes purchased in Ireland and all living necessities as well as for pocket money for the trip to Rome.<sup>489</sup> Later that month, Ronayne was able to inform O'Farrell he had settled the matter of the bill with Cogan.<sup>490</sup> Probably Hickey's procturing work was taken in lieu of expenses.

---

<sup>486</sup> Relatio, Sept 4, 1924, in *ibid*.

<sup>487</sup> Magennis to O'Farrell, Rome, Dec 27, /1924J, ANYP. Dunworth gave \$500 to the Carmelites in February, 1926, *Journal, Irish-American Commissariate (1924-42)* 54, ANYP.

<sup>488</sup> O'Farrell to Ronayne, Bronx, Mar 2, 1925, ANYP.

47. <sup>489</sup> Ronayne to O'Farrell, Rome, Mar 9, 1924 (2 letters); enclosures: Ronayne to Cogan, Rome, Oct 22, 1924; Cogan to Ronayne, Dublin, n.d. but received Nov 10, 1924; Ronayne to Cogan, Dec 27, 1924; Cogan to Ronayne, Dublin, Jan 2, 1925; Ronayne to Cogan, Rome, Mar 2, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>490</sup> .Ronayne to O'Farrell, Rome, Mar 28, 1925, ANYP.

John Maher did write Gerard O'Farrell to express sorrow for his conduct. He promised to be an example for his confreres and a source of comfort to his superiors. In a friendly style, he mentioned the splendors of the canonization of St. Therese of Lisieux and the high regard in which Elias Magennis was held in Rome. A letter from Middletown brought him happiness with its narration of the progress made there. As he said, "Marvelous this progress!"<sup>491</sup>

Ronayne sent the October, 1924 to October 1925 bill to O'Farrell. It amounted to £ 400 for eight students. Ronayne was able to report all were satisfactory concerning discipline but that the five who had come through Middletown were very good. These would be Duffy, Holland, R. Murphy, Connolly and C. Lynn. The health of all was good except Holland whom he described as being of a delicate constitution and not very well. All were satisfactory in their studies and Mel Daly was doing well with his violin lessons. Those in philosophy had English language and literature lessons twice a week. Kieran Hickey was the secretary of the Debating Society of the English speakers and all the commissariate's students belonged to it. At that time, besides the above five who were in first year philosophy, Mel Daly was in second philosophy, Hickey in third and John Maher in second theology.<sup>492</sup>

In reply, O'Farrell reported to Ronayne he had corrected Maher as Ronayne had suggested and thought if Holland's health did not improve, he would send him to Chicago for studies.

O'Farrell also told Ronayne to make Elias Magennis aware if the number of students continued, he would have to set up his own philosophy and theology courses. So he asked him to give some extra training to the more promising students so they could be the professors. When he had his own training system, then O'Farrell would send only the better students to Rome. What brought this on was the fact that O'Farrell would have seven students for the fall term and feared Ronayne would not be able to accommodate them.<sup>493</sup>

When Magennis wrote to O'Farrell on the first of April, 1925, he wished well for St. Albert's in Middletown. He hoped it was full of students and commented, "That is the secret of your success just as it has been the secret of the poverty and misery of the Irish Province."<sup>494</sup> When O'Farrell was replying, he asked Magennis' advice on sending Holland to Chicago and apologized for Maher saying he must be corrected even if by drastic means. O'Farrell thought there were too many of this type in the order, much to its loss. He felt he could be more choosy in the future as

---

<sup>491</sup> Maher to O'Farrell, Rome, May 25, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>492</sup> Ronayne to O'Farrell, Rome, Mar 11, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>493</sup> O'Farrell to Ronayne, Bronx, Apr 20, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>494</sup> Magennis to O'Farrell, Rome, Apr 1, 1925, ANYP.

he intended to have twenty-five postulants ready to enter college that fall. Already, he had three. Seven novices would be professed and there was John Higgins whom O'Farrell was going to allow to proceed though some doubted his ability. This would - in his math not the author's - make nine or eleven for Rome in October. O'Farrell wanted to know how many could be accommodated.

Angelus Piskurich and Lawrence Murray were ready for matriculation the next year and he wanted to send them to the National University in Dublin for the honors program. Then he outlined plans for his own philosophy and theology courses seemingly with the purpose of getting Magennis behind the program.

One student was an orphan and needed a dispensation and O'Farrell complained that he had no papers for any of the students. He could find none among O'Connor's effects and was wondering what he should do.<sup>495</sup>

In responding to O'Farrell, Magennis told him to settle with Ronayne about the number of students. He felt that O'Farrell's plan for education was a sign of growth. He told him he had been recently speaking to a Jesuit about education and the hostility of ordinaries to religious. He passed on the Jesuit's advice, "Educate your men and they can't be done without."<sup>496</sup>

Rupert Connolly, who seems to have joined the American Commissariate after doing his novitiate with the Irish province, went to Rome for studies in the fall of 1924. The following year, he asked to be admitted to the Irish province. At the suggestion of Magennis, Richard Colfer, the provincial, turned him down. Magennis told O'Farrell to take him back as he was a good prospect but to insist on no vacillation in the future. O'Farrell threatened not to take him back but it was just that, a threat.<sup>497</sup> Connolly studied for three more years in Rome but was ill at the time of the finals in second year theology. He seems then to have left the order.<sup>498</sup>

Here is an interesting incident with many undertones. A Brother Finbarr, in a time of illness and upset as he said, expressed the intention of joining the Irish-American Commissariate, the name of the New York group in some correspondence. O'Farrell seems to have written him asking about his intention -and Brother Finbarr, probably a clerical student, wrote back in reply and also

---

<sup>495</sup> O'Farrell to Magennis, Bronx, Apr 14, 1925, ANYP. Concerning Higgins, cf. Consultors Minutes, Nov 9, 1923, Apr 9, 1924, ANYP.

<sup>496</sup> Magennis to O'Farrell, Rome, May 1, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>497</sup> Same to same, Rome, Nov 21, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>498</sup> Periculorum Relatio utriusque Facultatis Colegii S. Alberti de Urbe, 38, 48.



under the instructions of his provincial, John Cogan, that he did not intend and does not intend to go to America. He also expressed his sorrow for all the trouble his remark had caused.<sup>499</sup>

In the period of September, 1924 to January, 1925, nine young men wrote O'Farrell requesting information about the Carmelites. Acting as vocation director, he sent it on. Three of these were rejected outright. During the same period, a Redemptorist friend of O'Farrell's sent a promising student to St. Cyril's in Chicago thinking he was helping O'Farrell. He wrote him this good news with the comment, "What more can I do to show my interest in the good work of Our Lady of Carmel."<sup>500</sup>

Alphonsus Metcalf, brother of Albert and a former student at St. Albert's, had been asked to leave because it was thought he had a bad heart. He asked to join the Carmelites again. He had been active in the Irish troubles, was jailed and on the run for months. With this information, Elias Magennis sent on his application to O'Farrell saying it all gave the lie to the possible heart trouble. Magennis more or less, told O'Farrell to accept him as he wanted to join only the commissariate.<sup>501</sup> It was decided not to accept him.<sup>502</sup>

Cyril O'Brien, professed in September, 1923, went to Rome in the fall of 1925. That December, he wrote O'Farrell to say he could not remain because of illness and suggested that he study in the States or perhaps become a diocesan priest. He wanted to go home so badly he would even accept expulsion. In this case, he would repay the Carmelites for education and travel.<sup>503</sup> He repeated the same message with more intensity in the early part of 1926 citing stomach trouble, constipation and rashes.<sup>504</sup> By January 1, O'Brien had changed his mind, was feeling better and would give Rome a year's try.<sup>505</sup> Sending \$3,250 to Magennis, O'Farrell told him that O'Brien could study at Niagara Falls or in Ireland.<sup>506</sup> Apparently he had not gotten the letter indicating O'Brien's change of heart.

Towards the end of January, O'Farrell wrote O'Brien expressing surprise his health should be in such danger after so short a time in Rome. He told him that if health were a problem, then his

---

<sup>499</sup> Finbarr to O'Farrell, Terenure, July 24, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>500</sup> Amadlux to O'Farrell, Coeur d'Alene, Dec 16, 1924, ANYP.

<sup>501</sup> Magennis to O'Farrell, Rome, Dec 14, 1924; Metcalf to Magennis, Dunlavin, Dec 1, 1924, ANYP.

<sup>502</sup> Consultors Minutes, Jan 14, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>503</sup> O'Brien to O'Farrell, Rome, Dec 29, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>504</sup> Same to same, Rome, 1926, ANYP.

<sup>505</sup> Same to same, Rome, Jan 13, 1926, ANYP.

<sup>506</sup> O'Farrell to Magennis, Bronx, Jan 26, 1926, ANYP.

superiors there would care for him but if this came from a dislike of the regime at San Alberto, then he must obey as he had vowed himself.<sup>507</sup>

Despite his promise to try Rome for a year, O'Brien did leave after the middle of February, getting a boat from Naples. Magennis felt he needed a private doctor and was determined to go "and we are determined that we shall let him go." Magennis commented that Ronayne, E. Lynch and himself all gave up on O'Brien.<sup>508</sup> He felt O'Brien had taken O'Farrell's letter of January 27 as an invitation to go home. He could not see him as a success but "we leave him to you for you have the right of disposal."<sup>509</sup> O'Farrell would not send the man to St. Albert's for he felt he would turn the students there against Rome.<sup>510</sup> So, he was dispensed that June from his vows.<sup>511</sup>

---

<sup>507</sup> O'Farrell to O'Brien, Bronx, Jan 27, 1926, ANYP.

<sup>508</sup> Same to same, Rome, Feb 19, 1926 ANYP.

<sup>509</sup> Same to same, Rome, Mar 3, 1926, ANYP; Debiti delle varie Provincie (1925 – 8) AO, II Rome (S. Alb.) 5 (5).

<sup>510</sup> O'Farrell to Magennis, Bronx, Mar 4, 1926, ANYP.II

<sup>511</sup> Debiti delle Provincie (1920-42) II, AO, II Roma (S. Alb) 5 (3).

## CHAPTER X

### The Early Demise of O'Farrell

Gerard O'Farrell thought aloud in a letter to Elias Magennis. He had Finbar Coleman, John Galvin and Brocard Whalen ready for ordination. Bishop Dunn said he would do it but since the three candidates had not yet made solemn vows, they had no titulus, the title indicative of jurisdiction under which a person is advanced to orders. In the case of a diocesan priest, his titulus is the diocese in which he will serve. In the case of a religious order like the Carmelites, the titulus is solemn vows and the final profession could not take place until at least three years after the profession of first vows. It came to a choice in asking permissions. O'Farrell preferred getting them ordained on the basis of completed studies rather than have a privilege of early ordination for the commissariate.<sup>512</sup>

O'Farrell expected and hoped Brocard Whalen, studying theology with the Chicago Carmelites, would be ordained in spring, 1925. Leo Walter, in charge of the students, drew to his attention the fact that Cardinal Mundelein was going to ordain in March but was requiring an exam for anyone expecting orders. Whalen, he said, did well in the house exams at Christmas but could not remember scripture texts or quotes from authorities. Walter thought he was going well considering his age and the adaptation he had to make -he had been a Christian Brother for some twenty years. . He suggested he be ordained in June in New York. Meanwhile, he could be coached if he had to take an exam before diocesan officials. The basic problem was he had no solemn vows and thus no titulus. Walter had tried the Congregation for Religious twice but was denied permission for promotion to orders. So Whalen would have to be adopted by a bishop for the period before his solemn vows.<sup>513</sup>

In response, O'Farrell said he had sent Whalen to Chicago because he thought the friendliness of Mundelein would mean temporary adoption. There was no hope in New York as Hayes told O'Farrell he would not do a temporary adoption without permission from the Congregation for Religious. So, he said, there would be no June ordination and he told Walter to keep Whalen in school as, in any case, he would have to know enough moral to be recommended for faculties.<sup>514</sup>

---

<sup>512</sup> O'Farrell to Magennis, Bronx, Feb 11, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>513</sup> Walter to O'Farrell, Chicago, Feb 23, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>514</sup> O'Farrell to Walter, Bronx, Feb 25, 1925, ANYP.

O'Farrell did agree to send Whalen on for tonsure and minor orders. Walter was coaching him on the exam required for these and felt he would get by. Walter offered O'Farrell the advice that Coleman and Galvin should have a bishop adopt them temporarily. This is what Rome had told the Chicago Carmelites to do and they had done it.<sup>515</sup>

March 2, 1925, Gerard O'Farrell wrote Charles Ronayne in Rome about the three men ready for orders but unable to be advanced because they lack a titulus. Brocard Whalen was fifty-one years old at the time he made his first vows in 1924 and there was a concern to ordain him before he became much older. The other two students were still in the novitiate but were due for profession in August, 1925. John Galvin and Finbar Coleman had completed all the theological studies necessary for ordination; Galvin at St. John's College, Waterford, Ireland and Coleman at New York's Dunwoodie.

O'Farrell felt that if Whalen followed the ordinary theology course, he would be ordained at his demise. Cardinal Hayes was willing to be the titulus for all three until they could make solemn vows but insisted the necessary Roman permissions be provided by the Carmelites. O'Farrell asked Ronayne to obtain these.<sup>516</sup>

Magennis' advice on the ordinations was for O'Farrell to send him the names, ages and the place where they studied but omitting the length of time and adding Hayes would do the needful "as to the adoption, etc." He also wanted O'Farrell to add something to the effect that when ordained, these priests would say Mass in Carmelite churches thus freeing other priests to assist the faithful in works of mercy and to do missionary work.<sup>517</sup>

Ronayne had cabled Whalen to send an account of his studies but received nothing. Shortly after, Magennis told O'Farrell that he had not sent him the material requested about the ordinandi.<sup>518</sup>

Whalen sent O'Farrell a list of studies he had completed. Leo Walter sent him to the examining board in Chicago and they felt he would not pass. This combined with a look at his studies made O'Farrell not too anxious to push him on. Walter described Whalen's problem as being the inability to remember texts from scripture and the Fathers. He did understand the objections but would not merit a probatus (passing). Because Walter told him no superior there could

---

<sup>515</sup> Walter to O'Farrell, Chicago, Feb 28, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>516</sup> O'Farrell to Ronayne, Bronx, Mar 2, 1925; Minutes, Consultors Meeting, Nov 27, 1924, ANYP.

<sup>517</sup> Magennis to O'Farrell, Rome, Mar 9, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>518</sup> Ronayne to O'Farrell, Rome, Mar 28, 1925, ANYP.

recommend him for faculties, O'Farrell decided to leave him study moral and dogma and see what developed.<sup>519</sup>

O'Farrell sent Magennis the necessary material for the ordinations<sup>520</sup> but when Magennis received it and brought it over to the Vatican, he discovered that the secretary he had been dealing with at the congregation had suddenly died. Things did not look good at that point for the ordinations.<sup>521</sup>

Ronayne was able to get a document from the Congregation for Religious. It was not exactly what was wanted but Magennis thought it sufficient and said it was all the Carmelites would get as Ronayne was disturbed that he was not re-elected assistant general and was not willing to go to the congregation again.<sup>522</sup> When O'Farrell sent Leo Walter a check to cover the expenses and tuition of Whalen, Walter wrote him this was not expected. When they had accepted Whalen for theological studies, there was no thought of remuneration. He also mentioned that Whalen was worried he had not heard from Ronayne.<sup>523</sup> Before O'Farrell could have received this news from Magennis, he was writing Ronayne to say that he had been promised a letter from Bishop O'Brien of Petersborough, Canada, temporarily adopting the students. This had not come and O'Farrell was disturbed.<sup>524</sup>

Coleman did not make his profession and left the Carmelites before the end of the novitiate. So now Galvin and Whalen remained. Magennis felt the document Ronayne had received from the Congregation was sufficient for the ordinations and advised O'Farrell to seek a bishop. If one turned him down, then ask another.<sup>525</sup> He saw no reason why Whalen could not be ordained in Chicago with the Ronayne document.

O'Farrell did request Bishop Dunn, New York, to ordain John Galvin. He told Dunn that did not have solemn vows but had obtained a titulus in Rome. Since this was the first ordination of the commissariate, O'Farrell said he was open for advice.<sup>526</sup> Hayes gave his permission and Dunn

---

<sup>519</sup> Magennis to O'Farrell, Rome, Apr 1, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>520</sup> O'Farrell to Magennis, Bronx, Apr 14, 1925, ANYP. This contained same to same, Bronx, Apr 15, 1925.

<sup>521</sup> Magennis to O'Farrell, Rome, May 1, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>522</sup> Same to same, Rome, Dec 18, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>523</sup> Walter to O'Farrell, Chicago, June 8, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>524</sup> O'Farrell to Ronayne, Bronx, Dec 26, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>525</sup> Magennis to O'Farrell, Rome, Feb 4, 1926, ANYP.

<sup>526</sup> O'Farrell to Magennis, Bronx, Feb 18, 1926; O'Farrell to Dunn, Bronx, Feb 19, 1926, ANYP.

told O'Farrell to have Galvin make an eight day retreat. Dunn would then confer tonsure and with a day intervening, the minor orders. The major orders he would give on successive Sundays and would do it at his own parish or Saint Simon's. He wanted to do this for O'Farrell in return for all the things he had done for so many.<sup>527</sup> They agreed on St. Simon Stock and Dunn told O'Farrell to submit the necessary papers to the chancery.<sup>528</sup> The date set was Palm Sunday, March 28. Bishop O'Brien sent his dismissorials and Gerhard, Coffey and Varglien examined Galvin for more than a half hour on De Eucharistia, De Sacrificio Missae and De Ordine. The mark they gave was probatus.<sup>529</sup> And so the first ordination for the commissariate took place with but one hitch. Gerard O'Farrell was ill with flu. Bishop Dunn told him not to worry as he would be up and about in a few days.<sup>530</sup>

Since Bishop O'Brien's adoption worked, O'Farrell told Lawrence Diether to send Whalen on to ordination with his own students.<sup>531</sup> Whalen was delighted with the news.<sup>532</sup> O'Brien sent on the dismissorials. O'Farrell sent him money and all became ready.<sup>533</sup> The date of the ordination was May 28. With Galvin and Whalen now ordained, O'Farrell moved to set up a "makeshift of a fourth year." This was to prepare the men for their faculties exams.<sup>534</sup>

A Carmelite from one of the Spanish provinces, on his way home from Venezuela, had shown up in New York. He was received hospitably by the Commissariate but then acted in such a manner that his presence was intolerable and O'Farrell sent him back to his province. He cabled all of this to Magennis in Rome but sent the cable poorly addressed and it came only by accident into Magennis' hands. When Magennis replied to O'Farrell, the cable was returned to him with the notation, "The place no longer exists." Magennis was furious with this case of compounded error. He told O'Farrell very plainly he did not know how to send a cable.

Magennis inquired about what the Spaniard had done to prompt his expulsion. The fact that Magennis was involved in the removal of a provincial for sending an "impertinent" telegram to

---

<sup>527</sup> Dunn to O'Farrell, New York, Feb 25, 1926, ANYP.

<sup>528</sup> Same to same, New York, Mar 3, 1926, ANYP.

<sup>529</sup> O'Brien to O'Farrell, Peterborough, Mar 5, 1926, ANYP.

<sup>530</sup> Gerhard to O'Farrell, Middletown, Mar 25, 1926, ANYP.

<sup>531</sup> Dunn to O'Farrell, New York, Mar 28, 1926, ANYP.

<sup>532</sup> O'Farrell to Magennis, Bronx, Mar 4, 1926, ANYP.

<sup>533</sup> Diether to O'Farrell, Chicago, May 5, 1926; Whalen to O'Farrell, Chicago, May 19, 1926, ANYP.

<sup>534</sup> O'Farrell to Magennis, Bronx, May 27, 1926, ANYP.

the curia did nothing to make this case less serious. If the rest of the curia had seen O'Farrell's telegram, he felt his hand in this removal would have been weakened. He did, however, recover his composure enough to ask O'Farrell if he had received his appointment as commissary general.<sup>535</sup>

By January 11, 1925, the Spaniard had married and was thus expelled from the order. Magennis thanked O'Farrell for being kind to the man on his way through New York.<sup>536</sup> What prompted O'Farrell to expell the man was fear of a suit for abandonment by the legal wife. To return him cost only \$160 and turning him out might have prompted him to talk and be subject to the legal action pending.<sup>537</sup>

Gerard O'Farrell had to make a report on the chaplain service in Bellevue and later went to the chancery office on February 28, 1925 to explain some statements in his report. He considered it a clear and moderate exposition of the facts, remarking that nothing really remained to be added to the statements of Dionysius Flanagan, the 28th Street pastor. A Volunteer Chaplain Service had begun to work in the hospital and O'Farrell interviewed each of the hospital Carmelites who were there when this additional service began under Monsignor Brady.

O'Farrell said the fathers attended all emergency, operative and request calls. He admitted a small percentage of the patients not falling into these categories were not visited by the four chaplains. He thought the volunteer chaplains could cover these except their methods gave no small amount of displeasure to the staff, especially the nurses. He cited operating as a separate unit and repeating work already done as bringing the end of nurse cooperation. Fifty percent of them were not Catholic. The volunteer chaplains heard confessions and made up lists which the nurses tore up on almost every occasion. The volunteers came to work in the afternoon whereas the hospital rule was that the priests' visit be finished before noon. The volunteers multiplied work by hearing confessions one day and leaving communion lists for the Carmelites for the next day. The Carmelites did not cooperate because they were accustomed to administer both sacraments at the same time.

O'Farrell acknowledged the need for wider services but felt these should be under the chaplains as part of existing services. He suggested the post, Head of Volunteers, be created and an understanding be worked out with Dionysius Flanagan.

The pressing need in the hospital was for assistance in operative and emergency cases. Then with some irony, O'Farrell suggested that perhaps the volunteers could take over the entire

---

<sup>535</sup> Magennis to O'Farrell, Rome, Dec 14, 1924; same to same, Rome, Mar 9, 1925.

<sup>536</sup> Magennis to O'Farrell, Jan 11, [1925], ANYP.

<sup>537</sup> O'Farrell to Magennis, Bronx, Feb 11, 1925, ANYP.

hospital for one or two weeks each month or they could cover the emergency work from 10:30 A.M. to 7:00 P.M. for those weeks. O'Farrell brought out the strain of the work and stated his intention to follow the wishes of the Cardinal and his staff.<sup>538</sup>

Besides running the business of the commissariate, Gerard O'Farrell had to grant scapular faculties, answer questions about Carmelite matters and assign his men to preach missions and novenas. One such novena was arranged by a pastor who sought a rapid reply to his request because he was going "Southland" for the colder months.<sup>539</sup>

O'Farrell seems to have been glad to promote the good of others. He readily signed petitions for canonization of Frederic Ozanam and for the institution of the feast of Christ the King.<sup>540</sup>

When he was convoking the general chapter of 1925, Elias Magennis asked for support for Collegio San Alberto. For past assistance, he gave the "highest honor" to the Irish-American Commissary and its holy founder, Denis O'Connor. He said O'Connor was praised by all at the time of his demise and proposed him and his care for youth as a model for the professors at San Alberto. One aim for the chapter was to discuss closing small houses that lacked work and discipline.<sup>541</sup> Gerard O'Farrell requested prayers for the success of the chapter.<sup>542</sup>

Gerard O'Farrell attended the chapter that October as the representative of the commissariate and Francis Ronayne was there as assistant general though he was not returned to that position. Elias Varglien, later to work for many years at St. Simon Stock, was there as the vicar provincial of Pernambuco. Magennis was returned as general and Hilary Doswald was elected the assistant general for the English speaking provinces.<sup>543</sup>

Gerard O'Farrell was careful in the formality of convoking the required annual meeting of the commissariate.<sup>544</sup> He tried to secure good relations with the administration of the New York archdiocese. O'Farrell alerted Magennis in Rome to a trip of Bishop Dunn and Dunn reported back to O'Farrell that he had been well cared for. Magennis had had a dinner in his honor at

---

<sup>538</sup> Remarks on Report Re Bellevue Hospital Chaplain Service, Mar 25, 1925, O'Farrell, CG, Am Sti Eliae, BTMNY.

<sup>539</sup> Gillon to O'Farrell, Glens Falls, Mar 3, 1925; Dolan to O'Connor, Batavia, Jan 16, 1925; O'Farrell to Dolan, Bronx, Jan 21, 1925; Dolan to O'Farrell, Batavia, Jan 22, 1925; O'Farrell Scapular Faculties File, all in ANYP.

<sup>540</sup> McNichols to O'Farrell, Duluth, May 1, 1925; O'Farrell to [?], Bronx, n.d.; ANYP.

<sup>541</sup> Convocation of General Chapter, Easter, 1925, CG, General, 2.

<sup>542</sup> O'Farrell to Vella, Bronx, May 13, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>543</sup> Acta Capituli Generalis, 1925 (Rome, 1925); Analecta Ordinis Carmelitarum IV(1923-6) 547.

<sup>544</sup> O'Farrell to Priors, Bronx, June 15, 1925, ANYP.



which every Irishman in Rome was present. He called it his most pleasurable two hours in Rome. Dunn told O'Farrell that the very good work he was doing in New York would preclude his being called to Rome to assume a higher post but if this did occur, then he would be very happy with the house and equipment of the Carmelites.<sup>545</sup> Perhaps Dunn felt incompetence was a requirement for being called to Rome.

Francis Ronayne was in New York at the time of the 1925 Irish Chapter and received word of Colfer's election without comment. His visits to Chicago and Niagara Falls he put to the weekends as he was seeing a doctor during the week. He did plan on doing the profession of six and the reception of eight as novices in Middletown and described how O'Farrell was out on the road seeking vocations. Jeremiah O'Mahoney, a collector of vocations for the Carmelites, had a few that year. He told Magennis that Christopher Slattery was very ill and reported his last letter had shaken people up a bit.<sup>546</sup>

Monsignor Carroll wrote O'Farrell from the chancery that a patient named Charles Eisner at the Middletown State Hospital claimed he had not had the opportunity to go to confession for a period of three years. Bishop Dunn, the vicar general, wanted to know if it was possible to arrange for regular visits to the hospital and make someone responsible for such cases as Eisner.<sup>547</sup>

O'Farrell shot back a quick reply that the incident was not true. Priests had approached Eisner about confession and he stated he wanted to save it for a future occasion. O'Farrell told Carroll not to be disturbed about this since Eisner and his brother - whom O'Farrell presumed to be the letter writer - were both "mentally abnormal." He told him, too, that the wish of the vicar general had been fulfilled and each ward would be visited each week by the pastor of Our Lady of Mt. Carmel.<sup>548</sup> Carroll accepted the explanation of O'Farrell and assured him Dunn would be happy to know the case was not as represented to him.<sup>549</sup>

The day after Christmas, 1925, O'Farrell was able to write Magennis that Elias Varglien from Malta and Felix Doohan from Ireland had both arrived. O'Farrell made Varglien novice master while McGouran was in Ireland visiting his mother. He thought that if he caught on, as he seemed to be doing, then he would leave him in the post and seek another position for

---

<sup>545</sup> Dunn to O'Farrell, New York, July 14, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>546</sup> Ronayne to [Magennis], New York, July 31, 1925, CG, Am Sti Eliae (1922-38). Cf. Magennis to Franco, Dublin, [1925], CG, General 2.

<sup>547</sup> Carroll to O'Farrell, New York, Dec 11, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>548</sup> O'Farrell to Carroll, Bronx, Dec 15, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>549</sup> Carroll to O'Farrell, New York, Dec 19, 1925, ANYP.

McGouran. He had placed Doohan in 29th Street and this, he commented, gave Dionysius Flanagan the most men he had ever had. Cuevas, the Spanish Carmelite, wanted to go home but O'Farrell would not let him leave until January and threatened him with constitutional punishments if he left before then.

The Carmelite Sisters in Florence had asked O'Farrell about some vestments they had given to a New York antique dealer on commission to raise needed funds for their convent. O'Farrell had found the dealer and obtained the vestments for 100,000 lire, most of which the dealer was to forward on to the sisters. O'Farrell was proud his rescue efforts kept the vestments in the order. In gratitude, the sisters placed the name of the New York Carmelites in the memorial book of the monastery so they would be remembered forever by the sisters. A reliquary, probably of St. Mary Magdalen de Pazzi, was also promised the fathers.<sup>550</sup>

Benziger Brothers, the New York liturgical publishers, had asked for permission to translate the new office of the Little Flower. O'Farrell thought either Charles Ronayne or Brocard Taylor should translate and publish it. The Carmelites then would sell the work to people like Benziger on a commission basis. He felt there were too many people making money off the saint and that the Carmelites should not be a party to this unless they were getting the share they were entitled to.

Concerning commissariate business, O'Farrell sent \$2,500 for the students' expenses and \$500 for the college and promised to pay for the St. Elias altar in the new chapel. In news, he reported the Middletown church had been used that Christmas after Bishop Dunn had blessed and laid the cornerstone the Sunday before. The fathers had moved into the St. Simon Stock rectory and the school would be ready in February.<sup>551</sup>

Writing to Ronayne at Christmas, Gerard O'Farrell expressed thanks to him personally for sending Varglien and Doohan. They had come to the United States through Canada. He enclosed money for their fare. He told Ronayne all of the buildings were finished. He did accent St. Simon Stock and stated he wanted to make a big deal of the school's dedication in April or May as it would be the last of its kind for a while.

O'Farrell mentioned he had seen Hilary Doswald, the recently elected assistant general. He reported the fathers of the American province were annoyed at his election. One man in Englewood gave O'Farrell the impression something had been put over on them. O'Farrell

---

<sup>550</sup> Sr. M. Maddalena del Verbo Incarnato to O'Farrell, Firenze, Mar 25, 1926; same to same, Mar 31, 1926, ANYP.

<sup>551</sup> O'Farrell to Magennis, Bronx, Dec 26, 1925, ANYP.

judged them very provincial and not appreciative of all the Irish province had been doing for Rome over the years.<sup>552</sup>

The Carmelite Sisters in Florence, at the convent of Mary Magdalen di Pazzi, were looking for funds. They appealed to Magennis in Rome explaining they were from the better families of the city but could not obtain funds because of their cloistered life. Ignored, they said, by ecclesiastic authorities, they might have to sell their monastery as its location in the middle of the city made it a valuable piece of property. Magennis sent this letter to O'Farrell, with a form letter of his own asking for help.<sup>553</sup>

O'Farrell assured him of his generous support.<sup>554</sup> Magennis was very grateful for the gift<sup>555</sup> but O'Farrell worried if it was enough.<sup>556</sup>

Magennis was glad that Varglien was doing well. He cited him as a definite asset but cautioned he would take a few cracks at Doohan and the Irish. Magennis classed Doohan as belonging to the old school but the new men in Ireland were a credit. He suggested, to O'Farrell he keep Doohan occupied.

Confusing the Office of St. Therese with the Little Office of Our Lady, Magennis mentioned Taylor had translated the latter and that he had 4000 copies of it in Rome. He would gladly make Benziger his agents for these.

Writing again shortly afterwards, Magennis thanked O'Farrell for money expressing his apologies that he had to ask the commissariate when it was just beginning but, as he wrote, where else could he go.

Magennis mentioned he was to preach at the dedication of a church in Chicago and would be traveling in the company of Bishop Raiti. Magennis did not want to go but would have to because of the bishop. He asked O'Farrell to book them both from Cherbourg with Maher a New York travel agent.<sup>557</sup>

---

<sup>552</sup> O'Farrell to Ronayne, Bronx, Dec 26, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>553</sup> Magennis to O'Farrell, Rome, n.d.; Maria Maddalena del Verbo Incarnate, Firenze, n.d., ANYP.

<sup>554</sup> O'Farrell to Magennis, Bronx, Feb 11, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>555</sup> Magennis to O'Farrell, Rome, Apr 1, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>556</sup> O'Farrell to Magennis, Bronx, Apr 14, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>557</sup> Magennis to O'Farrell, Rome, Feb 8, 1926, ANYP.

O'Farrell feared there was a minor misunderstanding on the part of Magennis concerning a check he had sent. He made it clear to him it was not all a donation but most of it was for students' expenses. He also corrected him about the office matter and said he would propose to Benziger they be his agents for the Little Office of Our Lady in the United States.

Cuevas wanted to remain a few years and learn English. Doohan was working in 28th Street but was champing at the bit to return to Ireland at the expiration of his year's time. Varglien was to continue as novice master and McGouran was made sub-prior at St. Albert's. O'Farrell asked for a dispensation from age for Varglien to continue as novice master as he was but thirty-three.

O'Farrell said he had been giving missions and had given a retreat in the cathedral at Syracuse. This he saw as a beginning in that diocese. Bishop Gallagher of Detroit had promised O'Connor a place there and repeated the offer in the summer of 1925. With a foundation in another diocese, O'Farrell felt the commissariate could become a province. With Cuevas remaining and John Maher to be ordained in 1926, O'Farrell thought Maher's fourth year could be done in the United States and he would then have two men for Detroit.

Marymount had been giving only \$1,000 for the services of three priests. So O'Farrell went to Mothers Butler and Gerard and asked for a \$1,000 increase and for 50% of the retreat business there. He told Magennis he had gotten both adding they had boasted they conducted business as business and without sentiment. So, O'Farrell said, that's the way he acted.

O'Farrell mentioned he visited the houses once a week and that a visitation by him would be only to fulfill the law. So he suggested Magennis come and do visitation, staying in a good room at St. Simon Stock. He intended this to be a vacation, showing his concern for Magennis and his welfare. Vocations looked good as there were ten novices, six postulants and four professed.<sup>558</sup>

O'Farrell received from Magennis the bad news that John Maher would not be coming back to the United States for his fourth year of theology. Magennis' reason was there was another American who had done first class work and was remaining. So he could not make an exception for Maher. All of the commissariate's boys were doing well but Rome was rather tough since Ronayne had tried to establish some standards. Magennis seems to be patting O'Farrell on the back as compensation for not having Maher.

Magennis confessed that he did not remember giving O'Farrell any assurances about Detroit. He did remember Bishop Mahoney in Sioux Falls had offered the Carmelites a college. He stated the plan was to send four men for a start and though the bishop wanted the place as his seminary college, Magennis felt he would not mind if some of the students joined the Carmelites. He also

---

<sup>558</sup> O'Farrell to Magennis, Bronx, Feb 18, 1926, ANYP.

felt the Carmelite students who could not do well in the east would be able to go there. The plant in Sioux Falls was finished and cost \$1,000,000.

Magennis was also concerned about the number of students coming to Rome that fall. He urged O'Farrell to get many students feeling ten should be ordained for the commissariate each year. His comment was, "That is the only way to increase properly."

Magennis told O'Farrell he would not have been so bold with the Marymount sisters if he had known how little good service they had been given in the past.<sup>559</sup> But he did not object to the Carmelites receiving the extra \$1,000.

Continuing their correspondence, O'Farrell told Magennis he had booked Bishop Raiti on a ship from Cherbourg that O'Farrell's friend was the chief engineer on. This fellow would look after the bishop. Apparently Magennis had changed his mind about coming to the United States as O'Farrell expressed the hope he would be coming that summer.

O'Farrell was able to give a final report on the Florentine vestments telling Magennis they had cost \$4,017 but was happy because their purchase insured the continued prayers of the sisters for the Carmelites. Concerning other business matters, he told the general he had opened talks with Kenedy and Sons about a Third Order book and had ordered 200 copies of Magennis' book on Elias. He would order more when these were gone.

A cemetery in Middletown was being planned, he told Magennis, and he would have liked to move Denis O'Connor from Calvary to the new place when Magennis was in the United States.<sup>560</sup>

At the end of March, 1926, Magennis wrote O'Farrell that Stephen Piskurich, then a student in Rome, was ill. He commented the novitiate in the commissariate was good judging from Carmel Lynn, Duffy and Holland. Holland was inclined to go into theology because of his poor health and Magennis was agreeable for he felt Holland would never be a professor and the ordinary amount of knowledge would be sufficient for his ministry.

Bishop Haiti's itinerary had come but there was no more about whether or not Magennis would accompany him.

Getting to personnel, Magennis spoke of Maher as having the potential to be a good priest but needed a strong hand for a few years. He also told O'Farrell that Brother Carmelo, a lay brother at Whitefriars Street, Dublin, was not wanted by the Irish and seemed to hint O'Farrell could have him. His problem in Dublin seemed to have stemmed from the fact, in Magennis' opinion,

---

<sup>559</sup> Magennis to O'Farrell, Rome, Mar 3, 1926, ANYP.

<sup>560</sup> O'Farrell to Magennis, Bronx, Mar 4, 1926, ANYP.

that he was accustomed to putting out the poorer vestments for Mass and had to be told by one of the fathers to change them. This Magennis saw as a sign the Irish got money too easily and should be better at spending on their students.<sup>561</sup>

O'Farrell had asked Lawrence Diether for a man to give the annual retreat for the commissariate. Diether assured him he would have a man, thanked him for sending on jubilee congratulations and promised to visit him when he was in the east during the next week. There must have been something going on about Ronayne as Diether commented on his sailing for Europe the following week. "Do you envy him? The Fathers here have not done him bodily harm for his defection."<sup>562</sup> Perhaps a visit of Ronayne to Chicago had not gone too well or this could be a reference to the election of Doswald as assistant general.

Diether told O'Farrell the general had asked him to send \$500 for Bishop Raiti's trip. He was to send it to O'Farrell and wanted to know when to do it. He also told O'Farrell he had many rooms for the June celebration, referring to the one Raiti was going to attend.<sup>563</sup>

When O'Farrell became sick late in the spring of 1926, Diether wrote him a note of sympathy and expressed his regret his illness would keep him from coming to Chicago for the May festivity and also that Bishop Raiti was not coming.<sup>564</sup>

An Italian priest from Sicily, Giuseppe Crespino by name, had been forced to assume some family debts. Lacking funds, he wanted to come to the United States and approached Magennis in Rome who thought the priest might be some help at St. Albert's in return for his room and board. On the weekends he could assist at a local parish to gather funds needed to pay off the debts. Crespino drew up a petition stating all of this and addressed it to Monsignor Vincenzo Arcese calling him the Bishop of St. Joseph's, Sullivan County, N.Y. Magennis thought Arcese would help.<sup>565</sup> Crespino asked permission from Arcese to come.<sup>566</sup> Perhaps Arcese was used as a clearing house for Italian priests desirous of coming to the United States as their immigration was a problem. O'Farrell was unable to do anything for Crespino. Hayes would not, as a policy, grant faculties to any Italian extern. At the time he had made this rule, O'Farrell had a priest named D'Amico. He had been working in the diocese twenty-three years and was living with

---

<sup>561</sup> Magennis to O'Farrell, Rome, Mar 30, 1926, ANYP.

<sup>562</sup> Diether to O'Farrell, Chicago, Jan 13, 1926, ANYP.

<sup>563</sup> Same to same, Chicago, Mar 12, 1926, ANYP.

<sup>564</sup> Same to Same, Chicago, May 5, 1926, ANYP.

<sup>565</sup> Magennis to O'Farrell, Rome, Feb 19, 1926, ANYP.

<sup>566</sup> Crespino to Arcese, Rome, Feb, 1926, ANYP. Seemingly, it was enclosed in the above.

O'Farrell. An exception was made for him but O'Farrell was told that none could remain except members of an order. He admitted he could use Crespino at St. Albert's but it was lonely and this had caused trouble with Cuevas who was all right once removed from there. O'Farrell thought the same would be true of Crespino. He suggested getting in touch with Diether in Chicago as Mundelein was more favorable towards Italians.<sup>567</sup>

Alexander Augustine Morrissey was a student at San Alberto in first theology in 1926 when he was sent back to New York for smoking. Magennis' logic was that he would not allow smoking because it interfered with discipline. Morrissey said he could not cease so he had to leave. Magennis expressed his difficulty thus: should a man so addicted go on? If the Carmelites had no other place to send him, what would he do, leave? He told how he had tried to strengthen Morrissey by pointing out to him many a working man gave up smoking for Lent and that the men in jail - probably thinking of his own and dear Irish heroes -had to do without it.

The actual impetus of the Morrissey incident was that an Italian had been caught smoking and quoted Morrissey to the effect an American or Irishman could do what he liked at San Alberto but no one else could. In his frustration, the Italian spilled the beans.<sup>568</sup>

Writing to O'Farrell two weeks later, Magennis re-hashed the whole matter and made the point the Italian threw a challenge at him. Morrissey told of how he had smoked in the novitiate and had been told he could do the same in Rome provided he did it privately.<sup>569</sup> O'Farrell did not know- what to do with Morrissey once he had arrived home. Since he returned during the year, he lost a whole year's work. O'Farrell wrote John Cogan and asked if he could stay at either Terenure or Ardavan and go to Milltown Park for theology. He promised Morrissey would conform to the regime in either place.<sup>570</sup> No response is extant and Morrissey was dispensed from his vows in November, 1926.<sup>571</sup>

The commissary authorized O'Farrell to borrow \$15,000 from the Union Trust Company in March, 1926.<sup>572</sup> This was probably for the building program at St. Albert's. An examination of the accounts of the Irish-American Commissariate for the period of Gerard O'Farrell's tenure as commissary general shows the houses regularly contributed to what was called the "Commissary

---

<sup>567</sup> O'Farrell to Magennis, Bronx, Mar 4, 1926, ANYP.

<sup>568</sup> Magennis to O'Farrell, Rome, Mar 13, 1926, ANYP.

<sup>569</sup> Same to same, Rome, Mar 30, 1926, ANYP.

<sup>570</sup> O'Farrell to Golfer, Bronx, May 7, 1926, ANYP.

<sup>571</sup> Il Debiti della Provincie, 1920-4J2, p 11, AO, Il Roma (S.Alb.) 5(3).

<sup>572</sup> Resolution, Mar 24, 1926, ANYP.

Fund" and money was occasionally sent to Ireland in the form of donations, for example, to Terenure College. \$1,000 was sent most months to St. Albert's and the only other frequent expenses are the funds expended for the higher education of the students in Rome or Chicago.<sup>573</sup>

Richard Colfer, the Irish provincial, took along his predecessor, John Cogan, on his official visitation to Faversham and Sittingbourne, England. Cogan saw his companion as a "child" and calculated he was living in a dream world. "I never in my wildest or dreamiest moments believed he could be so incapable," was his summary of his successor's talents.<sup>574</sup>

Gerard O'Farrell had received faculties in the archdiocese of Dublin January 16, 1915 and in July of the following year received a celebret from the same source.<sup>575</sup> He must have liked the United States for he took the first step towards citizenship.<sup>576</sup> He was a well-liked and well-thought of man when he was pastor at St. Simon Stock and while he resided there as the commissary general. He dressed well, was known in the area especially at Fordham where he frequently visited and was acquainted with the Jesuits there. Robert Gannon, then a teacher at the college, was a special friend.<sup>577</sup> In the Spring of 1926, O'Farrell was not well. His condition was diagnosed as a kidney ailment and an operation was seen as necessary. Towards the end of that April, O'Farrell went off to Atlantic City after he had a procedure to alleviate his condition. Louis Gerhard was left in charge and it was he who arranged an operation with O'Farrell's surgeon, Doctor Keyes. The date set by O'Farrell was any day after May 31. He could not go before that date as he had some important business to attend to. This was the dedication of St. Simon Stock school and priory to which O'Farrell subordinated his own health. Either June 1 or 8 were dates given and he was to be in the hospital the day before. A visit to Keyes' office was to be made the week before the date chosen for the operation.<sup>578</sup>

Writing to Colfer in Ireland early in May, O'Farrell admitted he had been ill. He sent £ 150 for the services of Doohan and told Colfer he wanted to send three of his novices to the National University after their profession. The cost of this he left up to Colfer and promised not to quibble about the amount as the commissary was only too willing to help out the Irish province. He suggested a figure of \$250 per student. Offering his sympathy on the death of Kindelan

---

<sup>573</sup> Journal, Irish-American Commissariate, 1924-42, ANYP.

<sup>574</sup> Cogan to Magennis, Dublin, /1926/, CG, General! 2. Colfer to Magennis, Dublin, May 7, 1926, CG Hib(1922-38) is Colfer's version of this trip.

<sup>575</sup> O'Farrell File, ANYP

<sup>576</sup> Declaration of Intention, Jan 23, 1926, ANYP.

<sup>577</sup> Gerhard to Keyes, Bronx, Apr 27, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>578</sup> Keyes to Gerhard, New York, Apr 27, 1925, ANYP?.



pneumonia, he said all were well-save Simon Farrington who had bronchial pneumonia.<sup>579</sup> Not even a word of his own illness which was serious.

Just a week or two before he entered the hospital for his operation, Gerard O'Farrell wrote his last letter to his friend and superior, Elias Magennis. He cautioned the general not to be alarmed by reports of his health. The doctors had thought both of his kidneys were immobilized by stones but discovered one was functioning. They wanted to operate and O'Farrell sought and obtained a month's grace so he could prepare for the dedication of the Bronx school and priory by Cardinal Hayes. He told Magennis his two sisters had died recently in Dublin leaving his mother alone. The Carmelites in Ireland had been great in these circumstances doing what they could for his mother. He said, "Never before in the twenty odd years of my Carmelite life have I realized so clearly the great blessing it is to be a member of a Religious Order and to have real brothers around you when they are most needed." He planned to go to Dublin after the operation, sell his mother's house and bring her to live in the Bronx with one of the many families who had offered this accommodation.

Getting down to business, he told Magennis Brooklyn was settled on as the new diocese the commissary was to enter. There was a great probability they would be able to do this because of Monsignor Patrick Cherry, then pastor of St. Mary's in Long Island City.

John Maher was going to remain in Rome for his fourth year after he had a vacation in Ireland and visited relatives there. O'Farrell cautioned he was not to be running around the country while there and was to return to vacation with the other students in the villa. He sent the \$1,000 promised for the altar of St. Elias and told Magennis he had trouble selling his book on that saint. He was writing Herder though because he understood they had the American license for the work. Hopefully, he thought, they could sell them.

O'Farrell again asked for a dispensation from age for Elias Varglien to be novice master.

He acknowledged that recent groups of professed were not too good because they were too old and set in their ways on entering the novitiate and thus not easily formed. The group of 1926 was about sixteen years old and thus more pliable. He wanted to open the philosophy department at St. Albert's that year and was sending Gabriel Callahan to Rome for first philosophy and Simon Vital for third theology. Speaking of Rome, he asked that the letters of students be more carefully supervised. They were repeating conversations they had had with Ronayne and Lynch about superiors in the commissariate. O'Farrell said he was trying to instill in the students respect for all Carmelites and this was undermined when they arrived in Rome. It began though through student letters before they ever got to Rome.

---

<sup>579</sup> O'Farrell to Colfer, Bronx, NY, May 7, 1926, unidentified clippings, St Simon Stock Scrapbook, Consultors Minutes, June 1, 1926, all ANYP.

A serious problem he had was that the Carmelites in Englewood had flooded the New York area with Little Flower mailings and were advertising in New York's Catholic News. He did not intend this as a complaint but stated these practices insinuated the Englewood shrine to St. Therese was the only one in existence. So he wondered what do the New York people think about us and our shrine. He sent Magennis copies of the material he referred to and said he intended to talk to Diether about the matter but felt Diether had not acted honorably in the matter.

At that time he thought Bishop Raiti had cancelled his trip and asked why. Actually, the trip was delayed and Raiti came later on.<sup>580</sup>

A Tarrytown parishoner named Buckley wrote to O'Farrell asking he not go through with his planned transfer of Hugh Devlin from there. Buckley cited in favor of his protest that he had spoken to Magennis in Rome about the need of a man like Hugh in the parish. He took the occasion to express sympathy to O'Farrell on the occasion of his sisters' death.<sup>581</sup> O'Farrell, in replying a day or two before he entered the hospital, thanked Buckley for his sympathy and appreciated his interest in the parish and in a non-committal way promised to take the matter under consideration.<sup>582</sup>

When Elias Magennis was in the United States, he dedicated the shrine of the church's patron at St. Simon Stock. In the publicity appearing before the event, O'Farrell mentioned cures had taken place there through prayer and the use of the relic of St. Simon that was the center of the new shrine. In 1925, a parishoner, Thomas Dunphy, claimed to be cured of paralysis through a novena to St. Therese and after being touched by her relic. Other cures, not so outstanding, were also reported in the parish.<sup>583</sup>

In November, 1925, \$147,113 of the work on the school and auditorium had been completed and \$72,575 work on the priory was done.<sup>584</sup> Since the total \$242,003.50, it would seem the construction must have been fairly well completed by Christmas of 1925.<sup>585</sup> When the final certificate was presented for payment, Elias Vella, the pastor, wrote on the reverse, "Kindly send

---

<sup>580</sup> O'Farrell to Magennis, Bronx, May 27, 1926; unidentified clippings, St Simon Stock Scrapbook; Consultors Minutes, June 1, 1926, All ANYP.

<sup>581</sup> Buckley to O'Farrell, Tarrytown, June 3, 1926, ANYP

<sup>582</sup> O'Farrell to Buckley, Bronx, June 7, 1926. ANYP.

<sup>583</sup> Unidentified clippings, St. Simon Stock scrapbck, ANYP.

<sup>584</sup> T. Reilly and Son, Itemized Payment Requisition, Nov. 10, 1925, ANYP.

<sup>585</sup> Edward F. Fanning, Certificate no 354, ANYP

some painter to cover the plaster work."<sup>586</sup> Even then building required close inspection before acceptance.

On May 31, 1926, Patrick Hayes, a cardinal now for about one year, came for the dedication of the priory and school and what was called the "Community Center." The ceremony began with a parade followed by the raising of the flag over the new structure. Musical-selections, entertainment by a "symphony orchestra," speeches by political and ecclesiastical leaders proceeded the blessing of the buildings. Afterwards, there was an elaborate dinner.<sup>587</sup> The ceremony seems not to have received as much publicity as some of the events of lesser significance of that period in the parish.

Gerard O'Farrell entered St. Vincent's Hospital for his operation. This was followed by the complications that brought about his death. What actually occurred has been variously reported. Septicemia or blood poisoning is one version while failure of the operation to correct his kidney condition is another. In any event he died on June 15, 1926 after ruling the commissary for less than two years.<sup>588</sup>

The burial was at St. Simon Stock where throngs packed the church and many others stood outside. O'Farrell's friend, Bishop John Dunn offered the Mass while Dominic Hastings and Elias Vella were deacon and subdeacon. Dionysius Flanagan was the archpriest and Hugh Devlin, described as a lifelong friend of O'Farrell's and stationed at St. Simon's, delivered the eulogy. Prominent laymen served as pallbearers.<sup>589</sup>

Within a month, Francis Ronayne was in the United States and after he recovered from a stomach ailment, he was able to report back to Magennis in Rome on the condition of the commissary following the death of O'Farrell. He stated the cause of death as being septicemia and stated this indicated some carelessness. Upset by the death, the men in the Bronx were angered by Bishop Raiti being in Englewood and not coming over for either the wake or funeral. The failure of four from the American province to remain for the Mass after attending the office the night before further upset the men. This bad feeling Ronayne attributed to the Little Flower activities of Albert Dolan.

---

<sup>586</sup> Ibid.

<sup>587</sup> Unidentified clippings, St. Simon Stock scrapbook; Program Dedication of School and Community Center, St. Simon Stock, ANYP.

<sup>588</sup> The New York Times (June 15, 1926) 25; (June 17, 1926) 15.

<sup>589</sup> Ibid.

Ronayne was to conduct the election of O'Farrell's successor but felt this should be put off for another week. He repeated rumors concerning the post of novice master, the change of Vella from pastor of St. Simon's and opposition to the students going to the university in Ireland.

He told Magennis how he was present for Doctor Mannix' arrival in New York and his reception at City Hall. Dionysius Flanagan was having a luncheon at St. Simon's for Mannix and Ronayne expected a noteworthy group to attend.

While he was there in New York, Ronayne went off to see Patrick Cherry about a foundation in Brooklyn. He spent some time with the monsignor being regaled with stories of the Irish hierarchy and when he was able to get Cherry down to business, it seemed the whole idea of the Carmelites going to Brooklyn was something Cherry thought was a nice idea and nothing more than that. Ronayne pressed for a commitment but could get none. All he came away with was a promise Cherry would speak to Bishop Molloy when an opportunity arose. When Ronayne reported this to Dionysius Flanagan, he was upset that Cherry's talk had been big and effort nil. Ronayne was hoping to force Cherry to get him an interview with the bishop but this never came about and once again, Brooklyn was a dream.<sup>590</sup>

For some reason or other, the election of a new commissary general was put off until September 2 when it was held at St. Albert's, Middletown. This was a consultative vote and the franchise was given to those with solemn vows who had completed their ecclesiastical studies. Any member of the commissariate or of the Irish province who fulfilled the requirements could be voted for. Ronayne sent out a ballot by mail so that it could be returned in time for the September 2 meeting of the consultors where the votes would be opened and tallied.<sup>591</sup>

It is difficult to establish what took place. Records indicate that meetings took place on July 15 and then on July 16 at St. Simon Stock. At this first meeting it was suggested by Dionysius Flanagan that the choice of a commissary general be moved to the next meeting. When the next meeting was held the following day, he moved there be a wait of two weeks. After this, the next record we have is of a meeting on September 3 at Our Lady of Mount Carmel, Middletown. There is a tabulation in the report of that meeting. Presumably it is the results of the straw ballot sent out by Ronayne. Flanagan and Robert Power, then in Australia, each received six votes. Denis Devlin and Charles Ronayne received one each. Flanagan was the acting commissary general and despite the tie was appointed permanently to the post. The notice of appointment was read at the November 22 meeting of the consultors.<sup>592</sup> With this appointment of Dionysius Flanagan as commissary general, a new era in the history of the New York Carmelites begins.

---

<sup>590</sup> Ronayne to Magennis, New York, July 12, 1926, CG, Am Sti Eliae (1922-38).

<sup>591</sup> Notice, F. Ronayne [1926], ANYP.

<sup>592</sup> Consultors Minutes, Nov 22, 1926; Decree, E. Magennis, Rome, Sept 3, 1926, both in ANYP.

## FOOTNOTES

### Abbreviations used in footnotes

AIP - Archives, Irish Province, Carmelite Conference Center, Ballinteer, Dublin, Ireland.

ANYP - Archives, New York Province, Provincial House, Maspeth, N.Y.

AO - Archivum Generale, Collegio San Alberto, Roma, Italia.

CG - Archivum Generale, Curia Generalizia, Roma, Italia.

CONY - Chancery Office, Archdiocese of New York, New York, N.Y.,

DA - Archives, Archdiocese of New York, St. Joseph's Seminary, Dunwoodie, Yonkers, N.Y.